EVALUATION OF STAKEHOLDERS' PREFERENCES IN URBAN REDEVELOPMENT

BY

NOOR AMILA BINTI WAN ABDULLAH ZAWAWI

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy Built Environment

Kulliyyah of Architecture and Environmental Design

International Islamic University Malaysia

JULY 2011

ABSTRACT

The multicultural society in Malaysia is ingrained with the built up heritage of its early townships. Architectural details of traditional shophouses, which are the early urban settlements, are a rich mixture of Chinese, Indian, European and Malay cultures. The recent vintage of these built up heritages poses a threat to their existence. Rapid development and escalating market value increasingly replace these buildings with newer and higher-density structures. The current guidelines on redevelopment for traditional areas and buildings have been heavily biased on facade conservation, regardless of other aspects such as cultural merits. The rigidity of the guidelines, or lack of it as perceived by others, has resulted in conflicts and inconsistent redevelopment outcomes, not to mention inefficient implementation of development plans because the stakeholders, particularly the existing community, disagree with planned development for their areas. The aim of this research is to objectively evaluate stakeholders' preferences in redevelopment decisions for traditional area. The subjective elements of multiple stakeholders' different values and interests are explored using Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA). MCA has been widely applied in various urban land use decision making as a structured approach to semi-structured decision problems. It is believed that the structured approach in MCA can be of a significant benefit towards a more constructive and transparent decision process. Eventually, it will lead to easier acceptance of development plans, thus more effective implementation of the plans. Using a relatively common MCA technique, the Analytical Hierarchy Process, stakeholders' preferences on a set of criteria for redevelopment decision are derived and compared. It is found that homogeneity does not necessarily exist within and in between homogeneous groups. This study indirectly contributes to discovering the potential of MCA evaluation to increase transparency in redevelopment decision making process.

خلاصة البحث

يترسخ التنوع الثقافي في المجتمع الماليزي من خلال البناء التراثي في مدنه القديمة. وتتميز التفاصيل المعمارية في المحلات التجارية التقليدية المنتشرة في المستوطنات الحضارية القديمة بخليط من الثقافات الصينية والهندية والأوروبية والملايوية. إلا أن هذه المبانى التراثية مهددة بالزوال في العصر الحديث. ويعد التطور السريع وتزايد أسعار الأسواق نقطة تحول لتلك المباني القديمة إلى مبانٍ جديدة وشاهقة. فالتعليمات الحالية في إعادة تطوير المناطق والمبانى التراثية متحيزة بشدة إلى المحافظة على واجهاتها فقط، دون النظر في مظاهرها الأخرى مثل السمات الثقافية. وأدت صرامة التعليمات أو نقصها من وجهة نظر أخرى إلى نزاعات ونتائج متناقضة في إعادة التطوير. ولا نشير بذلك إلى عدم كفاءة التنفيذ في خطط التطوير، لأن أصحاب الشركات ولاسيما في المجتمع الحالي لا يوافقون على تخطيط تطويري لمناطقهم. لذا، يهدف هذا البحث إلى التقويم الموضوعي لأولويات أصحاب الشركات في قرار إعادة تطوير المناطق التراثية. واستخدم التحليل متعدد المعايير MCA للكشف عن العناصر الذاتية في المصالح والقيم المختلفة والمتعددة لأصحاب الشركات. وطبق هذا التحليل بشكل واسع في العديد من عمليات صنع القرار في المناطق الحضارية بوصفه منظورا منظما إلى شبه منظم في قرار المشكلات. ويعتقد بأن المنظور المنظم في التحليل متعدد المعايير بإمكانه تقديم مصلحة مهمة تجاه العديد من الاجراءات البناءة والشفافة للقرارات. وفي نهاية المطاف، سيقودنا هذا التحليل إلى تسهيل قبول خطط التطوير، وهكذا ستظهر العديد من التطبيقات الفعالة لتلك الخطط وإلى جانب استخدام تقنية التحليل متعدد المعايير، استخدم التحليل الهرمى للقرارات وذلك لمقارنة واستنتاج تفضيلات أصحاب الشركات ضمن مجموعة من المعايير لقرار إعادة التطوير. وأظهرت النتائج أن وجود التجانس لايعد ضرورياً بين المجموعات المتجانسة. وتسهم هذه الدراسة بشكل غير مباشر في استكشاف التقويم المحتمل للتحليل متعدد المعايير، وذلك لرفع مستوى الشفافية في عملية صنع القرار لإعادة التطوير

