PROTECTING RIGHTS OF ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW: A CASE STUDY OF THE PRACTICE OF ZAMBIA

BY

SHABAN ABDUL MAJEED PHIRI

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Laws

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Malaysia

MARCH 2018

ABSTRACT

The world is currently facing unprecedent refugee crisis which has forcibly displaced 65.3 million people world-wide. This has deleterious effect worse than of the First and Second World Wars. Thus, the present refugee crisis has brought untold misery ever witnessed by humanity before. Millions of these refugees are languishing in foreign countries as they are unable to access international protection. Even those that have been granted asylum, their rights and fundamental freedoms are not respected. While millions of others have perished in the waters in their struggle to seek international protection across the Seas and millions of others are internally displaced and persecuted by their own oppressive governments. These are traumatising events which precipitated this research to investigate into the factors responsible for refugee flight, the condition of refugees in countries of asylum and the extent to which international law, the 1951 Refugee Convention and its 1967 Protocol protect the rights and fundamental freedoms of asylum seekers and refugees. A Case Study for this research was conducted in Zambia investigating into its protection system of asylum seekers and refugees, its asylum laws, policies and its implementation of the 1951 Refugee Convention and other international human rights conventions as they constitute part of the Refugee Convention and its Protocol. Thus, this study has established that most violations of human rights of refugees happen the moment they fall into effective control of States of asylum and prior to refugee recognition in form of physical assault, sexual harassments, arbitrary arrests and detention. But this research has proved that every refugee is initially an asylum seeker protected under international law. This research has applied syntheses of doctrinal and non-doctrinal analysis of legal documents, facts and the data qualitatively. Its theoretical framework is predicated on universalism of human rights as inalienable, interrelated and interdependent applicable to every individual human being. Further established that the object and purpose of the Refugee Convention is to ensure that refugees enjoy maximum protection and the rights enumerated in the Convention in the territory of States Parties. It is for this reason that reservations to the Refugee Convention are incompatible with this object and purpose. And further established that human rights conventions including Refugee Convention do not confer on States Parties any reciprocal rights or mutual benefit, but only confer the rights on all individuals in their territory. Another primary focus of this research was on protection system of refugees from Islamic law perspective critically analysed in Chapter Five. This was triggered by the shocking statistics released by the UNHCR that 54 % of the world refugee population is produced from three Muslim States only and, paradoxically, most of these refugees are also hosted by the Muslim States. Further, although Muslim Jurists have not developed Islamic refugee law, this study has established that Islam has long history of refugee protection which predates modern refugee law. By the 6th century, Islam had established all basic principles for the protection of refugees such as the principles of non-refoulement, al-Aman wa al-Musta'amin (safety and protected person), local integration and naturalisation of refugees as a durable solution, the concept of cessation of *Hijrah* (migration and refugee status), *inter alia*.

