THE EFFECTIVENESS OF NIGERIAN NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION IN HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION

BY

SALMAN KOLAWOLE RAHEEM

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

> Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Malaysia

> > MAY 2011

ABSTRACT

National Human Rights Commissions are institutions established by nations across the world to protect and promote human rights. Due to constraints in domestic judicial system and ineffectual international mechanisms for the protection and promotion of human rights, nations were encouraged by the United Nations to consider the possibility of establishing independent NHRC to advance the protection and promotion of human rights standards at the domestic level. As such, the Nigerian NHRC is established for similar purpose. This thesis aims at assessing the effectiveness of the Nigerian National Human Rights Commission. It seeks to discover whether the Commission has met up with the protection and promotion of human rights as the sole purpose for which it was created. To achieve this, the thesis examines the activities of the Commission over a period of fifteen years. It establishes that the Nigerian NHRC was set up by a military administration at a time when human rights violation in Nigeria was at its peak. Thus, the circumstances under which it was created were susceptible to different interpretations. Based on this premise, this thesis seeks to examine the general performance of the Commissions from inception till August 2010. In examining the effectiveness of the Nigerian National Human Rights Commission, this thesis explores available concepts like dominant and holistic concepts. Although, it agrees with these concepts, the thesis develops Standard Basic Theory as additional yardstick upon which the Commission is assessed. Thus, the thesis assesses the legal framework of the Commission. The researchwork finds that the enabling Act under which the Commission was established is weak and inadequate, thus it has undermined the performance of the Commission. This thesis scrutinises the appointment procedure of Commission's members. The thesis concludes that the independence of the Commission is not guaranteed as the appointing body is the executive who can terminate membership when it's will is not carried out. In assessing the performance of the Commission, the thesis examines its complaints procedure, funding, accessibility and its collaboration with NGO community as key factors which can have significant impact on the effectiveness of National Human Rights Commission. This thesis finds that all these are inadequate and insufficient for the Commission to perform maximally. As a result of these findings, the thesis recommends some legislative amendments in order to strengthen the legal framework of the Commission. It also recommends some far-reaching measures to both the government and the Commission in order to enhance the Commission's performance and enable it to meet international standards of protecting and promoting human rights.

خلاصة البحث

فإن المنظمات الوطنية لحقوق الإنسان مؤسسة منشأة في أنحاء العالم حماية لحقوق الإنسان وتعزيزاً لها ونظرًا للتضييق في النظام القضائي المحلى والآليات الدولية غير فعالة لحماية حقوق الإنسان وتعزيزها، فقد شجعت الأمم المتحدة الدول الأعضاء على النظر في ضرورة إنشاء المنظمة الوطنية المستقلة لتطوير وتعزيز معايير حماية حقوق الإنسان على المستوى المحلي. وعلى أساس ذلك تم إنشاء المنظمة الوطنية النيجيرية لحقوق الانسان. وعليه،فإن هذه الرسالة تهدف إلى دراسة العيوب المتأصلة في المنظمة الوطنية النيجيرية لحقوق الإنسان. كما أنها تسعى إلى اكتشاف ما إذا كانت هذه المنظمة قد حققت هدفها الوحيد الذي من أجلها أنشئت وهو حماية حقوق الإنسان و تحقيقاً لهذا الهدف، فإن الرسالة قد فحصت أنشطة المنظمة عبر خمسة عشر عاما وتوصلت إلى أن المنظمة الوطنية النيجيرية لحقوق الانسان إنما تم تأسيسها من قبل الحكومة العسكرية، وذلك في الوقت الذي بلغ انتهاك حقوق الإنسان في نيجيريا ذروته. وبالتالي، فإن الظروف التي تم إنشاء هذه المنظمة فيها تخضع لتأويلات مختلفة، وبناءا على هذا، فإن الرسالة تسعى إلى دراسة أداء المنظمة عموماً، وذلك، من فترة تأسيسها حتى شهر أغسطس2010. وفي أثناء الفحص عن فعالية المنظمة، فإن الرسالة قامت بدراسة أولية للمفاهيم المتاحة مثل مفهومي السيطرة والشمولية، و بالرغم من موافقة هذه الرسالة لهذين المفهومين فإنها قد اخترعت النظرية المعيارية الأساسية كالمقياس الإضافي الذي على أساسه يتم تقييم المنظمة علاوةً على ذلك، فإن الرسالة قامت بتقييم الإطار القانوني للمنظمة، واكتشفت بضعف القانون الذي تم بموجبه إنشاء المنظمة وعدم كفاءته، وبالتالي فانه قد عرقل أداء مهمة المنظمة. وتنظر الرسالة كذلك في عميلة تعيين أعضاء المنظمة، وتوصلت إلى عدم وجود الضمان التام لاستقلالية المنظمة، وذلك لأن تعيين أعضائها ما زالت تحت سيطرة المجلس التنفيذي الوطني، الذي من شأنه أن يتصرف في عزل أعضائها متى شاءت إذا لم تقم المنظمة بتحقيق رغبات هذا المجلس. وفي أثناء تقييم المنظمة من حيث أدائها لمهمتها، فإن الرسالة فحصت إجراءات رفع الشكاوى أمامها، وتمويل المنظمة ، وسهولة الوصول إليها، وتعاونها مع المنظمات غير الحكومية، على أنها هي العوامل الرئيسية التي يمكن أن يكون لها تأثير كبير على فعالية المنظمة الوطنية النيجيرية لحقوق الإنسان. فيرى الباحث أن كل هذه العوامل غير كافية لإتاحة المنظمة فرصة أداء مهمتها على وجهها ونتيجة لهذه الاكتشافات، فإن الباحث يوصى بضرورة تعديلات بعض القوانين لتقوية الإطار القانوني للمنظمة. ويوصى كذلك بإيجاد بعض تدابير بعيدة المدى لكلٍ من الحكومة والمنظمة حتى يتثنى للمنظمة تعزيز دورها من حيث أدائها لمهمتها، وليمكنها من تلبية المعابير الدولية لحماية حقوق الإنسان.

