



EFFICIENCY OF ISLAMIC AND CONVENTIONAL COMMERCIAL BANKS IN MALAYSIA (2000— 2004): A DATA ENVELOPMENT ANALYSIS (DEA) STUDY

BY

NOR AIZA BINTI MOHD ZAMIL

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

2007

EFFICIENCY OF ISLAMIC AND CONVENTIONAL COMMERCIAL BANKS IN MALAYSIA (2000—2004): A DATA ENVELOPMENT ANALYIS (DEA) STUDY

BY

NOR AIZA BINTI MOHD ZAMIL

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science in Accounting

Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences International Islamic University Malaysia

JANUARY 2007

ABSTRACT

This study provides insights into the relative efficiency of Islamic Commercial Banks (ICBs) and Conventional Commercial Banks (CCBs) operating under the dual banking system in Malaysia. Also, this study examines the efficiency of ICBs as compared to CCBs in Malaysia and the influence of banks' specific characteristics on efficiency measures. This study seeks to examine the efficiency of ICBs and CCBs in Malaysia from the year 2000 to 2004 using Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA). Eleven commercial banks in Malaysia, including 2 fully-fledged ICBs, were chosen as the sample of the study. Two-stage of analysis were employed to answer the objectives and research questions. In the first stage, this study applies DEA to measure the relative technical efficiency under the assumption of Constant Returns to Scale (CRS) and Variable Returns to Scale (VRS). DEA is used to examine the relative efficiency of the selected banks in intermediating inputs into outputs. The inputs chosen are operating expenses, capital, and total deposits and loanable funds, and the outputs chosen are loans and advances, and income. The second stage of the analysis of the study is to examine the influence of the banks' specific characteristics (i.e. bank size, profitability, market power, non-performing loans and bank capitalization) on the efficiency measures (i.e. technical efficiency, pure technical efficiency and scale efficiency) resulting from the DEA using linear regression tests. It is found that more banks are fully efficient under the assumption of VRS. Furthermore, the main source of technical efficiency in Malaysia in 2001-2002 is scale efficiency (i.e. pure technical inefficiency) and in 2000, 2003, and 2004 it is pure technical efficiency (i.e. scale inefficiency). Overall, on average the main source of TE in Malaysia is pure technical efficiency (i.e. scale inefficiency). PBB, BIMB and BMMB were among the least efficient banks, while MBB and BMMB were banks whose operations were locally efficient but not globally efficient. It was also found that the operational or managerial efficiency of CCB is higher than that of ICB. In addition, bank size is significantly positive associated to TE and SE and NPLs is significantly positive associated to SE. On the other hand, market power is negatively significant associated to TE and SE, and bank capitalization is negatively significant associated to PTE. Furthermore, it was also found that, there is no association between profitability and efficiency measures.

ICBs		
	CCBs	
ICBs		
	CCBs	
2000	CCBs	ICBs
	.DEA	2004
)		DEA
	.VRS	CRS (
		DEA
	: .	

.

:



.SE

•

PTE

.

APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that, in my opinion, it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Science in Accounting.

Abdul Rahim Bin Abdul Rahman Supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that, in my opinion, it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Science in Accounting.

Norma Binti Md Saad Examiner

Rosylin Binti Mohd Yusof Examiner

This dissertation was submitted to the Department of Accounting and is accepted as a partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science in Accounting

Shahul Hameed Bin Mohd Ibrahim Head, Department of Accounting

This dissertation was submitted to the Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences and is accepted as a partial fulfilment for the degree of Master of Sciences in Accounting

Jamil Bin Osman

Dean, Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Nor Aiza Binti Mohd Zamil

Signature.....

Date.....

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

Copyright © by Nor Aiza Binti Mohd Zamil. All right reserved.

EFFICIENCY OF ISLAMIC AND CONVENTIONAL COMMERCIAL BANKS IN MALAYSIA (2000—2004): A DATA ENVELOPMENT ANALYSIS (DEA) STUDY

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below.

