DEVELOPMENT OF MIMO DIVERSITY TECHNIQUE WITH DISCRETE WAVELET TRANSFORM FOR MILLIMETER WAVE COMMUNICATION SYSTEM

BY

NAGMA PARVEEN

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science (Computer and Information Engineering)

Kulliyyah of Engineering International Islamic University Malaysia

JANUARY 2020

ABSTRACT

Millimeter wave (mm wave) wireless communication systems are considered as the key feature technology for future next generation i.e. 5th generation (5G) as mm wave band has prospective to meet high data rate, mobility and less energy consumption. Spectral efficiency improvement is one of the primary requirements for future wireless communication networks. One of the major research problems is that the signal loss at the receiver because of channel propagation. The received signal becomes more sensitive when the system uses mm wave since its frequency is very high between 3 GHz to 300 GHz. To enhance the performance of wireless communication system, exploitation of Multiple Input and Multiple Output (MIMO) antenna diversity has become well known technology. Orthogonal frequency division Multiplexing (OFDM) systems are used to improve the spectral efficiency with the use of wavelet transforms. The Discrete Wavelet Transform (DWT) has superior properties compare to Fast Fourier Transform (FFT) as it eliminates the use of cyclic prefix which improves spectral efficiency. The wavelets transforms are also beneficial in many aspects such as channel modeling, data compression and interference mitigation. Hence, a MIMO antenna diversity technique is developed with wavelets transform to improve the performance and spectral efficiency of the system. The multiple antenna arrays such a Uniform Linear Array (ULA) with half-length spacing has been considered. The system is deployed at 60 GHz as it is unlicensed spectrum band and suitable for short distance propagation for both line of sight and multipath propagation channel. The QAM modulation and demodulation are performed at the transmitter and receiver. The data is converted into DWT coefficients by reshaping property. The wavelets are then constructed and reconstructed by perfect reconstruction property. Therefore, the inverse DWT at the transmitter and DWT at the receiver could improve the Bit Error Rate (BER) performance. The performance in terms of BER are carried out in MATLAB simulation software for all diversity scenarios Single Input and Single Output (SISO) DWT, Multiple Input and Single Output (MISO) DWT and MIMO DWT. Among all of them MIMO DWT is better. The performance of MIMO OFDM with different wavelets is also simulated and Haar wavelets transform performance is better when compared with another wavelet transform by 2 dB at 10⁻³. The MIMO DWT BER results shows better improvement when compared with the benchmarking by 2 dB at 10^{-3} . The analytical results when compared with simulation results are good in agreement with minimum discrepancy.