APPROVAL PAGE

		_
	Shamrahayu Ab. Aziz Supervisor	
		_
	Farid Sufian Shuaib Co-supervisor	
-	Khairil Azmin Mokhtar Internal Examiner	
	Tabiu Muhammed External Examiner	

Chairman

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigation, ex	cept
where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously	y or
concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degree at IIUM or of	other
institutions.	
Salman Kolawole Raheem	
Signature	Date

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

Copyright © 2011 by International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF NIGERIAN NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION IN HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION

I hereby affirm that The International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM) holds all rights in the copyright of this work and henceforth any reproduction or use in any form or by means whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of IIUM. No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder.

Affirmed by Salman Kolawole Raheem		
G:		
Signature	Date	

This thesis is dedicated to my parents, Hajji Salman Ayinla Arowolo and Hajja Mariam Ibironke Salman for inculcating in me the virtue of hard-work, love and belief in God.

AND TO

Late Hajji Mutalub Alada, Late Professor Nwazulu Shofola, Dr. Musa A. Abdullahi, Mr. Sarafadeen Olaitan Nafiu and Barrister Tahiru Adebayo for the roles they have played at different time in my educational carrier.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All glory is due to Allah, the Almighty, whose Grace and Mercies have been with me throughout the duration of my programme. Although, it has been tasking, His Mercies and Blessings on me ease the herculean task of completing this thesis.

I am most indebted to by supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shamrahayu A. Aziz, whose enduring disposition, kindness, promptitude, thoroughness and friendship have facilitated the successful completion of my work. I put on record and appreciate her detailed comments, useful suggestions and inspiring queries which have considerably improved this thesis. Her brilliant grasp of the aim and content of this work led to her insightful comments, suggestions and queries which helped me a great deal. Despite her commitments, she took time to listen and attend to me whenever requested. I am also grateful to my co-supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Farid Sufian Shuaib, whose supervision, encouragement and painstaking scrutiny of the work have helped in building the final draft of this work.

Sincere thanks to the entire management and staff of AIKOLS particularly the Dean of law, Prof. Dr. Mohd Akram Shair Mohamed. My thanks to the entire staff of the Postgraduate Units, AIKOL, particularly to Sister Juhanis Mahmud and Sister Zuraila Alwi for their support, cooperation and useful information given when requested. I also express my thanks to Prof. Dr. Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahangar, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Naemah Amin, (former Deputy-Dean Postgraduate Units) and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Khairil Azmin Mokhtar, (Deputy-Dean Postgraduate Units) who served as members of my proposal defence committee, and for their insightful comments and advice.

I also register my appreciation to the following academic staff of AIKOLS from whose fountain of knowledge I have drawn and used. They are Prof. Dr. Zaleha Kamarudin, former Dean of law, whose research methodology lectures have great influence on this work and Prof. Dr. Nik Ahmad Kamal Nik Mahmod, Deputy-Rector (IIUM). Others are, Prof. Dr. Syed Khalid Rashid, Prof. Dr. Abdul Ghafur Hamid, Prof. Dr. Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahangar, Prof. Dr. A. H. Ansari, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohsin Hingun and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Puteri Nemie Jahn Kassim. Last but not the least is Prof. Dr. Abdul Aziz Bari whose Comparative Constitutional Law lectures have broadened my knowledge of Constitutional Law.

I am highly indebted to my uncle Dr. Musa A. Abdullahi, my dear friend Mashood Omoniyi Usman and my wife Hajja Ramat Titilayo Salman. The trio are the planers, architects and designers of my doctoral programme. While they carefully designed and strategically planned the programme, I endured to execute the programme. Apart from their strong financial and moral support, they took charge of almost all my domestic affairs while away. To them I say thanks so much.