APPROVAL PAGE

The thesis following:	of Noor	Amila	Binti	Wan	Abdullah	Zawawi	has	been	approved	by	the
					Bin Abdul upervisor	lah					
			1		or Bin Ibra nal Examin						
					Ghani Sa nal Exami						
			Nas		n Ibrahim Chairman	Ahmed					

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where

otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not be	peen previously or concurrently
submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM o	or other institutions.
Noor Amila Binti Wan Abdullah Zawawi	
Signature	Date:

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

Copyright © 2011 by Noor Amila Binti Wan Abdullah Zawawi. All rights reserved.

EVALUATION OF STAKEHOLDERS' PREFERENCES IN URBAN REDEVELOPMENT

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below.

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make or transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries

ıllah Zawawi.
Date

This chapter in my life is dedicated to my family who stood by me and experiences this
journey for life-long learning. To Hana and Hafiy, the sky is the limit, my love. You
can be anything you want to be.

vii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to extend my appreciations to my supervisor, Professor Dr. Alias Bin Abdullah for his guidance throughout this journey. My thanks to the Universiti Teknologi PETRONAS for financial assistance and study leave, to my colleagues, friends and students who have continuously encouraged and inspired me. My sincerest gratitude to the people who helped me in data acquisition: personnel in the City Hall of Kuala Lumpur, Badan Warisan Malaysia, and Jabatan Penilaian dan Pengurusan Hartatanah, so many of whom I would not be able to name each and every one of you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Destract in Arabic	Abstract		ii
Peclaration Page	Abstract in A	Arabic	iii
Copyright Page vi Dedication vii Exchowledgements viii List of Tables xii List of Figures xiv CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 1 1.1 Introduction 1 1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers	Approval Pa	ıge	iv
Dedication vii tecknowledgements viii sist of Tables xii sist of Figures xiv CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 1 1.1 Introduction 1 1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.	Declaration	Page	V
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	Copyright P	age	vi
State of Tables	Dedication		vii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	•		
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 1 1.1 Introduction 1 1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>			
1.1 Introduction 1 1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 51 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development P	List of Figur	res	xiv
1.1 Introduction 1 1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 51 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development P			
1.2 Problem Statement 3 1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105			
1.3 Significance of the Research 4 1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>			
1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
1.4 Objectives 5 1.5 Thesis Structure 6 CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 52 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	1.3	Significance of the Research	4
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8 2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	1.5	Thesis Structure	6
2.1 Introduction 8 2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	СНАРТЕІ	2. LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.2 Town Planning and Urban Development in Malaysia 9 2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.2.1 The Structure Of Government 10 2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.2.2 The Town Planning System 11 2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	2.2		
2.3.1 Summary 34 2.3 Heritage Conservation 36 2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries 36 2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) 41 2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia 47 2.3.4 Definition of Conservation 48 2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia 49 2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation 51 2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation 52 2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation 62 2.3.9 The Built Heritage 69 2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse 78 2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA) 100 2.4.1 Introduction 100 2.4.2 MCA Methods 105 2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3 Heritage Conservation362.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries362.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA)412.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia472.3.4 Definition of Conservation482.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia492.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation512.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.1 Conservation Laws in Developed Countries362.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA)412.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia472.3.4 Definition of Conservation482.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia492.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation512.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	2.2	·	
2.3.2 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA)	2.3		
2.3.3 Conservation in Malaysia		<u> </u>	
2.3.4 Definition of Conservation482.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia492.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation512.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.5 The Emergence of Conservation in Malaysia492.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation512.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.6 Important Aspects of Urban Conservation512.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.7 The Legal Aspect of Conservation522.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.8 The Decision Makers in Conservation622.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.9 The Built Heritage692.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse782.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.3.10 Redevelopment of Traditional Shophouse			
2.4 Multiple Criteria Analysis (MCA)1002.4.1 Introduction1002.4.2 MCA Methods1052.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
2.4.1 Introduction			
2.4.2 MCA Methods	2.4		
2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision			
			105
37.11		2.4.3 MCA Techniques for Development Planning Decision	
Making112		Making	112
2.4.4 Multi-Participant MCA for Urban Redevelopment in			
Traditional Areas114		•	114
2.4.5 Preference Modeling			
2.4.6 Summary			