ملخص البحث

يواجه العالم حاليا أزمة لاجئين لم يسبق لها مثيل، مما أدى إلى تشريد ٢٥,٣ مليون شخص قسراً في جميع أنحاء العالم. وهذا له تأثير ضار أسوأ من الحرب العالمية الأولى والثانية. وبالتالي ، جلبت أزمة اللاجئين الحالية للبشرية بؤساً يعجز عنه الوصف. ويتعرض الملايين من هؤلاء اللاجئين لقيود في بلدان أجنبية نظراً لعدم قدرقهم على الحصول على الحماية الدولية. وحتى أولئك الذين مُنحوا حق اللجوء، لا تُحترم حقوقهم وحرياتهم الأساسية. في حين أن ملايين آخرين قد لقوا حتفهم في المياه في كفاحهم من أجل التماس الحماية الدولية عبر البحار ، وملايين آخرين قد نزحوا داخلياً واضطهدتهم حكوماتهم القمعية. وهذه الأحداث المؤلمة هي التي دفعت هذا البحث للتحقيق في العوامل المسؤولة عن هروب اللاجئين، وحالة اللاجئين في بلدان اللجوء، ومدى تطبيق القانون الدولي، واتفاقية اللاجئين لعام ١٩٥١ المتعلقة بوضع اللاجئين وبروتوكولها عام ١٩٦٧ المتعلق بوضع اللاجئين وحماية الحقوق والحريات الأساسية لطالبي اللجوء واللاجئين. وأجريت دراسة حالة لهذا البحث في زامبيا للتحقيق في نظام حمايتها لطالبي اللجوء واللاجئين وقوانينها المتعلقة باللجوء وسياساتما وتنفيذها لاتفاقية اللاجئين لعام ١٩٥١ وغيرها من الاتفاقيات الدولية لحقوق الإنسان التي تشكل جزءاً من الاتفاقية الخاصة بوضع اللاجئين والبروتوكول الملحق بها. ومن ثمّ، أثبتت هذه الدراسة أن معظم انتهاكات حقوق الإنسان للاجئين تحدث عندما يقعون تحت السيطرة الفعلية لدول اللجوء وقبل الاعتراف باللاجئين في شكل اعتداء جسدي، ومضايقات جنسية، واعتقالات تعسفية، واحتجاز. ولكن هذا البحث أثبت أن كل لاجئ هو في البداية طالب لجوء محمى بموجب القانون الدولي. وقد طبق هذا البحث مزيج من التحليل النوعي العقائدي وغير العقائدي للوثائق القانونية والحقائق والبيانات. ويستند إطاره النظري إلى عالمية حقوق الإنسان باعتبارها غير قابلة للتصرف ومترابطة ومتشابكة تنطبق على كل إنسان. وأكدّ كذلك أن الغاية من اتفاقية اللاجئين والغرض منها هو ضمان تمتع اللاجئين بأقصى قدر من الحماية والحقوق الواردة في الاتفاقية في إقليم الدول الأطراف. ولهذا السبب فإن التحفظات على اتفاقية اللاجئين لا تتفق مع هذا الهدف والغرض. كما أن اتفاقيات حقوق الإنسان، بما في ذلك اتفاقية اللاجئين، لا تمنح الدول الأطراف أي حقوق متبادلة أو منفعة متبادلة، ولكنها تمنح الحقوق لجميع الأفراد الموجودين في أراضيها. وقد ركزّ هذا البحث أساساً على نظام حماية اللاجئين من منظور الشريعة الإسلامية الذي تم تحليله بشكل نقدي في الفصل الخامس. وقد نجم عن ذلك الإحصائيات الصادمة التي أصدرتها مفوضية الأمم المتحدة لشؤون اللاجئين بأن ٥٥٪ من اللاجئين في العالم من ثلاث دول مسلمة فقط، ومن المفارقات أن معظم هؤلاء اللاجئين تستضيفهم الدول الإسلامية أيضاً. و على الرغم من أن الفقهاء المسلمين لم يضعوا قانون اللاجئين الإسلامي، فقد أثبتت هذه الدراسة أن الإسلام له تاريخ طويل في حماية اللاجئين والذي يسبق قانون اللاجئين الحديث. ففي القرن السادس، وضع الإسلام جميع المبادئ الأساسية لحماية اللاجئين، مثل مبادئ عدم الإعادة القسرية، والأمان والمستأمن (السلامة والحماية الشخصية)، والإدماج المحلى وتجنيس اللاجئين كحل دائم، ومفهوم وقف الهجرة (الهجرة ووضع اللاجئ)، في جملة امور.

APPROVAL PAGE

e thesis	of Student's Name has been approved by the following
	Abdul Ghafur Hamid @Khin Maung Sein Supervisor
	Abdul Haseeb Ansari Co-Supervisor
	Mohd. Yazid Zul Kepli Co-Supervisor
	Mohammad Naqib S/O Ishan Jan Internal Examiner
	Manoj Kumar Sinha External Examiner
	Hennie Strydom External Examiner
	Noor Mohammad Osmani Chairman

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own	investigations, except
where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been	en previously or concurrently
submitted for any other degrees at IIUM or other institu	utions.
SHABAN ABDUL MAJEED PHIRI	
Signature	Date

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

PROTECTING RIGHTS OF ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW: A CASE STUDY OF THE PRACTICE OF ZAMBIA

I declare that the copyright holder of this thesis/dissertation is jointly owned by the student and IIUM.

Copyright © Shaban Abdul Majeed Phiri and International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieved system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

By signing this form, I acknowledged that I have read and understand the IIUM Intellectual Property Right and Commercialization policy.

Affirmed by Shaban Abdul Majeed Phiri		
Signature	Date	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, all praise and thanks are due to Allah (SWT), my protector and provider, who endowed me with great wisdom and intellectual ability to write and successfully complete this thesis in a timely manner. Peace and blessings be upon His Messenger Muhammad (PBUH) and upon all his Companions and those who correctly pursued their legacy after them until the end of time.

Secondly, to my beloved and most caring family and the children, for your immeasurable love, sacrifice and patience; for the gift of your unwavering belief in my ability to accomplish this goal: I sincerely thank you from the deepest part of heart for such tremendous support, encouragement and sincere prayers, I really love you so much; you are inextricably inseparable part of this highest accolade of achievement. May Allah grant you His Mercy, forgiveness, blessings, best of health and prosperous life in this world and in the Hereafter.

My special appreciation and thanks go to my mentor and advisor, the Sheikh, Dr. Ahmad Totonji, the man behind this success, who has gloomed and supported me both financially, morally and spiritually throughout my life and for the successful completion of my LLM and this PhD degrees at this university (IIUM). May Allah grant you best health and prosperity in this world and in the Hereafter.

I wish to express my gratitude and thanks to the management and staff of IIIT for the financial support with special thanks to Sister SITI Aisyah BT Ibrahim for her good cooperation, understanding and caring. I will be forever grateful to all of you. May Allah bestow upon all of you His Mercy and blessings.