خلاصة البحث

تُعتبر أنظمة الاتصالات اللاسلكية ذات الموجات المليمترية (موجة mm تُعتبر أنظمة الاتصالات اللاسلكية ذات الموجات المليمترية (موجة mm) بمثابة تقنية الميزة الرئيسية للجيل القادم ، أي الجيل الخامس (G5) حيث أن نطاق الموجات المليمترية لديه القدرة على تلبية معدل البيانات العالى والتنقل واستهلاك أقل للطاقة. يعد تحسين الكفاءة الطيفية أحد المتطلبات الأساسية لشبكات الاتصالات اللاسلكية المستقبلية. واحدة من المشاكل البحثية الرئيسية هي أن فقدان إشارة عند المتلقى بسبب تأثير انتشار القناة. تصبح الإشارة المستقبلة أكثر حساسية عندما يستخدم النظام موجة mmلأن تردده مرتفع للغاية بين GHz 3 إلى GHz 300. لتعزيز أداء نظام الاتصالات اللاسلكية أصبح استغلال تنوع الهوائي متعدد المدخلات والمخرجات المتعددة (MIMO) تكنولوجيا معروفة. تُستخدم أنظمة مضاعفة تقسيم التردد المتعامد (OFDM) لتحسين الكفاءة الطيفية باستخدام تحويلات المويجات. يتميز تحويل المويجات المنفصل (DWT) بخصائص أكثر تفوقًا مقارنة بتحويل فورييه السريع (FFT) لأنه يلغى استخدام البادئة الدورية التي تعمل على تحسين الكفاءة الطيفية. تعد تحويلات المويجات مفيدة أيضًا في العديد من الجوانب مثل نمذجة القناة وضغط البيانات وتخفيف التداخل. وبالتالي ، تم تطوير تقنية تنوع الهوائي MIMO مع تحويل الموجات لتحسين الأداء والكفاءة الطيفية للنظام. تم أخذ صفائف الهوائي المتعددة في الاعتبار مثل المصفوفة الخطية الموحدة (ULA) مع تباعد نصف الطول. يُنشر النظام عند GHz 60 لأنه نطاق طيف غير مرخص ومناسب للانتشار على مسافة قصيرة لكل من خط البصر وقناة الانتشار متعددة المسيرات. يتم إجراء التشكيل QAM وإزالة التشكيل في المرسل والمستقبل. يتم تحويل البيانات إلى معاملات DWT عن طريق إعادة تشكيل الخاصية. ثم يتم بناء وإعادة بناء الموجات بواسطة خاصية إعادة الإعمار المثالية. لذلك ، فإن DWT معكوس في المرسل و DWT في المتلقى لديها الفرصة لتحسين أداء BER. يتم تنفيذ الأداء من حيث معدل البت للخطأ (BER) في برنامج محاكاة MATLAB لجميع سيناريوهات التنوع المدخلات سواء المدخل فردي والمخرج فردي DWT (SISO) وإدخال متعدد ومخرج فردي DWT (MISO) و MIMO DWT. من بينها جميع MIMO DWT أفضل. كما يتم محاكاة أداء MIMO OFDM مع موجات مختلفة ، كما أن أداء تحويلات Wavelets يكون أفضل عند مقارنته بتحويل المويجات الآخر بمقدار B2. تُظهر نتائج MIMO DWT BER تحسنا أفضل مقارنةً بالمعيار بمقدار B2. النتائج التحليلية عند مقارنتها بنتائج المحاكاة جيدة في توافقها مع تناقض أقل.

APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that in my opinion; it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science (Computer and Information Engineering).

Khaizuran Bin Abdullah Supervisor

Md. Rafiqul Islam Co-Supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science (Computer and Information Engineering).

Huda Adibah b. Mohd. Ramli Internal Examiner

Che Zalina Zulkifli External Examiner

This thesis was submitted to the Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering and is accepted as a fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science (Computer and Information Engineering).

> Mohamed Hadi Habaebi Head, Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering

This thesis was submitted to the Kulliyyah of Engineering and is accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science (Computer and Information Engineering).

> Ahmad Faris bin Ismail Dean, Kulliyah of Engineering

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Nagma Parveen

Signature

Date

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

DEVELOPMENT OF MIMO DIVERSITY TECHNIQUE WITH DISCRETE WAVELET TRANSFORM FOR MILLIMETER WAVE COMMUNICATION SYSTEM

I declare that the copyright holders of this thesis are jointly owned by the student and IIUM.

Copyright © 2020 Nagma Parveen and International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieved system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

By signing this form, I acknowledged that I have read and understand the IIUM Intellectual Property Right and Commercialization policy.

Affirmed by Nagma Parveen

Signature

Date

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the Name of Allah, the Most Compassionate, the Most Merciful

Allah - beginning with the name of - the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful Most Auspicious is he in whose control is the entire kingship; and he is able to do all things [67:1]. All Praise to Allah, the Lord of the creation, and countless blessings and peace upon our Master Mohammed, the leader of the Prophets.

A special thanks to Associate Professor Ir. Dr. Khaizuran Abdullah for his continuous support, encouragement and leadership, and for that, I will be forever grateful. He was always there to solve any problem came to my research. Heartiest thanks to my cheerful co-supervisor Professor Dr. Rafiqul Islam for guidance and support in my research work.