My profound gratitude goes to the following people without whose financial backing this research work would have been impossible. First on the list is Barrister Tahiru Adebayo who is the major financier of this doctoral programme. Others are Honourable Justice Lambo Jimoh Akanbi; Honourable Justice Rolli Harriman; Prof. M. T. Abdulrazaq; Hajji Yusuf O. Alli (SAN); Mrs. Motunrayo Oluwemimo Egbe; Mrs. Titilola Idowu Hameed; Dr. Mrs. Nimah Dupe Abdulraheem; Dr. Muhammed L. Akanbi; Barrister Suleiman Jabata; and Barrister Umar Olola Yusuf. To them all I say may God continue to enrich you (Amin).

I quite appreciate the contribution of Prof. Chinedu Obiora Okafor (York University, Canada);; Olubayo Oluduro (Gent University, Belgium); Ma'aruf Abdul-Azeez (International Islamic University); and Umar Oseni (International Islamic University Malaysia) for either drawing my attention to many materials or sending such materials to me directly. In the same token, I am grateful to the entire staff and management of the Nigerian NHRC for being accommodative, providing necessary materials and allowing me to use the Commission's library. Special appreciation goes to Mr. Yakubu Abdulrahman (Assistant Director, Legal), Mr. Lambert

Operah (Assistant Director, Information and Research) and Mrs. Ogu Emilia (the Liberian) of the Commission.

I will like to also appreciate the contributions of my colleagues in diaspora with whom I share ideas. They are Hussain Folorunsho Ahmad (Saddam); Ibrahim Kayode Adam; Dr. Ibrahim Arowosaye Yusuf; Dr. Bashir Omipidan; Dr. Luqman Ayinla; David I. Efevwerhan; Mrs Saudat Sallah-Abdulbaqi; Olubayo Oluduro; Umar Oseni; Ibrahim Abdulfatai Oladimeji; and Sarafadeen Nafiu. They are all wonderful people. I am also grateful to Zakariyyah Yushau and Uthman Ridwan Akorede who hosted me on my arrival in Malaysia and made subsequent stays memorable.

My gratitude goes to the entire management and staff of Nigerian Law School. In particular, I express my appreciations to Dr. Tahir Mamman (DG); Mr. Olanrewaju A. Onadeko (DDG, Lagos Campus), Dr. Usman Nasirudeen (DDG, Kano Campus); Mrs. Valerie A. Shonariwo (Director of Administration); Mrs. Toun Adebiyi (Director of Academics); Mrs. F. A. Adewale; and Engineer B. F. Emmanuel for their sincere advice, prayer and support. Same gratitude goes to my colleagues in the academics for their moral support and encouragement. They are L. O. Alimi; Mrs. Yinka Fashakin-Odukoya; Mrs. Olabisi O. Ayankogbe; Y. D. U. Hambali; Nasiru Tijani; Mrs. T. O. Odusote; Mrs. C. O. Oba; Dr. Yusuf Dadem; and Mallam Shehu Muhammed. I quite appreciate prayers and supports of my friends like Abdul-Qaudri Oba Laaro; Suleiman Ajongolo; Abdulrahman Zubairu Adeta and Saliu Saka (Alfa Oloun).

To my family is my heartfelt appreciation, particularly Hajji Salman and Hajja Mariam (my parent) for their prayers without which I could not have succeeded in this programme and made such tremendous success in my undertakings. Special thanks to my brothers and sisters Kudrat, Idriz, Khadijat and Abdulrahman and their families for their prayers and support. To my in-laws, Hajja Awwa Mustapha, Hakeem Mustapha, Kudrat Ade-Yusuf and Sikiru Muhammed and their family, is my deepest appreciation for their support, encouragement and prayers. I cannot thank them enough.

Lastly, my gratitude goes to my beloved lovely children; Aminat (Princess), Ibrahim, Yusuf, Luqman, Muhammed and Adam for their prayers, understanding and endurance while away.

Once again, to GOD be the glory.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
Approval Page	iv
Declaration Page	V
Copyright Page	vi
Dedication	
Acknowledgements	viii
List of Cases	
List of Statutes	XV
List of Abbreviation	xvi
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	10
1.3 Objectives of the Study	11
1.4 Hypotheses	11
1.5 Methodology of the Study	
1.6 Scope and Limitations of the Study	
1.7 Outline of Chapters	
1.8 Literature Review	
CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPT OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN NIGERIA	31
2.1 Introduction	31
2.2 Human Rights: A Contextual Position	
2.3 Evolution of Human Rights in Nigeria	
2.3.1 Pre-Colonial Regime	
2.3.2 Colonial Regime	
2.3.3 Post-Colonial Regime	
2.4 Human Rights Provisions in the 1999 Nigerian Constitution	
2.4.1Political and Civil Rights	
2.4.2Social and Economic Rights	
2.5 Organs of Government and Human Rights in Nigeria	
2.5.1The Executive Branch	
2.5.2The Legislative Branch	
2.5.3The Judicial Branch	
2.6 Conclusion	
CHAPTER THREE: EVOLUTION AND DEVELOPMENT	
OF NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS	82
3.1 Introduction	82
3.2 The Evolution of Human Rights Institutions	82
3.2.1 Ombudsman	86
3.2.2 Human Rights Commissions	88
3.3 United Nations Human Rights Commission	
3.3.1 Institutional Structure	
3.3.2 Human Rights Commission's Mechanism	
3.3.3 Procedure for Lodging Complaints	
3.3.4 Mechanism for Enforcement	
3.4 New Human Rights Council	111