My special thanks and gratitude to my Supervisor, Professor, Dr. Abdul Ghafur Hamid, for guiding me step-by-step throughout my thesis writing and the Internal Examiner, Professor, Dr. Mohammad Naqib S/O Ishan Jan, and all the staff in the Department of the Deputy Dean (Research & Postgraduate) Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws, I thank you all most sincerely for the kind cooperation you rendered to me throughout my study. May Allah bless all of you.

To the Permanent Secretary (PS) the Ministry of Home Affairs, the Permanent Secretary (PS) (LD) the Ministry of Justice, the Commissioner of the Office of the Commissioner for Refugees (COR) and all the staff, the UNHCR, the Director IOM, the Refugees Community in Zambia and to my colleagues and leadership of Islamic Supreme Council of Zambia (ISCZ), I say, thank you for your support and encouragement. May Allah bless you all.

It is my utmost sincerity to dedicate this work to Allah (SWT) as Sadaqatu-al-Jariyah
to the Souls of my dearest parents for having nurtured me from childhood and taught
me the Qur'an. May Allah make their eternity in Jannatu-al-Firdaus.
the the gur un. May Main make their eternity in Januara-ar-1 tradus.
the the gur un. May Main make their elemity in Junuan-ur-1 tradus.
the the gur un. May Mair make their elemity in Jumuu-ui-1 truuus.
the the Qui un. May I make their elemity in Jumuu-ui-I truuus.
the the Qui un. May i make their elemity in Jumuu-ui-i i uuus.
the the Qui un. May i make their elemity in Jumuu-ui-1 truuus.
ine the Qui an. May Athan make then elemity in Januaria-ar-1 tradus.
the the Qui thi. May i make then element in summur-ti-i tradus.
ine the Qui an. May Main make then element in valuation-to-1 tradius.
ine the Qui un. May i Man make their eternity in Januara-ar-1 maans.
the the Qui an. Way Man make their element in January i
ine the Qui air. May Ashan make then eternity in Sannau-ai-1 tradus.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
APPROVAL PAGE	iv
DECLARATION	V
COPYRIGHT PAGE	
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
DEDICATION	viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ix
LIST OF TABLES	xiv
LIST OF CASES	
LIST OF STATUTES	
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION	
1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE RESEARCH	
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	
1.3 OBJECTIVES OF THE RESEARCH	
1.4 HYPOTHESIS	
1.5 SCOPE AND LIMITATION OF THE STUDY	
1.6 LITERATURE REVIEW	20
1.6.1. Who are the asylum seekers and what is their legal Status	
under international law?	
1.6.2. Does International Law recognise asylum seekers as protect	
persons under the 1951 Refugee Convention?	
1.6.3. Does Islamic Law Recognise Protection for Asylum Seeker	
cum-Refugees?	40
1.6.4. Whether Zambia has Adequate Legal Framework for the	
Protection of asylum Seekers and Refugees and its	
Implementation of the 1951 Refugee Convention	
1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
1.8 SUMMARY OF THE RESEARCH	
CHAPTER TWO	
THE LEGAL AND LEGULATORY FRAMEWORK FO	
PROTECTING ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES UNDI	
INTERNATIONAL LAW	
2.1 INTRODUCTION	
2.2 THE CONCEPT OF ASYLUM UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAY	
2.3 THE MEANING AND TYPES OF ASYLUM SEEKERS	
2.3.1 Definition of Asylum Seeker	
2.3.2 Kind of International Protection Available to Asylum Seeker	
2.4 VARIOUS TYPES OF ASYLUM SEEKERS	
2.4.1 Economic Migrants or Migrant Workers	
2.4.3 Victims of Natural Disasters and Armed Conflict	83
2.5 ASYLUM SEEKERS WHO FULFIL THE DEFINITION OF A REFUGEE	06
NEPUJEE	00