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

Affirmed by Nor Aiza Binti Mohd Zamil

Signature

Date

To my beloved parents Hj.Mohd Zamil bin Ahmad and Hjh. Aminah binti Hj. Omar and my siblings; Norhayati, Nor Asmaa and Nor Syaimaa. The real voyage of discovery consists not in seeking new landscapes, but having NEW

EYES. –Marcel Proust.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS



In the name of Allah, the Most Compassionate and the Most Merciful. Praise be to Allah, Lord of the Universe and to His Messenger, Muhammad PBUH.

First and foremost, I am very grateful to Allah, the Almighty, for giving me the strength, health and energy to undergo all the challenges in life. Also, I am grateful to Allah for allowing me to always remain true to myself.

Secondly, I would like to thank all my teachers and lecturers throughout my life. They have taught me to go through life with my own capacity and capability. They made me realize that success is not an easy task but not an impossible one.

It has taken the sincere efforts of many people together for me to complete this thesis successfully. I would like to thank my supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Abdul Rahim Abdul Rahman for his guidance, patience and valuable comments in supervising me to make this piece of work possible. It was a great pleasure for me to conduct this thesis under his supervision.

Also, special thanks are due to Dr. Hafiz Majdi Abdul Rashid, Dr. Fatima Abdul Hamid, Assoc. Prof. Dr.Siti Normala Sheikh Obid, Dr. Shahul Hameed, Prof. Dr. Maliah Sulaiman and Assoc. Professor Dr. Nik Nazli Nik Ahmad. I am very grateful to be one of your students, you have broadened my perspective on life. You have assisted me to be a better person and to face life with courage and the application of ability.

In addition, I would like to forward my appreciation to my truest friends. They are always there for me...through thick and thin.

Finally, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my father and my mother. Thank you for their unconditional love and support. It is because of their spirit that I have been encouraged to overcome every challenge that came along. They taught me that in any situation I should not withdraw, hold back, and be afraid in life. They polished me to outshine in life. And, to my siblings, Hayati, Asmaa and Syaimaa, I always aim for the best in life to inspire them to achieve success in their own interest.

CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
Approval Page	V
Declaration Page	vi
Copyright Page	vii
Dedication	viii
Acknowledgments	ix
List of Tables	xiii
List of Figures	XV
List of Abbreviations	xvii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Motivations of the Study	1
1.2 Objectives of the Study	3
1.3 Organization of the Chapters	5
CHAPTER TWO: ISLAMIC BANKING: AN INTRODUCTION	
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Philosophy of Islamic Banking	10
2.2.1 Prohibition of Interest in All Form of Transaction	12
2.2.2. Trade and Commercial Activities	14
2.2.3 Profit and Loss Sharing Framework (Profit Sharing Loss	
Bearing)	18
2.3 History of Islamic Banking Worldwide	20
2.4 Development of Islamic Banking	22
2.4.1 Development of Islamic Banks and Islamic Windows	$\frac{-}{22}$
2.4.2 Growth	23
2.5 Islamic Banking in Malaysia	24
2.5.1 History	24
2.5.2 Development.	24
2.5.3 Growth	29
2.6 Conclusion	31
	~ •

CHAPTER THREE: EFFICIENCY AS A MEASURE OF PERFORMANCE IN BANKING SECTOR: A REVIEW OF LITERATURE

3.1 Introduction	33
3.2 Performance Measurement in the Banking Sector	33
3.2.1 Financial Performance	34
3.2.2 Operational Performance	35
3.2.2.1 Stochastic Frontier Analysis (SFA)	37
3.2.2.2 Limitations of SFA	40

3.2.2.3 Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA)	40
3.2.2.4 DEA over SFA	48
3.2.3 Theoretical Framework and Dimension of Efficiency	50
3.3 Measuring Performance: Efficiency in Islamic Banking Sector	51
3.3.1 Performance of Islamic Banks	55
3.4 Performance of Malaysian Islamic and Conventional Commercial	
Banks	60
3.5 Conclusion	68

CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
4.1 Introduction	70
4.2 Research Objectives and Research Questions	71
4.3 Research Design	73
4.3.1 Sample Selection	73
4.3.2 Research Methods	75
A. First Stage: DEA	75
i. DEA Model	79
ii. Approach: Production and Intermediation	82
iii. Process of Identifying Input and Output	84
B. Second Stage: Regression	86
i. Variables Measurement	89
1) Dependent Variables	89
2) Independent Variables	89
ii. Hypotheses Development	90
1) Bank Size	90
2) Profitability	91
3) Market Power	92
4) Non-Performing Loans	94
5) Capitalization	95
iii. Model Development	96
4.3.3 Data Collection Procedures	97
4.3.4 Data Analysis	97
4.4 Conclusion	99

CHAPTER FIVE: DATA ANALYSIS AND RESEARCH FINDINGS......

5.1 Introduction	100
5.2 Findings of the Study	101
5.2.1 DEA: Efficiency of Islamic and Conventional Commercial	101
Bank in Malaysia	
5.2.1.1 Sample Characteristics	101
5.2.1.2 Efficiency Measures: Input Orientation	102
5.2.2 The Influence of Banks' Characteristics on the Efficiency of	109
Islamic and Conventional Commercial Banks	
5.2.2.1 Descriptive Analysis	109
5.2.2.2 Normality Test	109
5.2.2.3 Test of Multicollinearity	112
5.2.2.4 Linear Regression	113

5.2.2.4.1 Dependent Variable: Technical Efficiency	114
5.2.2.4.2 Dependent Variable: Pure Technical Efficiency	114
5.2.2.4.3 Dependent Variable: Scale Efficiency	115
5.2.2.4.4 Hypotheses Test.	116
5.3 Conclusion.	121

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION	
6.1 Introduction	122
6.2 Efficiency of ICBs and CCBs in Malaysia	122
6.3 Comparative Efficiency of ICBs and CCBs in Malaysia	127
6.4 Factors Influencing Efficiency of Banks	130
6.5 Limitations of the Study	136
6.6 Contribution of the Study	137
6.7 Suggestion for Future Research	139
BIBLIOGRAPHY	141

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page No.</u>
2.1	Islamic Banking: Key Data	30
4.1	List of the ICBs and CCBs in Malaysia for this study	74
4.2	The Inputs and Outputs as Replicated and Modified from Sathye (2001)	86
4.3	Empirical Studies on Second Stage Regression of Efficiency Levels and Banks' Characteristics	87
4.4	Dependent Variables and Definition of Dependent Variables [Modified from Isik & Hassan (2003)	89
4.5	Independent Variables and Definition of Independent Variables	90
5.1	Descriptive Statistics and Correlation Coefficients of Inputs and Outputs Data	101
5.2	Descriptive Statistics: Efficiency Measures	102
5.3	Technical Efficiency in Malaysian Banking: 2000-2004	103
5.4	Frequency Distribution of Technical Efficiency in Malaysian Banking under CRS and VRS: 2000-2004	105
5.5	DEA Technical Efficiency for Malaysian Banks from 2000- 2004 (Constant Returns to Scale)—By Year	106
5.6	DEA Technical Efficiency for Malaysian Banks from 2000- 2004 (Variable Returns to Scale)—By Year	107
5.7	DEA Scale Efficiency for Malaysian Banks from 2000-2004 (Variable Returns to Scale)—By Year	108
5.8	Descriptive Statistics: Dependent Variables (DV) and Independent Variables (IV)	109
5.9	Normality Test of Sample Distribution: Skewness, Kurtosis and Kolmogorov Smirnov Z Test	110
5.10	Possible Transformation Analysis	111