3.4.1 Innovations in the Human Rights Council	112
3.5 Standard Setting by the UN Human Rights Commission	115
3.5.1 Geneva Guidelines	115
3.5.2 The Paris Principles	117
3.6 Conclusion	
CHAPTER FOUR: ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT OF NIGERIAN	
NHRC	126
4.1 Introduction	126
4.2 Regional Commission to National Commissions	127
4.3 Origin of the Nigerian NHRC	132
4.4 Basic Concepts	138
4.4.1 The Dominant Concept	139
4.4.2 Holistic Concept	147
4.4.3 Basic Standard Theory	148
4.5 Legal Framework	152
4.6 Conclusion	156
CHAPTER FIVE: EFFECTIVENESS OF THE NIGERIAN NHRC IN RE	
MEMBERSHIP, MANDATES AND FUNDING	157
5.1 Introduction	157
5.2 Membership of the Commission	158
5.2.1 Appointment of Members	161
5.2.2 Qualifications of Members	163
5.2.3 Tenure of Members	165
5.3 Mandates and Powers of the Commission	169
5.3.1 Mandates of the Commission	170
5.3.2 Powers of the Commission	171
5.3.3 Analysis of the use Mandates and Powers	172
5.4 Funding of the Commission	179
5.5 Conclusion	181
CHAPTER SIX: ACCESSIBILITY AND COMPLAINT PROCEDURES	
NIGERIAN NHRC	
6.1 Introduction	
6.2 Accessibility of the Commission to the Public	183
6.2.1 Physical Accessibility	
6.2.2 Accessibility by Representation	
6.2.3 Accessibility by Awareness	
6.3 Procedure for Lodging and Treating Complaints	
6.3.1 Methods of Lodging Complaints	192
6.3.2 Mode of Complaints' Treatment	
6.4 Accountability of the Commission	
6.5 Conclusion	202
CHAPTER SEVEN: COLLABORATION OF THE NIGERIAN NHRC	
WITH NGOs	
7.1 Introduction	
7.2 Partnership with Non-Governmental Organisations	
7.2.1 Partnership with NGOs during the Military Regime	
7.2.2 Partnership with NGOs during the Democratic Regime	217

7.3 Successes and Challenges of the Commission	226
7.3.1 Achievements of the Commission	226
7.3.2 Challenges of the Commission	233
7.4 Conclusion	237
CHAPTER EIGHT: HUMAN RIGHTS AND ITS PROTECTION	
IN ISLAM	238
8.1 Introduction	238
8.2 Sources of Human Rights in Islam	239
8.2.1 Type of Human Rights in Islam	243
8.2.1.1 Rights of Allah (Haqq al-Allah)	243
8.2.1.2 Rights of Man (Haqq al-Nas)	244
8.3 Scope of Human Rights in Islam	245
8.4 Institutions for the Protection of Human Rights in Islam	260
8.4.1 Institution of wali al-Mazalim (Muslim Ombudsman)	261
8.4.2Institution of Hisbah	263
8.5 Institution of Hisbah in Nigeria	266
8.5.1 Practice of Hisbah in Kano State	267
8.6 Modern Hisbah Institution	275
8.6.1 Functions and Powers of Hisbah	277
8.6.2 The Muhtasib	279
8.6.3 Qualities of Muhtasib	281
8.7 Conclusion	285
CHAPTER NINE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION	286
9.1 Findings and Conclusion	286
9.2 Recommendations	295
BIBLIOGRAPHY	302
APPENDIX A	331
APPENDIX B	332
APPENDIX C	339
APPENDIX D	343
APPENDIX F	347