2.5.1 Inclusion Clauses	87
2.5.2 Cessation Clauses	88
2.5.3 Exclusion Clauses	90
2.6 THE CRITERIA OF ENTITLEMENT TO REFUGEE RIGHTS	
UNDER THE CONVENTION	91
2.7 EVALUATION	97
CHAPTER THREE	100
THE FUNDAMENTALRIGHTS AND FREEDOMS OF ASYLUM	
SEEKERS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	
3.1. INTRODUCTION	100
3.2 THE OBJECT AND PURPOSE OF THE 1951 REFUGEE	
CONVENTION	103
3.3 THE STATUS OF THE 1951 REFUGEE CONVENTION AND	
ITS 1967 PROTOCOL	107
3.4 SOME ESSENTIAL RIGHTS OF ASYLUM SEEKERS UNDER	
THE REFUGEE CONVENTION ACCORDING TO THE	100
DEGREE OF THEIR ATTACHMENT	
3.4.1. Their Rights Prior to, and During Status Determination	
3.4.2. Right of Asylum	
3.4.3. Right of Non-Expulsion and <i>Non-Refoulement</i>	
3.4.4. Right of Non-Penalisation or Punishment for Illegal Entry	
3.4.5. Right of Access to Food and Shelter	128
3.4.6. Right of Appeal against Rejection and Free Access to Courts	120
and Fair Trial	130
Torture	136
3.5 EVALUATION	
CHAPTER FOUR	
THE FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS OF REFUGEES) • 1 T 1
UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	141
4.1 INTRODUCTION	
4.2. RIGHTS OF REFUGEES UNDER THE REFUGEE	
CONVENTION	144
4.2.1 The Right to Identity Papers under Article 27	
4.2.2 Right to Travel Document under Article 28	
4.2.3 Right to Freedom of Movement under Article 26	
4.2.4 Right to Work under Article 17	
4.2.5 Right to Self-Employment under Article 18	165
4.2.6 Religious Freedom under Article 4	167
4.2.7. Right to Public Education under Article 22	
4.3. THE RIGHTS OF THE REFUGEE CHILD under crc	
4.3.1. Right to Civil Registration and Birth Certificate	179
4.3.2 The Right to Acquisition of Nationality	
4.3.3 Child's Right to Education	
4.3.4 Rights to Health-care and Socio-Economic Protection	
4.4 EVALUATION	
CHAPTER FIVE	
PROTECTION OF REFUGEES FROM ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE	
5.1 INTRODUCTION	192

5.2 A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE DEFINITION OF "HIJRAH"	
(EMIGRATION AND "MUHAJR" (REFUGEE) IN LIGHT OF	
THE PRESENT REFUGEE CRISIS	195
5.2.1 The Development of Refugee Law from the Events of <i>Al</i> -	
Hijrah	206
5.2.2 Humanitarian Character of Refugee Protection in Islam	
5.3 THE OBLIGATION TO SEEK AND TO GRANT ASYLUM IN	
ISLAM	216
5.4. A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE DICHOTOMY AND	210
APPLICABILITY OF THE CONCEPT OF AL-AMAN, AL-	
MUSTA'AMIN, AL-DHIMI AND AL-MUHAJR TO THE	220
REFUGEE SITUATION	220
5.5 APPLICABILITY OF ISLAMIC REFUGEE LAW TO PRESENT	
refugee situation	224
5.5.1 The Principle of Non-Refoulement and Refugee Status	
Determination	230
5.5.2 Obligations and Rights of Refugees in the Country of Asylum	235
5.5.3 Cessation of the Hijrah - انقطاع الهجرة	
5.5.4 Local Integration and Voluntary Repatriation	
5.6 EVALUATION	
CHAPTER SIX	
LEGAL AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK FOR THE	240
PROTECTION OF ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES IN ZAMBIA	248
6.1 INTRODUCTION	
6.2 BRIEF HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF REFUGEE SITUATION	<i>2</i> 40
	251
IN ZAMBIA	231
6.3 ZAMBIA'S OBLIGATION UNDER INTERNATIONAL	~
REFUGEE LAW AND HUMAN RIGHTS CONVENTIONS	
6.3.1 The 1951 Refugee Convention and its 1967 Protocol	
6.3.2 The Effect of Reservations to the 1951 Refugee Convention	
6.3.3 The ICCPR and other Human Rights Conventions	283
6.4 COMPATIBILITY OF ZAMBIA'S DOMESTIC LAWS WITH ITS	
INTERNATIONAL REFUGEE OBLIGATIONS AND	
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	287
6.4.1 The Constitution of the Republic of Zambia	289
6.4.2 The Refugees (Control) Act of 1970 and Refugees Act No.1	
of 2017	294
6.4.3 The Immigration and Deportation Act of 2010	
6.4.4 Judicial Authorities Applicable to Refugee Rights in Zambia	
6.5 CRITICAL ROLE OF UNITED NATIONS HIGH	300
COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (UNHCR) IN ZAMBIA	224
	324
6.6 COMPLEMENTARY ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL	220
ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (IOM) IN ZAMBIA	
6.7 EVALUATION	
CHAPTER SEVEN	340
A CRITICAL ASSESSMENT OF ZAMBIA'S PROTECTION OF	
ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES' RIGHTS	
7.1 INTRODUCTION	340