CHAPTEI	R 3: METHODOLOGY	133
	Research Method	
	The Structured Decision Problem	
	The Preference Modelling	
	Data Collection Method	
	Data Analysis	
0.0	2 1 . 2	10
	R 4: CASE STUDY KUALA LUMPUR TRADITIONAL	120
AREAS	Physical Description of Case Study Area	
4.1	4.1.1 Geographic boundary of Kuala Lumpur	
	4.1.2 Population	
4.2	The Historical Growth of Commercial Land Use in the City Centre	
4.2	4.2.1 The focus area – the City Centre	
4.2		
4.3	Socio-Demographic and Economic Characteristics	
	4.3.1 Changing Pattern of Commercial Landuse	
4.4	4.3.2 Economy of Kuala Lumpur	
4.4.	The Criteria Selection	
	4.4.1 Economic Aspects	
	4.4.2 Environmental Aspect	
	4.4.3 Physical Aspects	
4.5	4.4.4 Social Aspects	
4.5	The Stakeholders	
	4.5.1 Overview of the stakeholders	
	4.5.2 Landowners	
4.6	Summary	181
СПАРТЕІ	R 5: EVALUATION OF THE STAKEHOLDER'S	
PREFERE		192
	Methodological Overview	
3.1	5.1.1 Data Collection	
	5.1.2 Consensus Approaches	
	5.1.3 The Redevelopment Evaluation Using MCA Framework 1	
5.2	Research Findings	
3.2	5.2.1 Owner's Preferences	
	5.2.2 The Government Stakeholders: Planners' and Arch	
	Preferences Stalkahaldara' Crawra	
5.2	5.2.3 Comparison between Stakeholders' Groups	
5.3	Summary	209
CHAPTE	R 6: CONCLUSION	211
	Thesis Objectives and Summary	
	Research Contribution	
6.3	Directions For Future Research	215
BIBLIOG	RAPHY	217

APPENDIX I: QUESTIONNAIRE	. 229
APPENDIX II: PUBLICATION	236

LIST OF TABLES

Table No.		
2.1	Comparison of Heritage Listing Criteria for building	39
2.2	Population increase and the number of traditional shophouses in	74
2.3	Kuala Lumpur Transaction of traditional shophouse in the city centre	74
2.4	Comparison matrix for criterion a	108
2.5	Comparison matrix for redevelopment criteria	127
2.6	Random matrices	128
4.1	Population density change for Kuala Lumpur	144
4.2	Changes in Land use Composition of City Centre Strategic Zone 1984-2005	149
4.3	Set of Criteria	158
4.4	The general nature of stakeholders' role(s)	173
4.5	Stakeholders and their perspectives represented	174
4.6	Stakeholders and decision making contexts	175
4.7	Classification of stakeholders	176
4.8	Ownership of traditional shophouse	179
4.9	Percentage of assets and ownership	181
5.1	Stakeholder Owner's weightage on the criteria set	189
5.2	Stakeholder Owner Consistency Index	189
5.3	Individual ranking of Stakeholder Owners' preferences	193
5.4	Correlations of Stakeholder Owners' importance ranking	194
5.5	Correlations of Stakeholder Owners' importance ranking below 99% confidence level	198

5.6	Stakeholder Planners' and Architects' weightage on the criteria set	199
5.7	Stakeholder Governments' Consistency Index	199
5.8	Individual ranking of Stakeholder Governments' preferences	204
5.9	Correlations of Stakeholder Governments' importance ranking	204
5.10	Stakeholder's Average weightage on the criteria set	206
5.11	Stakeholders' Consistency Index	206
5.12	Aggregated group ranking by Stakeholders	208
5.13	Correlations of stakeholders' groups importance ranking	208
5.14	Summary of research findings	210