LIST OF CASES

A. G Lagos v A. G Federation (2004) 11-12 SC 85

A. G. Abia State v A. G. Federation (2006) 7 SC (pt. I) 51

A. G. Federation v Abubakar (2007) 6 SC 128

A. G. Federation v Dawodu [1995] 2 NWLR (pt. 380) 712

A.C. B v Okonkwo [1997] 1 NWLR (pt. 480) 194

A.G. Federation v Ajayi [2000] 12 NWLR (pt. 682) 509

Abiola v FGN [1997] 12 NWLR (pt. 488) 439

Adedeji v Police Service Commission (1967) All NLR 72

Adegbenro v A. G. Federation (1962) All NLR 423

Adekeye v Akin-Olugbade [1987]3 NWLR (pt. 57) 381

Adesanya v President of Nigeria (1981) All NLR 1

Adewale v Jakande (1982) NCLR 262

Adeyemi v The State [1991] 6 NWLR (pt. 195) 1

Adigun v A. G Oyo State [1993] 8 NWLR (pt. 53) 678

Adikwe v Federal House of Representatives (1982) 3 NCLR 394

Agbachom v The State (1971)1 U.I.L.R. 111

Agbai v Okogbue [1991] 1 NWLR (pt. 204) 391

Agbaje v COP (1969) 1 NMLR 176

Agbakoba v State Security Service [1996] 6 NWLR (pt. 351) 475

Airey v Ireland (1979) EHRR

Ajayi v Zaria Native Authority (1964) NNLR 61

Akunnia v A. G. Anambra State [1977] 5 SC 161

Alaboh v Boyles (1984) 3 NCLR 830

Alakija v MDDC (1959) 4 FSC 38

Aniekwe v Okereke [1996] 6 NWLR (pt. 452) 60

Anigboror v Sea Trucks (Nig) Ltd [1995] 6 NWLR (pt. 399) 35

Anyakpele v Nigeria Army [2000] 13 NWLR (pt. 684) 209

Anyanwu v The State [2002] 13 NWLR (pt. 783) 107

Aoko v Fagbemi (1961) 2 All NLR 400

Ariori v Elemo (1983) 1 All NLR 1

Awolowo v Minister of Internal Affairs (1962) LLR 177

Awolowo v Usman Seriki (1966) All NLR 64

Bello v A. G. Oyo [1986] 5 NWLR (pt. 45) 828

Bronik Motors v Wema Bank Ltd (1983) 1 SCNLR 296

Chime v Chime [2001] 3 NWLR (pt. 701) 527

Council of University of Ibadan v Adamolekun (1967) SC 378

Denloye v MDPDT (1968) ALL NLR 298

Director of State Security Service v Agbakoba [1999] 3 NWLR (pt. 595) 314

DPP v Chike Obi (1961) All NLR 186

Engineering Enterprises v A. G. Kaduna State [1987] 2 NWLR (pt. 57) 381

Evan v United Kingdom [2008] 46 EHRR 34

Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd [2004] 3 WLR 681

Fawehinmi v Abacha [1996] 5 NWLR (pt. 447) 198

Fawehinmi v Akilu (1987) 1 NWLR (pt. 67) 797

Federal Minister of Internal Affairs v Shugaba (1982) 3 NCLR 915

Gafar v Government of Kwara State (2007) 1 -2 SC 189

Garba v The State [1997] 3 NWLR (pt. 492) 144

Gira v The State [1996] 4 NWLR (pt. 443) 375

Golder v United Kingdom (1975) 1 EHRR 524

Guzzardi v Italy [1980] 3 EHRR 333

Hamdam v Rumsfeld, Secretary of State for Defense, 126 SC 2749 (2006)

Hameed Apampa v Balogun, Unreported Suit No. 1/211/65 of 20/10/70

Handyside v United Kingdom (1976) 1 EHRR 737

Iffie v A. G. Bendel State [1987] 4 NWLR (pt. 67) 972

Isaac Boro v Republic (1967) All NLR 32

Jack v University of Agriculture Makurdi [2004] 5 NWLR (pt. 865) 208

Joseph Odogwu v A. G. Federation [1996] 6 NWLR (pt. 456) 508

Josiah v The State [1985] 1 NWLR (pt. 1) 125

Kalu v The State [1998] 13 NWLR (pt. 583) 531

Lakanmi v A. G. Western State (1971) 1 UILR 201

Madu v The State [1997] 1 NWLR (pt. 482) 386

Mallam Saadu of Kunya v Abdulkadir of Fagge (1956) 1 FSC 36

MDPDT v Okonkwo, [2007] 7 NWLR (pt. 711) 206

Military Governor of Ondo State v Adewunmi [1988]3 NWLR (pt. 82) 280

Mogaji v Board of Custom & Excise (1982) NCLR 552

NEPA v Edgbero (2002) 12 SC (pt II) 119

Nwanegbo v Oluwole [2001]37 WLR 101

Nwanko v The State (1985) 6 NCLR 228

Nwosu v Imo Sate Environmental Sanitation Authority [1990] 2 NWLR (pt. 135) 688

Ogba v The State [1992] 2 NWLR (pt. 222) 164

Ogboh v FRN [2002] 10 NWLR (pt. 774) 21

Ohuka v The State [1988] 4 (pt. 86) 36

Okeke v The State [2003] 15 NWLR (pt. 842) 25

Okogie v The Governor of Lagos (1981) 1 NCLR 218

Okoro v The State [1988] 5 NWLR (pt. 94) 255

Olawoyin v A. G. Northern Nigeria (1961)1 All NLR 269

Onagoruwa v IGP (1982) 3 NCLR 547

Oyeyemi v Commissioner of Local Government, Kwara State [1992] 2 NWLR (pt. 226) 661