I want the special mention Professor Dr. Sher Afghan Khan for his continuous support and motivation during my thesis work. He was always supporting in my postgraduate studies. I also want to mention Professor Dr. Meftah Hrairi for his motivations and support during my thesis work.

It is my utmost pleasure to dedicate this work to my dear parents, in-laws and my family members, who granted me the gift of their unwavering belief in my ability to accomplish this goal: thank you for your support and patience.

Last but not the least, not to forget to my life partner, Mr. Abdul Aabid who was involved in this thesis work and I am thankful for his sacrifices, patience and understanding that were inevitable to make this thesis work possible.

I wish to express my appreciation and thanks to those who provided their time, effort and support for this project. To the members of my thesis committee, thank you for sticking with me. I will be eternally grateful to all and may Allah reward your efforts.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
Approval Page	iv
Declaration	v
Copyright Page	vi
Aknowledgements	vii
Table of Contents	viii
List of Tables	X
List of Figures	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiii
List of Symbols	xiv
•	
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Overview	1
1.2 Background of the Study	1
1.3 Problem STATEMENT	4
1.4 Research Objective	5
1.5 Research Methodology	5
1.6 Research Scope	8
1.7 Thesis Outline	8
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Evaluation of 5G	10
2.1.1 First Generation (1G)	10
2.1.2 Second Generation (2G)	11
2.1.3 Third Generation (3G)	11
2.1.4 Fourth Generation (4G)	12
2.1.5 Fifth Generation (5G)	13
2.2 Millimeterwave Systems	15
2.2.1 Motivations for Millimeter Wave System	17
2.3 Diversity Technique	
2.3.1 Transmit/Receive Diversity	
2.3.2 MIMO Diversity	19
2.4 Discrete Wavelets Transform	20
2.4.1 Wavelets and Its Advantages	20
2.4.2 Fundamental of Discrete Wavelet Transform	21
2.4.3 Types of Wavelets	23
2.4.4 Comparative Study of Discrete Wavelet Transform	24
2.5 Chapter Summary	
CUADTED TUDEE, DESEADCU METUADAI ACV	20
2 1 Introduction	······49
3.1 IIII Ouucuoli	
J.Z J YSICIII IVIOUCI	411
3.3 Transmitter Block	
3.3 Transmitter Block	

3.4.1 Reconstruction Property	32
3.5 Channel Model	33
3.6 Analysis of Proposed Technique	34
3.7 Chapter Summary	35
CHAPTER FOUR RESULTS AND ANALYSIS	36
4 1 Introduction	36
4.2 Performance of BER with Array Gain	36
4.2.1 Single Input and Single Output (SISO)	36
4.2.2 Single Input and Multiple Output (SIMO)	
4.2.3 Multiple Input and Single Output (MISO)	
4.2.4 Multiple Input and Multiple Output (MIMO)	
4.2.5 Performance Comparison of All Scenarios	40
4.3 Performance of BER with Wavelets Transform	41
4.3.1 SISO and SIMO	41
4.3.2 SISO and MISO	42
4.3.3 SISO and MIMO	43
4.3.4 Comparison Performance of All Diversity Technique Using	
Wavelets Transform	45
4.3.5 Comparison of Different Wavelets Transform	45
4.3.6 Comparison of Different QAM Modulation Techniques	46
4.3.7 Validation	48
4.3.7.1 Comparison with Benchmarking	48
4.3.7.2 Comparison with Analytical Method	50
4.4 Performance of Spectral Efficiency	51
4.5 Chapter Summary	52
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	54
5.1 Conclusion	54
5.2 Recommendation	55
REFERENCES	56
PUBLICATIONS AND CONFERENCES	61
APPENDIX A: BER WITH ARRAY GAIN CODE	63
APPENDIX B: BER WITH WAVELET TRANSFORMS CODE	69