Table No.		Page No.
5.11	Multicollinearity Test—Bivariate Pearson Correlations	112
5.12	Multicollinearity Test—Tolerance and Variance Inflation Factor (VIF)	113
5.13	Dependent Variable: Technical Efficiency	114
5.14	Dependent Variable: Pure Technical Efficiency	115
5.15	Dependent Variable: Scale Efficiency	116
5.16	Directional Relationship Signs, Results from Linear Regression	116
6.1	Summary of Average DEA Efficiency of Malaysian Banks from 2000-2004	123

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure No.		<u>Page No.</u>
2.1	Islamic versus Conventional Commercial Banks	8
2.2	The Relationship between Islam and the Islamic Banking System (Ismail, 1992, p.50; as extracted by Sudin, 1997,p.31)	9
2.3	Islamic Theory of Profit (adapted from Saiful Azhar, 2005)	18
3.1	Dimensions of Efficiency Measures/Estimates of DEA	51
3.2	The Financial Intermediation Process in Conventional Banking (adapted from Batchelor, 2006)	53
3.3	The Financial Intermediation Process in Islamic Banking (adapted from Batchelor, 2006)	54
4.1	Decomposition of Technical Efficiency	78
4.2	Measuring Scale Inefficiency (adapted from Neal, 2004)	81
4.3	Conventional and Islamic Processes of Financial Intermediation	84
4.4	The Relationship between Bank Size and Efficiency Levels	91
4.5	The Relationship between Profitability and Efficiency Levels	92
4.6	The Relationship between Market Power and Efficiency Levels	94
4.7	The Relationship between Non-Performing Loans and Efficiency Levels	95
4.8	The Relationship between Well-Capitalized Firms and Efficiency Levels	96
4.9	The Three Inputs and Two Outputs used in the DEA model – Intermediation Approach	98
4.10	The Relationship between Independent Variables and Dependent Variables	99

Figure No.		<u>Page No.</u>
6.1	The Significant and Insignificant Relationship between Bank's Specific Characteristics and Technical Efficiency	131
6.2	The Significant and Insignificant Relationship between Bank's Specific Characteristics and Pure Technical Efficiency	133
6.3	The Significant and Insignificant Relationship between Bank's Specific Characteristics and Scale Efficiency	135

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AE	Allocative Efficiency
AFBB	Affin Bank Berhad
AMBB	AmBank Berhad
BAFIA	Banking and Financial Institutions Act 1989
BCBB	Bumiputra-Commerce Bank Berhad
BIMB	Bank Islam Malaysia Berhad
BMMB	Bank Muamalat Malaysia Berhad
BNM	Bank Negara Malaysia
CCB	Conventional Commercial Bank
DEA	Data Envelopment Analaysis
DMU	Decision Making Unit
DMUs	Decision Making Units
EON	EON Bank Berhad
e.g.	(exempligrantia): for example
et al	(et alia): and others
etc.	(<i>et cetera</i>): and others
FISB	Faisal Islamic Bank-Sudan
FRS $i - 1_{2004}$	Financial Reporting Standard $i - 1$ (2004)
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
GP8-i	Guidelines on the Specimen Reports and Financial Statements
	for Licensed Islamic Banks
HLBB	Hong Leong Bank Berhad
i.e.	<i>(id est)</i> : that is
IBA	Islamic Banking Act 1983
IBS	Islamic Banking Scheme
IBs	Islamic banks
ICB	Islamic Commercial Bank
IIFM	International Islamic Financial Market
MASB	Malaysia Accounting Standard Board
MBB	Maybank Berhad
MPI	Malmquist Productivity Index
NPLs	Non-Performing Loans
OE	Overall Efficiency
PAO	Pilgrim Affairs Office
PBB	Public Bank Berhad
PMFB	Pilgrims Management and Fund Board
PSC	Pilgrim Savings Corporation
PTE	Pure Technical Efficiency
RHB	RHB Bank Berhad
SBB	Southern Bank Berhad
SE	Scale Efficiency
SFA	Stochastic Frontier Analysis
TE	Technical Efficiency