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>Figur</u>	e No.	Page No.
2.1	Transaction of traditional shophouse in the city centre	55
2.2	Historical areas within the city center	60
2.3	Architectural styles of traditional shophouse	71
2.4	The process of MCA	103
2.5	A general model of MCA methods	104
2.6	Illustration of decision hierarchy	106
3.1	Process flow	133
3.2	Structured Decision Phase	135
3.3	Triangulation Method	137
4.1	(a) Kuala Lumpur strategic zones, (b) the City Center planning units and designated heritage zone	141
4.2	Population trend in the City Center, by planning units	143
4.3	Population and population density trend for Kuala Lumpur	145
4.4	Kuala Lumpur (Land use change 1984-1998)	149
4.5	Changes in Land use Composition for the City Centre	150
4.6	Vacancy rates of commercial property market in Kuala Lumpur	153
4.7	Occupancy rates for commercial space in KL 1985-2005	153
4.8	Property transacted and GDP per annum	154
4.9	Gross Domestic Product versus commercial property market in	155
4.10	Kuala Lumpur Classification of traditional shophouse lots by land ownership pattern	180
4.11	Classification of owners based on proportion of the traditional shophouse from total assets owned	181

5.1	Redevelopment decision problem decomposed into decision hierarchy	187
5.2	Ranking of criteria after weight aggregation by Stakeholder Owner	190
5.3	Criteria weighted highest by at least three Stakeholder Owners	191
5.4	Criteria weighted lowest by at least three Stakeholder Owners	191
5.5	Three criteria weighted lowest by majority of the Stakeholder Owners	192
5.6	Ranking of criteria after weight aggregation by Stakeholder Governments'	200
5.7	Criteria weighted highest by at least two Stakeholder Governments	201
5.8	Criteria weighted lowest by at least two Stakeholder Governments	201
5.9	Three criteria weighted lowest by majority of the Stakeholder Governments	202
5.10	Ranking of criteria after weight aggregation by Stakeholders	207

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Redevelopment in traditional areas is often complicated and conflict laden involving multiple stakeholders with different interests and values. Development planning and land use decisions for these areas are sufficiently complex, controversial and nonroutine in nature that their resolution requires not only knowledge, expertise and data drawn from several distinct domains, but also debate of multiple and often conflicting viewpoints, objectives and solution strategies. In a dynamic and rapidly growing city such as Kuala Lumpur, redevelopment is often biased towards replacing the traditional areas and their values with new development that has little or no association with the past, wiping clean the heritage legacies. The more sustainable way forward is to embrace the past in our future planning (Jacobs, 1961), because the past gives a sense of belonging to the society, essentially supporting future growth. Therefore, there is a need to balance progressive development with conservation of important cultural values within its society (Steinberg, 1996). A reasonable balance must be obtained among conflicting viewpoints by exploring each stakeholders' values and objectively evaluate them using a formal framework that effectively decompose the decision problem into a set of criteria that allows individual preferences to be judged quantitatively.

Multiple Criteria Analysis or MCA is a method routinely used to facilitate decision makers' learning and understanding of their decision problem and the priorities, values and interests of their own and other parties. The understanding is

normally achieved via exploration of the context of the problem and guides the decision makers towards deeper understanding the decision problem and other stakeholders' different values. The application of MCA to urban planning decisions have gained wider acceptance worldwide (Feick, 2002; Geneletti, 2008; Jankowski, 1995; Janssen, 1992; Joerin, 2001; Langston, 2007; Lee, 2008; Nijkamp, 1990). The multiple dimensions of urban planning problems are well-suited to the ability of most MCA methods to objectively evaluate stakeholders' preferences based on a set of criteria simultaneously. MCA aids decision making process by integrating objective measurement with the preferences of stakeholders, i.e. their values and interests, and manage subjectivity in decision making. In other words, MCA aids decision making by giving structure to decision problems, thus increasing transparency in decision process.

In addition, urban planning problems naturally involve multiple stakeholders with different values and often conflicting interests. Decision making in a pluralistic context is considerably more difficult than by a single stakeholder as participation of multiple stakeholders are likely to involve different values, objectives and conceptualization of issues which are equally likely to be non-coincident or in conflict (Bacic, 2003; Stewart, 1997). The development of various MCA methods gives the flexibility for understanding different decision problems based on relevant factors such as nature of the decision problem, information availability and expected outcomes. This powerful decision aid is yet to be applied to many strategic planning problems in Malaysia (Kamalruddin, 2006).