Paton v United Kingdom (1980) 3 EHRR 408

Peter Nemi v A. G. Lagos State [1996] 6 NWLR (pt. 452) 42

Popoola v Adeyemo [1992] 8 NWLR (pt. 257) 1

Queen v Haske (1961) All NLR 330

R. v Jinadu (1965) All NLR 25

Ransome Kuti v A. G. Federation [1985] 2 NWLR (pt. 6) 211

Rimi v People's Redemption Party Suit N. M/133/80 of 23/12/90

RWDSU v Dolphin Delivery Ltd [1986] 2 S. C. R. 573 at 583

Sele v The State [1993] 1 NWLR (pt. 269) 276

Smith v Selwyn (1914) 3 K. B. 98

State v Makwanyane & Others [1995] 6 BCLR 665; [1995] SACLR Lexis 218

State v Manamela [2002] 5 WRN 127

Tony Momoh v Senate (1984) 4 NCLR 269

LIST OF STATUTES

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (1982)

American Convention on Human Rights (1969)

Australian Human Rights Commission and Equal Opportunity Commission Act 1986

Beninoise Commission on Human Rights Act, (1989)

Child Rights Act, (2003)

Collective Punishment Ordinance No. 67 (1912)

Constitution of Gambia (1997)

Constitution of Ghana (1992)

Constitution of South Africa (1993)

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (1979)

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (1999)

Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia (1991)

Constitution of Uganda (1995)

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights (1950)

Evidence Act (2004)

Federal Environmental Protection Agency (2004)

Ghana's Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice Act, (1993)

Hisbah Board Law, Kano (2003)

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966)

Kenya National Human Rights Commission Act, (2000)

Newspaper Ordinance (1903)

Nigerian National Human Rights Commission Act, Cap. N46 (2004)

Seditious Offences Ordinance (1909)

South African Human Rights Commission Act, (1994)

State Security (Detention of Persons) Act (1985)

State Security (Detention of Persons) Decree No. 2 (1984)

Supreme Court Ordinance No. 4 (1876)

Tanzania Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance Act, (2001)

The Charter of the United Nations (1945)

The Supreme Court Ordinance (1876)

Treason and Other Offences (Special Military Tribunal) Decree No. 1 (1986)

Uganda Human Rights Commission Act, (1997)

United Nations Convention Against Torture (1984)

United Nations Declaration of Human Rights (1948)

Unsettled District Ordinance, No. 15 of 1912

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AC Appeal Court / Appeal Case

ACHPR African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights

ADR Alternative Dispute Resolution

A-G Attorney-General AG Action Group

AICHR ASEAN Inter-governmental Commission on Human Rights

AIT African Independent Television

All N.L.R All Nigerian Law Report

Anor Another

ASEAN South East Asian AU African Union

BOCODEP Bro Bono Coalition for Democracy and Development

BOR Bill of Rights

BST Basic Standard Theory

CASS Centre for Advanced Social Sciences

CDHR Committee for the Defence of Human Rights

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination

Against Women

CIDA Canadian Agency for International Development

CJN Chief Justice of Nigeria

CLEEN Centre for Law Enforcement Education in Nigeria

CLO Civil Liberties Organisation

CMC Complaints Management Committee

CO Colonial Office

CRIB Child Rights Brigade International
CRP Constitutional Rights Project
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council

ed. / eds. Editor/ editors

EHRR European Human Rights Report ESR Economic and Social Rights etc. (et cetera): and so forth

EU European Union

FSC Federal Supreme Court
HRA Human Rights Africa
HRM Human Rights Monitor
HRW Human Rights Watch

HURILAWS Human Rights Law Services

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

IHRHL Institute of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law

JCA Justice Court of Appeal JSC Justice of Supreme Court

LADAP Legal Development and Assistance Project

LFN Laws of the Federation of Nigeria

LLR Lagos Law Report

LRC Legal Resources Consortium

LRRDC Legal Research and Resource Development Centre MOSOP Movement for the Survival of the Ogoni People

N.N.L.R Northern Nigerian Law ReportN.W.L.R Nigerian Weakly Law Report

NADL National Association of Democratic Lawyers

NBA Nigerian Bar Association

NCLR Nigerian Constitutional Law Report

NCNC National Council of Nigeria and Cameroons

NGOs Non-Governmental Organisations

NHRCs National Human Rights Commissions

NHRIs National Human Rights Institutions

NLR Nigerian Law Report

NNHRC Nigerian National Human Rights Commission

No. Number

NOPRIN Network on Police Reform in Nigeria

NPC National Congress Party

OAS Organisation of American States
OAU Organisation of African Unity
OIC Organisation of Islamic Conference