7.2 THE ROLE OF THE OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR	
REFUGEES (COR) iN the PROTECTION OF REFUGEEs	
UNDER THE REFUGEES ACT34	2
7.2.1. Eligibility of Status Determination and Registration Process of Asylum Seekers	١5
7.2.2. The Asylum Seeker's Right of Appeal and Legal	٥
Representation	2
7.2.3. Refugee Settlement Policy and its Compatibility with Human	_
Rights Standards35	7
7.3 A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF LEGAL CONSEQUENCES OF	,
CESSATION OF REFUGEE STATUS OF ANGOLANS AND	
RWANDANS AND THE NOTION OF VOLUNTARY	
REPATRIATION	a
7.3.1. Local Integration Process and Challenges of its	'
Implementation	Q
7.3.2. Resettlement and Settlement: Where is the Difference?	
7.4 SUGGESTIONS FOR REFORM	
7.4 SUGGESTIONS FOR REPORT 38	
CHAPTER EIGHT	
CONCLUSION	
8.1 RESEARCH FINDINGS	
8.1.1. Does International Law Recognise the Legal Status of	. 1
"Asylum Seekers" as "Refugees" Protected under 1951	
Refugee Convention?	2
8.1.2. Are there Fundamental Rights and Freedoms Accrued to	_
Asylum Seekers prior to Recognition under International	
Law?39	5
8.1.3. What are the Fundamental Rights and Freedoms Accrued to	J
Recognised Refugees under International law?39	ıΩ
8.1.4. To what extent does Islamic Law protect Asylum Seekers and	O
Refugees?	ıΩ
8.1.5. Is there any Adequate Legal and Regulatory Framework for	'U
the Refugees' Protection in Zambia?40	14
	'4
8.1.6. To what extent does Zambia Implement the 1951 Convention and other International and Regional Human Rights	
Conventions in Protecting Rights and Freedoms of Asylum	
Seekers and Refugees within its territory?40	16
8.2 RECOMMENDATIONS	
8.2 RECOMMENDATIONS	
BIBLIOGRAPHY41	
APPENDIX I: SCHEDULE OF INTERVIEWS43	.S
APPENDIX II: RESPONSE FROM THE MINISTRY OF JUSTICE,	U
ZAMBIA	2
APPENDIX III: REPORT ON INTERNSHIP FOR SHABAN A. PHIRI	4
CONDUCTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR	
REFUGEES (COR), MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS, LUSAKA AS A	
REQUIREMENT FOR THE COMPLETION OF PHD THESIS	
WRITING48	.5

APPENDIX I: SCHEDULE OF INTERVIEWS	436
APPENDIX II:RESPONSE FROM THE MINISTRY OF JUSTICE, ZAMBIA	
APPENDIX III: REPORT ON INTERNSHIP	485

LIST OF TABLES

Table No		Page
1.1	Refugee Population in Zambia	6
7.1	Statistics of Refugees by Settlements and Country of Origin	362

LIST OF CASES

AA v Secretary of State for the Home Department; LK v Secretary of State for the Home Department [2006] All ER (D) 176 (Apr); [2006] EWCA Civ 401, (Judgement of the Court of Appeal Division, 12 April 2006), (2006).

AH (Sudan) v Secretary of State for Home Department [2007] UKHL 49, [2008] 1 AC 278, [2008] 4 All ER 190, [2007] 3 WLR 832, [2007] Times 14 November, [2007] All ER (D) 218 (Nov), 2007.

Arse v Minister of Home Affairs and Others, [2010] (7) BCL 640 (SCA), (2010). Bahamboula and Others v Minister of Home Affairs and Others [2014] (9) BCLR 1021 (WCC); 2014 SACLR LEXIS 24, 9 (2014).

BHRC. Haitian Centre for Human Rights and Others v United States, 2 631 (1997). Bundesrepublik Deutschland v Kaveh Puid, The Court (Grand Chamber) [2013] CJEU 14.11.2013 C-4/11, (2013).

Christine Mulundika and Others v The People, (1995) SCZ, Appeal No.95.

Cimade and Groupe d'information et de soutien des immigrés (GISTI) v Ministre de L'Intérieur, de L'Outre-mer, des Collectivités territoriales et de I' Immigration, [CJEU 27.09.2012 C-179/11], (2012).

EHRR. Chahal v United Kingdom [1996] 23 Chahal v United Kingdom [1996] 23 EHRR 413, 23 413 (1996).

Esan v. Attorney General (2016) S.C.Z 225.

Hirsi Jamaa and Others v Italy Judgment, (2012).

Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000] 3 All ER 577 (UKHL, July 6, (2000).

In Re Chirwa (Edward Yapwantha), (1974).

In Re Radebe (972) Z.R. 298.

INS v Cardoza Fonseca 480 U.S., 421 (1987).

Ibrahim Mohamed Sheriff Noor v. Attorney General (1979) Z.R 183 (H.C).

International Court of Justice. "Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide Advisory Opinion of May 28th, 1951," 1951. Ireland v United Kingdom [1978] 2 EHRR 25.

Island of Palmas Case (The Netherlands v United States) 2 RIAA 829, (1928).

Jabari v Turkey [2000] ECHR 369, (2000).

Januzi v Secretary of State for the Home Department; Hamid v Secretary of State for the Home Department and other appeals, [2006]All ER (D) 183 (Feb), [2006] UKHL 5 (15 February 2006).

JH Rayner (Mincing Lane) v Department of Trade and Industry [1990]2 AC 418, 500, per Lord Oliver.

Joel Constantine Barnett v The Chief Immigration Officer and the Minister of Home Affairs and the Attorney General, (1983).

Kituo Cha Cheria v Attorney General [2014] 2 LRC 289.

Mifiboshe Walulya v. Attorney General (1984) ZR 89.