This study will focus on application of MCA method to evaluate stakeholders' preferences in redevelopment decision for traditional shophouses in the city center of Kuala Lumpur. The thesis focuses on defining redevelopment decision problem and

choosing the most suitable MCA method to explore multiple stakeholders and their different preferences, ultimately assisting stakeholders in understanding their own and others' values and interests. Further it is suggested that the MCA method discuss in the following chapters provides a mechanism for increasing transparency and consistency in decision making. This would eventually lead to consensual or compromise-based development strategies, towards enhancing participatory approach to plan making involving multiple decision makers.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Redevelopment decisions are not a straight forward decision process because it typically involves multiple parties, particularly the local communities which include tenants, lived-in owners, users, adjacent owners and anyone else with interest to the existing structures. These interests are so diverse that it includes many aspects, be it economic, social/cultural or environmental. Traditional shophouse in Kuala Lumpur traditional areas are a significant historical structure because they are indicators of early urban settlements in Malaysian towns. Many of this structure still exist in heritage zones in the city centre of Kuala Lumpur. Rapid development of Kuala Lumpur over 150 years puts this original urban settlement within prime commercial areas today, hence increasing the demands for redevelopment of these 'old buildings'. The redevelopment decision for traditional shophouses and the heritage zones in general, are subjected to various interests of different decision makers, many of them are conflicting. Each decision makers, be it individual (as in owner) or groups (nongovernmental organization, local authority, traders), have their own values and objectives, and many of them view others' interest with very little trust, even when the decision to redevelop seems to be on their side. A clear example is the redevelopment of Petaling Street, a traditional shopping area in the city center. This project was initiated by the City Hall of Kuala Lumpur, here after the City Hall, in the year 1992, but was continually postponed for almost a decade, because decision makers involved failed to come to a consensual agreement on the redevelopment outcome. Local traders refused to give their cooperation to the project because of the uncertainties, such as whether they would be part of the new completed project, despite many assurances by the local authority and their local political representatives. This single event exemplifies the level of distrust and conflicts resulted in unaccountable resources wastage, including deprivation of the benefits of development for the local community, and the nation in general. The main problem can be seen from unstructured problem approach and lack of transparency during the decision process. This problem was further complicated by the involvement of multiple stakeholders, whereby their different objectives and perspectives of the problems negatively affected the decision making process. The advancement in MCA methods paved ways for approaching decision problems in a more structured manner and increase transparency in decision process. Recent developments MCA methods encourage learning and understanding of the decision problems and the values and interests of the stakeholder himself and of others as well, by approaching the decision in a constructive manner, as oppose to descriptive or normative approach in earlier methods.

1.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH

This research would significantly contribute towards encouragement of participative planning via increased understanding of the decision problems and the constructive learning of the differences in values and interests of multiple stakeholders in decision process, hence generating a more structured and transparent decision making process. The significance of this research is in developing the initial evaluation tool for objective evaluation of stakeholders' preferences. The individual or group preferences can be compared which helps stakeholders to understand their own and other's values and interest. The innovation of this research lies with its practical application, in the sense that actions can accurately represent wider interests, leading to acceptance of planned development thus resulting in more efficient implementation of development plans. The outcomes of the research will make a significant contribution to knowledge, as there is a substantial gap in literature on this topic. This applies especially to the problem of redevelopment decisions in traditional areas in Malaysia, critical to this research as the fundamental benefits of having a mechanism to objectively evaluate the importance of criteria lends credibility to decision process in urban planning, which is otherwise very subjective and lack transparency.

1.4 OBJECTIVES

This thesis has several research objectives. The aim of this study is to evaluate the stakeholders' preferences in redevelopment planning decision using the MCA method. In order to achieve this aim several objectives have been identified:

- To identify the most suitable MCA methods for evaluating preferences of multiple stakeholders in redevelopment decisions in traditional areas in Kuala Lumpur.
- To analyze redevelopment decision problem using the selected MCA method.
- 3. To appraise the capability and efficiency of the selected method for structuring and analyzing decision problem