Ors Others

p. / pp. Page/Pages

Para Paragraph/s

PDP Peoples' Democratic Party

PRAWA Prisoners Rehabilitation and Welfare Action

Pt. Part

SAW Salla Allahu 'Alayhi wa-sallam (Blessings and Peace of Allah be

upon him)

SC Supreme Court

SCNJ Supreme Court of Nigeria Judgment

SDP Social Democratic Party

SERAC Economic Rights Action Centre SERAC Social and Economic Rights Action

SSS State Security service TOR Terms of Reference

U.S. United States

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UIDHR Universal Islamic Declaration of Human Rights

UILR University of Ife Law Report

UN United Nations

UNESCO United Nations Education, Science and Cultural Organisation

UNHRC United Nations Human Rights Commission

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

Vol. Volume / Volumes
WACOL Women Aid Collective
WCAR World Against Racism
WIN Women in Nigeria

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

Nigerian National Human Rights Commission is a human rights institution saddled with the responsibilities of, among other things, protecting and promoting human rights in Nigeria. Basically, one major way of protecting and promoting human rights is to uphold, nurture and sustain human rights institutions. It is not in doubt that Nigeria has many human rights institutions which can protect and promote human rights. What is lacking, however, is the ability of the government to uphold and nurture these institutions in order to allow them to function to the expected level. One of such institutions in Nigeria is the Nigerian National Human Rights Commission (NNHRC). The Nigerian National Human Rights Commission (NNHRC) was established by the military junta of Sanni Abacha in 1995 in line with UN directives.

The establishment and strengthening of National Human Rights Institutions emerged in mid twentieth century. Its emergence started with the campaign and discussions by United Nations (UN) in 1946² at about the time

¹ It is created under Decree No. 22 of 1995 now National Human Rights Commission Act, Cap. N46 LFN 2004

² United Nations Centre for Human Rights, National Human Rights Institutions: A Handbook on the Establishment and Strengthening of National Institutions for the Protection and

when the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) was being proposed and discussed.³ The discussion was precipitated on the basis that a mechanism must be put in place to implement and protect the UDHR provisions. It was a good beginning because the discussion triggered further seminars, workshops and most importantly the establishment of strong institution and mechanism which seek to promote and protect human rights. New issues on National Human Rights Commissions meant to implement the increasing volume of new human rights instruments were raised at seminars, in UN bodies such as the Commission on Human Rights, and in the General Assembly.

In 1991 the First International Workshop on National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights was held in Paris.⁴ The outcome of this workshop was a set of principles guiding the work and structure of national institutions.⁵ These guidelines were endorsed by the UN Commission on Human Rights and each nation was enjoined to establish its Human Right Commission. Thus, it has become a highly fashionable step by most nations' governments to

_

Promotion of Human Rights Professional Training Series No. 4 (New York: New York Centre for Human Rights, 1995) at 4 [Hereinafter referred to as UN Handbook] The ECOSOC, in its Resolution 2/9 June 1946 called on member states to "…consider the desirability of establishing information groups or local human rights committees within their respective countries to collaborate with them in furthering the work of the Commission on Human Rights……" Article 2 of the Resolution

³ Canadian Human Rights Foundation and Philippine Commission on Human Rights, *National Human Rights Institutions at Work: The Role of National Human Rights Commissions in the Promotion and Protection of Economic, Social, and Cultural Right* (Montreal: Canadian Human Rights Foundation, 1999) at 13

⁴ Morten Kjaerum, *National Human Rights Institutions: Implementing Human Rights* (Denmark: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2003) at 6

⁵ United Nations Commission on Human Rights Resolution 1992/54

establish National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs). As expected, in the last two decades National Human Rights Institutions spring up across the globe and are today intrinsic part of domestic institutional landscape. Nations with different social and political backgrounds have moved to set up these institutions with encouragement and supports from international actors. Hence, 1980s and 1990s have witnessed a rapid growth in what has come to be known as "National Institutions for the Protection of Human Rights," especially in Africa, Australia, Asia and Central and Eastern Europe.

Although such institutions go under a variety of names, there is a certain degree of uniformity in their structure, functions, and powers. Nearly all are established and funded by government, though composed of members of civil society rather than politicians or bureaucrats. Their functions usually include things like investigating alleged violations of human rights, assisting litigants before national courts or tribunals, promoting public knowledge of human rights, and conducting research. Many have the task of adjudicating on complaints of

.

⁶ United Nations Center for Human Rights, *National Institutions for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights: Fact Sheet No. 19* (New York: New York: Center for Human Rights, 1993) at 2 [Hereinafter referred to as Fact Sheet].