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 MOTIVATIONS OF THE STUDY

The motivation to do this study arose whilst reviewing the literature on performance evaluation in the banking sector. During the initial phase of the literature search, it was found that there is extensive literature using Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA) to measure efficiency, internationally (Al-Faraj, Alidi and Bu-Bshait, 1992; Oral, Kettani and Yolalan, 1992; Miller and Noulas, 1996; Darrat, 2000; Soteriou and Stavrinides, 2000; Sathye, 2001; Akhtar, 2002; Drake and Howcroft, 2002; Sturm and William, 2004) and using the Malmquist Productivity Index (MPI) to measure the productivity (Mukherjee K., 2001; Sathye, 2002; Darrat, Topuz, and Yousef, 2002; Sturm and William, 20004; Krishnasamy, Alfieya, and Perumal, 2003, Fadzlan and Suraya, 2005) of banking activities for conventional banks.

In addition to the literature on the efficiency of conventional banks, there are a few attempts at measuring the efficiency of Islamic banks (IBs) using various methods such as ratio analysis, linear equations and regression analysis (Sarker, 1999; Hassan and Bashir, 1999; Bashir, 2000; Limam, 2001). There were also studies conducted to measure the efficiency of IBs using DEA by Yudistira (2003) and Hassan, M.K. (2005).

Although there is a vast literature on measuring efficiency of banks internationally, there are only a few studies on efficiency of banking activities in Malaysia (Katib, 1999; Salleh et al., 2001; Guan et al., 2004; Amrizal and Wan Nursofiza; 2004; Norashfah, 2005). The minimal number of studies in examining efficiency, specifically using DEA in Malaysia, has basically created the need for such a study. This is particularly true in terms of investigating the efficiency of conventional and ICB in Malaysia.

Also, the concern on the efficiency and effectiveness of Islamic financial institutions to ensure the development and growth of the economy has been addressed by Zeti Akhtar Aziz (2005)¹;

Given its roles in the intermediation process and payments system, the Islamic banking system will continue to be at the core of the Islamic financial system. A well functioning and efficient banking system is vital for achieving robust economic performance. As financial intermediaries, banks are entrusted to safeguard their deposits and preserve the efficiency in the manner the funds are mobilized, while vigilantly channeling these savings to productive investments. Given these responsibilities, the banking institutions therefore need to play their role effectively and efficiently to contribute to the overall stability of the financial system, and the growth and development of the economy.

In addition, given the current scenario in which the conventional financial system has produced 358 billionaires, while keeping 1.3 billion people living in absolute deprivation, there arose the need to have a more equitable financial system (Nor, 2003)². The existence of the Islamic banking systems that uphold social and economic justice, and aim at equitable wealth and income distribution are really expected by the public (i.e. Muslims) to prosper. Thus, it is crucial to measure the efficiency of the IBs in order to ensure that the operations of IBs that are based on the Islamic principles are operating at their competitive advantage.

¹In the Governor's Speech at the Seminar on the 10-Year Master Pan for Islamic Financial Services Industry—'Building a Progressive Islamic Banking Sector: Charting the Way Forward' on 22nd June 2005 at Putrjaya

² Nor, Mohamed Yakcop. (2003, September). In his speech at the International Islamic Conference: From Moneylenders to Bankers: Evolution of Islamic Banking in Relation to Judeo—Christian and Oriental Banking Traditions on 9th – 10th September 2003 at Prato, Italy.

1.2 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This study could be an initial effort to measure the performance of Malaysian-owned banks in terms of efficiency. It will further enhance the development of research on the Malaysian scene.

Therefore, the objectives of this study are;

- To measure the efficiency of CCBs and ICBs in Malaysia for the year 2000-2004 by using DEA.
- To compare the efficiency between CCBs and ICBs in Malaysia for the year 2000-2004.
- 3. To analyze and examine factors that may influence the efficiency of CCBs and ICBs. The characteristics of the banks that will be tested to explore their influences on efficiency are bank size, profitability, market power, loan ratios and capitalization.