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Difference between traditional and mm wave communication system	17
Table 2.2 Comparative studies of DWT-OFDM	
Table 4.1 Summarise performance with array gain	40
Table 4.2 Simulation parameters for SISO and SIMO	41
Table 4.3 Simulation parameters for SISO and MISO	43
Table 4.4 Simulation parameters for SISO and MIMO	44
Table 4.4 Performace comparison with wavelets	45
Table 4.4 Parameters for different wavelets	45
Table 4.4 Simulation parameters for different modulation	47
Table 4.8 Simulation parameters for validation	49
Table 4.9 Validation of BER values	50

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 SISO communication system	2
Figure 1.2 SIMO communication system	3
Figure 1.3 MISO communication system	
Figure 1.4 MIMO communication system	4
Figure 1.5 Research methodology flow chart	7
Figure 1.6 Overview of Research Methodology Flow-chart	9
Figure 2.1 5G Requirement	13
Figure 2.2 Mobile Generations with reverence to years, Technology Standards, Rates and their Frequencies (Kamal and Din, 2019)	Data 15
Figure 2.3 Millimeter wave frequency bands	16
Figure 2.4 Level Wavelet Decomposition	22
Figure 2.5 Level Wavelet Reconstruction	23
Figure 2.6 MIMO DWT system model (Bouhlel et al .,2015)	26
Figure 3.1 Overview of the system model of proposed technique	30
Figure 3.2 Transmitter block	31
Figure 3.3 Receiver block	32
Figure 4.1 BER analysis for SISO communication system	37
Figure 4.2 BER analysis for SIMO communication system	38
Figure 4.3 BER analysis for MISO communication system	39
Figure 4.4 BER analysis for MIMO communication system	40
Figure 4.5 SIMO diversity with DWT-OFDM	42
Figure 4.6 MISO diversity with DWT-OFDM	43
Figure 4.7 MIMO diversity with DWT-OFDM	44
Figure 4.8 Comparison of different wavelets transform	46

Figure 4.9 Performance of BER with Different QAM Modulation	47
Figure 4.10 Comparison with benchmarking	49
Figure 4.11 Comparison of results	50
Figure 4.12 Variations of Spectral efficiency with SNR	52

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- 4G Fourth Generation
- 5G Fifth Generation
- BER Bit Error Rate
- BPSK Binary Phase Shift key
- CA Approximate Coefficient Vector
- CD Detailed Coefficient Vector
- Cp Cyclic Prefix
- DWT Discrete Wavelet Transform
- FFT Fast Fourier Transform
- IDWT Inverse Discrete Wavelet Transform
- LOS Line of Sight Propagation
- MISO Multiple Input Single Output
- MIMO Multiple Input Multiple Output
- mm Millimeter
- OFDM Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiplex
- QAM Quadrature Amplitude Modulation
- SISO Single Input Single Output
- SIMO Single Input Multiple Output
- SNR Signal to Noise Ratio
- ULA Uniform Linear Array

LIST OF SYMBOLS

r(t)	Channel response
y _{high} [k]	High Pass filter
y _{low} [k]	Low pass filter
m	Number of transmitter antennas
n	Number of receiver antennas
n(t)	Noise signal
N _r	Order of reconstruction
N _d	Order of decomposition
y(t)	Received signal
$\frac{E_b}{N}$	Signal to noise ratio
Т	Transpose
s(t)	Transmitted signal
λ	Wavelength

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1.1 OVERVIEW

This introductory chapter lays down a foundation and discusses the background of this thesis, describes broadly the problem statement which this thesis will deal and from that identify objectives to be solved Detailed methodology is discussed at the end of this chapter.

1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Over the last few years, the subscribers of wireless communications or particularly the number of internet users has become exponential in growth. The ongoing progress in radio technology needs to provide high mobility, increase in network capacity, high data rate and excellent end-to end performance. With severe shortage of spectrum in conventional cellular bands, the range of frequencies between 3 and 300 GHz have been attracting attention for higher demand of cellular applications (Akdeniz et al., 2014). The applications such as interactive media services which use internet access for transferring data needs high-frequency band to support wireless communications system (J. Islam, 2012). Many researchers are investigating and analyzing to meet the high data rate requirement of future generation wireless communication as the data rate is increasing exponentially with the increase of demands.