MK and Another v Secretary of State for the Home Department [2012] All ER (D) 114 (Jul), [2012] EWHC 1896, (2012).

NS v Secretary of State for Home Department (Amnesty International Ltd and the AIRE Centre) (Advice on Individual Rights in Europe UK); ME v Refugee Applications Commissioner (Amnesty International Ltd and the AIRE Centre(Advice on Individual

Rights in Eu, (2013).

Patel v. Attorney General (1993 -1994) Z.R 57 (HC).

R. "(On the Application of EM (Eritrea)) (Appellant) v Secretary of State for the Home Department (Respondent) [2014] UKSC 12.

R (On application of the Secretary of State for the Home Department v Chief Asylum Support Adjudicator, [2006] EWHC 3059 (Admin), [2006] All ER (D) 414 (Nov). Judgment Date: 30/11/2006, (2006).

R (On the Application of AW) v Croydon London Borough Council; R (On the Application of A, D and Y) v Hackney London Borough Council [2005] EWHC 2950 (Admin), [2006] LGR 159, [2005] All ER (D) (Dec) (Judgment Date: 16/12/2005), (2005).

Radebe v Attorney General [1973] Z.R. 237 (H.C.).

R v Secretary of State for Social Security, ex p joint Council for Welfare of Immigrants [1996] 4 All ER 385, [1997] 1 WLR 275, 29 HLR 129 [1996] NLJR 985.

Redmond – Bate v DPP [1999] BHRC 375, (1999).

Saad v United Kingdom [2008] All ER (D) 229 (Jan), ECtHR, App. No. 13229/03, (2008).

Soering v United Kingdom [1989] 11 EHRR 439.

SZOQQ v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship (2013) 251 CLR 577, 251 577 (2013).

The Attorney General (Appellant) v Roy Clarke (Respondent), (2004).

The Chief Immigration Officer, the Minister and the Attorney General (1983) Z.R 11 (H.C).

The International Court of Justice (ICJ). "Advisory Opinion on the Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons." ICJ Rep 226 (1996): 506.

The Law Association of Zambia v Attorney General, (2014).

The State of Washington; State of Minnesota, Plaintiffs-Appellees, v. Donald J.

Trump, President of the United States, No. 17-351 1–29 (2017).

Watchenuke and Another v Minister of Home Affairs and Others, (2004) (2) BCLR 120 (SCA), (2004).

Wemhoff v German 1 EHRR 55, 1 55 (1968).

LIST OF STATUTES

Constitution of the Republic of Zambia (Amendment)No.2 of 2016

Draft Bill of Immigration and Citizenship Act of UK, (published on 14 July 2008).

Employment (Amendment) Act, No.15 of 2015 of the Laws of Zambia.

Immigration and Deportation Act of 2010 of the Laws of Zambia.

Refugees (Control) Act of 1970 of the Laws of Zambia.

Refugees (Control) (Declaration of Refugees) Order of Statutory Instrument 240 of 1971 of the Laws of Zambia.

Refugees Act 130 of 1998 of the Laws of South Africa

The Citizenship Act Cap 124 of 2016 of the Laws of Zambia.

The Refugees Act, No.1 of 2017 of the Laws of Zambia.

The Stattute of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) of 1950.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHDEG07 African Charter on Democracy, Elections and Governance,

2007

ACHPR81 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981.

AU/OAU Refugee Convention Governing the Specific Aspects of Refugee

Convention 69 Problems in Africa, 1969

ALCCPCTR69 African Legal Consultative Committee, Principles Concerning

the Treatment of Refugees, 1969.

ACHRAP88 American Convention on Human Rights, Additional Protocol

1988.

ADRDM48 American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man 1948

CDHRI90 Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam.

CDRCIPR84 Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, Colloquium on the

International Protection of Refugees in Central America, Mexico and Panama Adopted by the Colloquium on the International Protection of Refugees in Central America,

Mexico and Panama, Held at Carta, 1984.

CSR51 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees 1951 PSR67 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees 1967.

CAT Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1984.

CERD65 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination, 1965

CEDAW79 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination

Against Women, 1979.

CRC89 Convention on the Right of the Child 1989.

GC48 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of

Genocide 1948.

CADE60 Convention Against Decrimination in Education,1960

DSPRC&P01 Declaration of States Parties to the 1951 Convention and / or

Its 1967 Protocol of 2001

DRD86 Declaration on the Right to Development,1986.

ECOSOC The United Nations Economic and Social Council

EUCPHR50 EU. Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and

Fundamental Freedoms, 1950

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

ExCom Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme ICCPR66 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 ICESCR66 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural

Rights, 1966

Inter-Am CHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICRMW90 International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All

Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, 1990.