⁷ United Nations Centre for Human Rights, n. 2 at 4

⁸ See for example, the Australian Human Rights Commission and Equal Opportunity Commission Act 1986; the South African Human Rights Commission Act 1994; Ghana's Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice Act, 1993; and Article 159 of the Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia

human rights violations submitted to them, while some are empowered to conduct visits to prisons and other places of detention.⁹

However, some human rights activists and scholars are suspicious and sceptical about the establishment and operation of National Human Rights Commissions in Africa. For example Human Rights Watch (HRW) argues in one of its reports in 2001 that most of the commissions in Africa are designed not to address human rights abuses but rather to assuage international community's criticism of human rights abuses. An example that readily comes to mind is the creation of the Nigerian National Human Rights Commission by the dictatorial Abacha regime which was believed to have been established to hoodwink the international community.

The beginning of violation of human rights provisions in Nigeria started when Nigeria was first in direct contact with the modern concepts and norms of human rights. That was when it attained its independence in 1960 with its new Independence Constitution which entrenched human rights provisions. The guarantee of human rights in the Independent Constitution 1960 "has its genesis

-

Stephen Livingstone, "The Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission", Fordham International Law Journal, Vol. 22, No. 1465, (April 1999) at 2

Chinedu E. Idike, *Deflectionist Institutions or Beacons of Hope? A Study of National Human Rights Commissions in Anglophone Africa* (Ph. D Dissertation, York University, Ontario, Toronto, Canada, 2006) at 7 The same suspicion and scepticism were expressed when the Malaysian National Human Rights Commission (Suhakam) was established in 2000 by some Human Rights Activists. See for example, Amanda Whiting, "Situating Suhakam: Human Rights Debate and Malaysia's National Human Rights Commission" *Stanford Journal of International Law* 39, 59, (Winter 2003), at 7

Human Rights Watch "Africa: Human Rights Commissions Have Little Effect" (New York, 2001) available at http://www.hrw.org/press/2001/02/hrc022201hmt (Accessed on 22 June 2009)

in the attempt to allay the fears of minority ethnic groups"¹² who expressed concern that majority groups in their regions would dominate them after Nigeria became independent from Britain. As a result, the British government, in 1956, appointed the minority commission otherwise known as the Willink Commission¹³ to look into these fears and recommend means of allaying them.¹⁴ The Commission recommended the entrenchment of fundamental rights in the country's Constitution to allay those fears.¹⁵ The result was the insertion of fundamental rights provisions in the country's 1960 Constitution.

Entrenched in the Constitution were provisions for the fundamental human rights of its citizens. The 1960 Nigeria Constitution guarded certain rights of Nigerians. But before then, particularly from the inception of colonial rule in Nigeria through the first Clifford Constitution in 1922 and subsequent Constitutions, the British (the drafter of those Constitutions) did not recognise individual rights or collective rights in Nigeria.

However, that does not mean that human rights did not exist in the precolonial Nigeria. Recognition and protection of human rights certainly existed in

Ekwueme Okoli, "Toward a Human Rights Framework in Nigeria" in Peter Schwab & Adamantia Pollis (eds.) *Toward a Human Rights Framework* (Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1982) at 203

¹³ It is christened "Henry Willink Commission 1958", it is named after its chairman Sir Henry Willink

Report of the Commission Appointed to Inquire into the Fears of the Minorities and Means of Allaying Them Cmd 505 HMSO. London, 1958 (Electronic copy on file with the author)

Philip C. Aka, "Prospect for Igbo Human Rights in Nigeria in the New Century" *Howard Law Journal* 165, 48, (Fall 2004) at 3

¹⁶ Babatunde, A. "The Concept and Practice of Individual Rights in Nigeria, 1950-1966: How Relevant is the American Constitutional Experience?" *American Studies International*, Vol. 29 Issue 2, 1991 at 1

the pre-colonial period in Nigeria similar to all other African countries. However, the meaning of human rights differed in key respect from those prevalent in the West today. In the pre-colonial Nigerian society, the context of family, clan, and ethnic solidarity provided the frameworks within which individuals exercised their economic, political, and social liberties and duties.¹⁷ Then, society was recognised as organic entity. Each social, political and economic institution has its integrative role, with each contributing to the stability and welfare of the polity which was paramount. Society recognised the family and its political, social and economic rights, but certain "virtues such as wisdom, knowledge, piety, bravery and good neighbourliness could be achieved by the individual only in a community." ¹⁸

Many pre-colonial Nigerian societies had clearly defined laws but many acts of behaviour were governed by traditions and taboos that were effective. Therefore, in Nigerian traditional society, the state was an organic concept. In contrast to the situation in the West where individualism prevails, that individual could not subsist without the state because it has the individual. States with centralised political institutions in Nigeria were ruled by an aristocracy that ensured that the individual conformed to the mores of the society. The ruler or king symbolised these mores and, supported by the priests or chiefs, was the

¹⁷ Claude E. Welch, JR. "Human Rights as a Problem in Contemporary Africa" in Claude E. Welch Jr., & Ronald I. Meltzer (eds.) *Human Rights and Development in Africa*, (USA: State University of New York Press, 1984) at 11

¹⁸ Coleman, J. S. "Nigeria: Background to Nationalism" (Benin City: n.p. 1986) at 14