4. To model participative planning via demonstration of more efficient planning using MCA as planning support tool.

1.5 THESIS STRUCTURE

The first chapter outlines the introduction to the thesis. This is followed by Chapter Two, a literature review which built the conceptual and theoretical foundations in urban planning, conservation and redevelopment of traditional areas and their relationship to decision support tool. Sections 2.2 until 2.4 review the importance of land use planning in alleviating land related conflicts and make specific reference to its relationship with traditional areas redevelopment in Kuala Lumpur. Particular attention is directed at the ill-structured and multi-dimensional nature of strategic urban development and redevelopment issues, such as identifying and evaluating competing development alternatives for a commercial development. The contributions that multiple participants MCA can make to the resolution of planning decision problems are described. Its shortcomings in supporting consensus- and compromisebuilding among individuals and groups with diverse interests are identified. An MCA approach is proposed based on this discussion. Section 2.4 specifically focuses on the technical aspects of the chosen MCA that is appropriate for eliciting preferences in redevelopment decision. This section covers the introduction to MCA and its methods, the criteria and the stakeholders involved. The technical aspects of MCA approach is discussed based on its relevance to the redevelopment decisions in traditional areas.

Chapter Three reviews the methodological approach undertaken in carrying out this research. Chapter Four concentrates upon the case study of the commercial redevelopment of heritage zones in City Center of Kuala Lumpur, in which MCA method is applied. The evolving context for commercial redevelopment and land use

planning are described with reference to recent growth of commercial sector, the effect of this growth on land use change and traditional areas, and the planning frameworks that have been adopted to manage this change. The chapter goes on to discuss the selection of stakeholders as research participants. Chapter Five presents the findings of the first stage of the case study research. The selected stakeholders are identified and the set of criteria are developed. The findings identify the preferred criteria for redevelopment in the heritage zones. Preliminary indications of consensus and conflict among decision makers are developed. Chapter Six concludes the thesis by revisiting the main objectives and evaluating them against the research findings.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The literature review has taken two approaches from the aspects of decision problem and decision tool. Under decision problem, the research identified urban planning and urban conservation domains. Both are discussed exhaustively in Section 2.2 and 2.3 respectively. In Section 2.2, urban planning in Malaysia is explored in terms of the decision environment in town planning and the level of public participation. Planning decision is established as ad hoc and unstructured as per conventional decision making, whilst multi-faceted in nature and most of the time, the decision problem is poorly defined. Level of public participation is minimal yet involving multiple stakeholders with diverse interests and conflicting values are common though not always included in the decision process. In Section 2.3, urban conservation in traditional areas in Kuala Lumpur does not protect the traditional shophouse because of its recent vintage. Tremendous redevelopment pressure due to its location puts the shophouse at a threat of demolition. In Chapter Three, the nature of redevelopment decision is explored based on the types of redevelopment, its strategy and motives.

Section 2.4 discusses the decision tool and its suitability to establish its suitability for preference evaluation in redevelopment decision making. The appropriate MCA method was identified based on its ease of understanding to general stakeholders, well-grounded theory and ability to check stakeholders' consistency in expressing their preferences. It is established that MCA's strength lies in its ability to

provide coherent guide to decision making, make the process transparent thus promote stakeholders' contribution and incorporate intangible aspects into decision process.

2.2 TOWN PLANNING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN MALAYSIA

The town planning system in Malaysia is mainly regulated by the Town and Country Planning Act 1976 (hereafter TCPA 1976). This Act provides local authorities with the legal powers to regulate, to control and to plan the development and use of all lands and buildings within their areas of jurisdictions. In performing these roles, the local authorities have to carry out two important tasks: prepare the development plans and undertake development control. The development plans consist of structure plans and local plans, official documents that state future plans. Ideally, both development plans should be gazetted as legal documents to have the weight of the law. The development plans will control future development as all development application must adhere to the gazetted development plans.

This section demonstrates that weak application of the Structure Plan system by the planning authority may have encouraged ad hoc approvals of urban redevelopment thus contributing to haphazard development and redevelopment that undermines older and possibly historical areas in Kuala Lumpur. The main problem lies in the non-existent local plan. The themes explored in this chapter are:

- a. The non-existence of gazetted local plans in Kuala Lumpur has undermined the implementation of the Structure Plan system and induced ad hoc decision making by the planning authorities.
- b. The minimal level of public participation has been a factor to types of redevelopment that overlooked the interests of the local community and other stakeholders, eroding sense of place and unique identity.