IOM International Organization for Migration

IDP Interally Displaced People

HL House of Lords
HCZ High Court of Zambia
HCK High Court of Kenya
HCS High Court of South Africa

HRC Human Rights Commission HRCs Human Rights Committees

Organization of Islamic Cooperation, 1990. OIC Office the Commissioner for Refugees **COR** Respondent of Study Population RSP Supreme Court of Zambia SCZ Supreme Court of Kenya **SCK** Supreme Court of South Africa SCS United Kingdom House of Lords **UKHL** United Kingdom Supreme Court

Universal Declaration of Human Rights ,1948. UDHR48

UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights **UNESCO** United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization UNCESCR

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees UNHCR

United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian **OCHA**

Affairs.

UKSC

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE RESEARCH

This Chapter critically discusses the background of this research and provides the conceptual framework for international protection of rights of asylum seekers and refugees under the international law. This topic is selected primarily because of the untold sorrow of the present refugee crisis which has forcibly displaced 65.3 million people from their homelands, the on-going flagrant violation of rights of asylum seekers fleeing persecution and difficulties they experience in accessing international protection globally. Although there is a presumption that asylum seekers are not protected persons under the international law, this study has established that those asylum seekers fleeing persecution are subject of international protection under international law. This approach finds its expression in the UNHCR's struggle of securing international protection and rights of asylum seekers and refugees. Globally, the influx of asylum seekers has continued to deteriorate since the end of the Second World War.² It is believed that the effects of the current world refugee crises resulting from persecution, the on-going wars and atrocities around the global and particularly in the Middle-East, have more deleterious effects than of the Second World War. In fact, currently the Middle-East and African regions are more affected than Europe was

_

¹ UNHCR, "The Executive Committee of United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees' Programme (ExCom)" (Geveva: UNHCR, 1981), Conclusion Nos. 21 and 22 (XXXII, 1981), "Protection of Asylum Seekers in Situation of Large-Scale Influx" Conclusion on the International Protection of Refugees, adopted by the ExCom of UNHCR Programme, UN Doc. HCR/IP/Eng/REV.1991, p. 28-29. Currently there are 98 ExCom members as of October 2014 – October 2015, obtained from:www.unhcr.org/pages/49c3646c89.html, (accessed 10 September 2015. ²"UNHCR – Global Trends –Forced Displacement in 2014" (UNHCR, 2015), http://unhcr.org/556725e69.html.

in the post-World War II.³ To this end, it is unreservedly accepted that although the 1951 UN Refugee Convention was Euro-centric negotiated in the wake of World War II solely to protect European refugees specifically stated in Article 1A (2),⁴ the Convention is no longer a Euro-centric Refugee Convention. With the passage of the 1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees,⁵which removed the date-line and geographical limitation of its scope of application to events which occurred in Europe before 1 January 1951, both the Refugee Convention and its Protocol have acquired universal status as framework conventions for the protection for persons fleeing persecution and other traumatic events.⁶ In fact, this Refugee Convention and its Protocol are considered human rights framework conventions which set the minimum human rights standards which refugees should enjoy within the territories of the States Parties.

However, it is established that Syrian refugees are most affected people in the current refugee crises living under life-saving humanitarian assistance and in dare need of international protection.⁷ Thus, the Syrian refugees and the Rohingya Muslims from Myanmar are currently the most vulnerable people in serious need of urgent

-

³ Report published by Afro-Middle-East Centre (AMEC), "Brief No.12/2015 of 10 September, 2015" (AMEC, 2015). <Available on www.amec.org.za>.

⁴ United Nations, *Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees*, 1951, Text: 189 U.N.T.S 137, Adopted on 28 July 1951 and entered into force on 22 April 1954. Currently there are 145 States Parties to the Refugee Convention as of November 2015. Obtained from UNTC at: http://treaties.un.org/Pages/Treaties.aspx?id=5&subid=A&lang=en. (accessed 9th November 2015). United Nations, *Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees*, 1967, Text: 660 U.N.T.S. 267, Adopted on 31 January 1967 and entered into force on 4 October 1967. Currently there 146 States Parties to the Protocol as of April 2015. Obtained from UNTC at: http://treaties.un.org/Pages/Treaties.aspx?id=5&subid=A&lang=en. (accessed 9th November 2015).

⁶ Antonio Guterres, "The 1951 Refugee Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees and Its 1967 Protocol, 'The Legal Framework for Protecting Refugees" (Geveva: UNHCR, 2011), p.1.
7 3RP, "3RP Regional Refugees Report," 2015., pp.2.-4. < www.3rpsyriancrisis.org/wp-

⁷ 3RP, "3RP Regional Refugees Report," 2015., pp.2.-4. < www.3rpsyriancrisis.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/06/3RP-Progress-Report.pdf>. See also "UN High Commissioner for Refugees Antonio Guterres - Written Text of Speech to the UN Security Council - 26 February 2015," 2015, http://www.unhcr.org/print/54ef66796.html.