In answering the research objectives above, this study will examine the relative efficiency of 11 Malaysian-owned CCBs, including two fully-fledged ICBs, for a period of five years. The relative efficiency of the banks will be measured by using DEA.

The DEA method uses linear programming to construct a non-parametric piecewise linear frontier of the production process for a group of banks or other decision-making units (DMUs) using multiple inputs and producing multiple outputs (Neal, 2004). It is an application of linear programming that can be used to measure the relative efficiency of the banks with the same goals and objectives (Leong et al., 2003). This is where the efficiency of banks in intermediating inputs into outputs will be measured. In this study, the relative efficiency of commercial banks in Malaysia

will be examined due to the same goals and objectives of this type of institutions. Furthermore, the Malaysian commercial banks are chosen since the ICBs and CCBs have to abide by the requirements pronounced by Bank Negara Malaysia.

DEA is a model that uses multiple inputs and outputs from a sample of institutions to develop an efficiency frontier and evaluate the efficiency of a Decision Making Unit (DMU) relative to the DMUs in the sample (Craycraft, 1999; Cooper, Seiford & Tone, 2000; Thanassoulis, 2001). This method combines all the input and output information on the firm into a single measure of productive efficiency that lies between zero (i.e. a completely inefficient firm) and unity (i.e. a completely efficient firm) (Leong et al., 2003). In addition, the DEA effectively estimates the frontier by finding a set of linear estimates that bound (i.e. envelop) the observed data (Leong et al., 2003). Thus, this technique is a benchmarking technique in the sense that the 'best practice' firms lie on the frontier and 'envelop' other inefficient firms (Neal, 2004). In this study, labour cost, capital and total deposits and other loanable funds were chosen as the inputs, while loan and advances, and income (i.e. interest income, non-interest income and Islamic Banking Scheme (IBS) income) were chosen as the outputs. Furthermore, the efficiency levels will be regressed with the banks' specific characteristics.

This would allow assessing and comparing the efficiencies of CCBs operating under the dual banking system and 2 fully-fledged ICBs. In addition, the efficiency measures (i.e. technical efficiency (TE), pure technical efficiency (PTE) and scale efficiency (SE)) will be regressed with banks' specific characteristics to identify the factor that influenced the efficiencies level of ICBs and CCBs in Malaysia. Also, the analysis of the findings will highlight the efficiency of ICBs as compared to the CCBs. In studying the efficiency of banking activities this study would like to deliberate on the efficiency measures of the ability of the bank to play its role as an intermediary between depositors and investors. It is expected that, by measuring the efficiency using DEA, we could infer how efficient the 11 Malaysian-owned banks were in intermediating the inputs into outputs. Also, it is expected that this study will unfold the performance of the ICB in Malaysia as compared to the CCB and will allow for an explanation of the unique characteristics of IBs and how they will survive in the current economy.

1.3 ORGANIZATIONS OF THE STUDY

This thesis comprises of six chapters. This chapter is the first chapter which provides the introductory part of this thesis by explaining the objectives, background, and motivations of the study. Chapter two will present the introduction on Islamic banking. It explains the development and growth of Islamic banking and finance industry worldwide and in Malaysia.

Chapter three reviews the literature on the performance measurement of the banking sector and examines the suitability of DEA over SFA (i.e. among the popular nonparametric and parametric models used) to measure performance in terms of the efficiency in the banking sector. Next, it presents the literature review on the performance of IBs and the performance of Malaysian ICBs and CCBs. Also, it addresses the possibility of comparing the efficiency of ICBs and CCBs.

Chapter four addresses the gap in the previous literature and empirical studies on the performance and efficiency of the banking sector. Next, the research objectives and research questions are presented. It also explains the research design of this study that comprises two stages. In the first stage, the efficiency levels are examined by