The system performance is improved by diversity technique is used to counter act effect. Some of them are: frequency diversity, time diversity, polarization diversity, angle diversity, antenna/Spatial diversity. Multiple antennas are used to send signals with information to the receiver to provide multiple independent fading paths in space diversity. Spatial diversity is widely used as it is simple, cost effective, easy to implement and also reduces fast fading and inter-channel interference effects in the wireless network system (Islam, 2012). For the implementation of Multiple input and multiple output (MIMO) wireless communication systems physical diversity techniques such as time, space, frequency and polarization have been thoroughly studied (Adila et al., 2007; Patil, 2014) In wireless communication Space diversity is one of the diversity schemes which includes two or more antennas to improve the quality and reliability of the wireless link between the transmitter and receiver (Ghosh and Mehedi, 2018). Currently, the systems with four different types can be considered as diversity (input and output are considered as number of antennas).

In Single Input and single output (SISO) communication systems two antennas one as a transmitter as a source and another for the receiver as the destination are used as shown Figure 1.1. In SISO, the signal is faded more which results in high Bit Error Rate (BER) and poor communication link. The other communication system such as SIMO, MISO, and MIMO are used to mitigate the fading effect and improve the performance in terms of BER, Capacity, security and energy efficiency.



Figure 1.1 SISO communication system

In SIMO communication systems one antenna is used as a transmitter, and two or more antennas are used at the receiver as shown in Figure 1.2 which is also referred to as receive diversity. The most common used receive diversity technique include maximum ratio Combining, selection combining to enhance the framework of a receiver to various signals at the receiver to mitigate the fading effect.



Figure 1.2 SIMO communication system

In MISO communication systems two or more antennas are used at the transmitter and one antenna at the receiver side as shown in Figure 1.3 which is also referred to as transmit diversity. Here, the same data is transmitted twice from the transmitter, and the receiver get optimized the data which results in less loss signal and improve the performance of the system. The advantage of MISO is that various signals are coded and is moved to the receiver from the transmitter.



Figure 1.3 MISO communication system

In MIMO communication systems two or more antennas are used at the transmitter, and two or more antennas are used at the receiver side as shown in Figure 1.4. MIMO diversity technique provides high capacity and data rate with less loss of signal which results in a reduction of BER. Channel estimation and equalizers are used in MIMO channel to mitigate the fading effect. In mm wave communication system for a MIMO channel, a coding Technique was proposed using minimum mean square error and successive interference cancellation (Boby et al., 2019). The low correlation between the multipath channel of the MIMO system improves channel capacity and their performance in terms of BER was studied by (Adila et al., 2010).



Figure 1.4 MIMO communication system

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Spectrum usage due to increase number of mobile users using services like audio, video and images is one of the challenges for wireless communication. Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiplexing (OFDM) is one of promising techniques to increase spectral efficiency. However, the conventional OFDM using fast Fourier transform (FFT) still has the drawback of reducing spectral efficiency as it requires insertion of cyclic prefix at transmitter and removal of cyclic prefix at receiver. Discrete wavelet transforms (DWT) are used as an alternative method replacing FFT to increase the spectral efficiency as it eliminates the use of cyclic prefix. Multipath fading can be one of the drawbacks for transmission wireless signal. The effect of this situation is that the signal at the receiver may be noisy and distorted. Thus, the antenna diversity i.e. with multiple inputs and multiple outputs provides an improvement in the BER performance at the receiver. Therefore, MIMO diversity with wavelets transform need to be implemented in mm wave communication system to improve spectral efficiency and reduction of BER.

1.4 RESEARCH OBJECTIVE

The main objectives of the thesis are given below

- To study the performance of antenna diversity scenarios using uniform linear array.
- 2- To develop antenna diversity technique with discrete wavelet transform for mm wave communication system.
- 3- To evaluate BER performance for the proposed approach.
- 4- To compare the performance with different wavelets transform and the benchmarking:

1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The overall in order to accomplish the objective of this research, the methodology is outlined by the following steps:

• Literature review: The first step is a review of the current state of the diversity techniques in the wireless communication to combat the fading effect and to increase the efficiency of the channel. This will give an overview and review of the researches that have been executed in this area.

- The Second step is to program and find the results using MATLAB simulation to study the performance of SISO, SIMO, MISO and MIMO diversity technique using array gain with BPSK modulation.
- The third step is to implement ULA using array gain diversity techniques at both transmitter and receiver with wavelets transform.
- The fourth step is studying the performance of SISO, SIMO, MISO and MIMO diversity techniques with wavelets transform using array gain.
- The last step is to validate our proposed results with previous work and analytical formulation. We also validate with different wavelets transform and QAM modulation techniques.

The details methodology of current work has been ordered in using the flow chart process, which as shown in Figure 1.5.



Figure 1.5 Research methodology flow chart

1.6 RESEARCH SCOPE

Increase in spectral efficiency with wavelets transform and MIMO diversity technique to improve the performance in terms of BER is the main contribution of this thesis. MIMO diversity with wavelet transform is developed and studied that significantly improves the performance for mm wave communication system. The scope of this research is given below,

- The simulation of the proposed approach is carried out in perfect channel conditions, i.e. in an indoor scenario with known distance between transmitter and receiver.
- The multipath channel is considered based on number of scatters, i.e. scattering MIMO channel with known number of scatters.
- The performance is limited to two elements of the uniform linear array with halflength spacing to achieve reduction in BER for mm wave system

1.7 THESIS OUTLINE

This thesis is mainly divided into five chapters. The outline of the chapters is given below:

- Chapter One: Background of the thesis study, problem statement, research objective, research scope and methodology is briefly explained and also thesis organization is discussed in this chapter.
- Chapter Two: The overview of 5G and advantages of both mm wave and wavelets are summarized. It also gives the brief literature of various diversity techniques developed by the researchers and how DWT is used in replace of FFT to improve the spectral efficiency is discussed.

- Chapter Three: The detailed methodology of the research is discussed in chapter three which includes system model, transmitter block, receiver block, channel model and analysis of the proposed technique.
- Chapter Four: The simulation results are discussed in this chapter. The performance of SISO, SIMO, MISO and MIMO with wavelets transform and without wavelets transform are shown. The performance for different wavelets transforms and comparison with previous results are also shown in this chapter.
- Chapter Five: Finally, the thesis is concluded in chapter five and future recommendation of this research is also discussed briefly. The organization of chapters is shown in Figure 1.6.



Figure 1.6 Overview of Research Methodology Flow-chart

CHAPTER TWO LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 EVALUATION OF 5G

The wireless communication system has become more popular due to fast revolution in mobile technology over recent years. The revolution is as there is increase in telecoms customers. The revolution is from 1G- the first generation, 2Gthe second generation, 3G- the third generation, and then the 4G- the fourth generation,5G-the fifth second generation is explained below.

2.1.1 First Generation (1G)

In 1980 first generation was emerged which was an analog system based on Frequency Division Multiple Access technique (FDMA). The highlights of the first generation were the speed was up to 2.4 kbps, it allows voice call within one country using analog signal and the capacity was 30 KHz. Some of the mobile technology's which were used in first generation are Mobile Telephone System (MTS), Advanced Mobile Telephone System (AMTS), Improved Mobile Telephone Service (IMTS) and Push to Talk (PTT). The drawbacks of first generation are low voice quality, low capacity, the handset was heavy was not feasible to carry, battery life was poor and spectral efficiency was of lower level. The communication channel was not secure, and it utilizes analog transmission instead of digital which is less effective in means of transmitting information.