international protection.8 Conversely, there is an overtone of negative perception of refugees world-wide. Generally, refugees do not enjoy human rights and fundamental freedoms in most countries of asylum and particularly in developing countries. They are made a scapegoat and accused of causing monumental socio-economic and demographic changes to the countries of asylum. And yet it has been established that it is the actions of States which are responsible for refugee flows and forcible displacement.⁹ Mainly, because of the escalation of wars which immensely cause unbearable pain and suffering of asylum seekers and refugees globally. Countries which used to have flexible refugee policies, particularly industrialised countries, have now adopted more restrictive refugee policies which thwart international refugee protection. 10 For example, in the United States, several attempts have been made to enact laws to restrict the resettlement of refugees particularly those fleeing persecution from Syria and Iraq. 11 Although previous reports indicated that the Senate and national security experts during the Obama administration had rejected the enactment of such discriminatory laws, ¹² subsequent reports have shown that the Trump's administration regime is working tirelessly to prevent refugees from majority Muslim countries from seeking asylum in the United States.¹³

_

⁸ Abdul Ghafur Hamid and Shaban Abdul Majeed Phiri, "Protecting Asylum-Seekers Prior to Determination of Refugee Status: Reinterpreting the Refugee Convention and Assessing Contemporary State Practice on Non-Refoulement," *International Islamic University Malaysia Law Journal* 25, no. 1 (2017): 55-58.

⁹ Afro-Middle-East Centre (AMEC), "Brief No.12/2015 of 10 September, 2015." <Available on www.amec.org.za>.

¹⁰ Susan Kneebone, "Refugees and Displaced Persons: The Refugee Definition and 'humanitarian' Protection," in *Research Handbook on International Human Rights Law*, ed. Sarah Joseph and Adam McBeth (United Kingdom: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, 2010), 218.

¹¹ Brenda Bower Soder, "Human Rights First, Washington Week on Human Rights, International Human Rights, Inside the Beltway," 2015, (November 23, 2015).

¹² Ibid., (February 1, 2016).

¹³ Ibid., (March 20, 2017). See also Phiri, "Protecting Asylum-Seekers Prior to Determination of Refugee Status: Reinterpreting the Refugee Convention and Assessing Contemporary State Practice on Non-Refoulement," pp.52-53.

However, it is consternating to note that the current global refugee trend had reached 65.3 million of forcibly displaced people; while 21.3 million of these were recognised refugees as by the end of 2015 world-wide. The total of 16.1 million of these refugees is under the UNHCR mandate; while 5.2 million are Palestinian refugees registered with the UN Relief and Works Agency (UNRW). The UNHCR has reported that 86% of these refugees are hosted in developing countries with Turkey hosting the largest number of 2.5 million of refugees. Thus, Syria Arab Republic is reported to be the world largest producer of refugees.

The UNHCR has also released yet another shocking report that 54 % of the total world population of refugees is produced from three Muslim countries only. These are Syria Arab Republic with the highest number of 4.9 million refugees, followed by Afghanistan with 2.7 million and Somalia with 1.1 million refugees. ¹⁶ It is estimated that almost 51 % of these were children below the age of 18. ¹⁷ It is for this reason that Chapter Five has been considered as it discusses protection system of refugees from Islamic perspective. Thus, Chapter Five is quite relevant to this present study. It has critically investigated into Islamic principles relating to the protection for refugees and whether Muslims States conform to such Islamic principles in their asylum system of those asylum seekers and refugees in their territories.

By the beginning of 2003, Zambia had a total number of 250,000 refugees. This number has gradually dropped due to the on-going voluntary repatriation of

¹⁴ UNHCR, "Global Trends: Forced Displacement in 2015" (Geveva: UNHCR, 2015).<www.unhcr.org.uk/about-us/key-facts-and-figures.html> (accessed 31 March 2017).

UNHCR, "Global Trends: Forced Displacement in 2015" (Geveva: UNHCR, 2015).<www.unhcr.org.uk/about-us/key-facts-and-figures.html> (accessed 31 March 2017).

16 Ibid.

¹⁷ UNHCR, "'Global Trends: Forced Displacement in 2015," 2015.<. http://www.unhcr.org/figures-at-a-glance.html.>.

Angolan, Rwandan and Congolese refugees.¹⁸ Consequently, the current refugee population in Zambia is about 54, 261 as of November 2014 according to UNHCR Zambia Office. However, this number does not include the other 26, 542 of the former Angolan and Rwandan refugees who are still in Zambia for various reasons.¹⁹ These numbers are likely to have multiplied disproportionately due to the influx of hundreds of thousands of asylum seekers currently arriving in Zambia from Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC).²⁰ In addition, there is another estimate of more than 50,000 refugees believed to have self-integrated into the Zambian society of which neither the Government of Zambia nor the UNHCR have official record.²¹ The UNHCR Zambia Office has stated that refugees opted to by-pass *ProGres* data-base and self-integrated themselves into Zambian communities to avoid the wrath of "encampment policy" administered by the Government of Zambia discussed in Chapter Seven.²²

The Table below only represents the official refugee population in Zambia which was captured prior to the influx of new arrivals of refugees from DRC. Mainly, these refugees come from Angola, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Burundi, Rwanda and Somalia. Others come from Uganda, Sudan, Egypt, Libya, Iraq, Yemen and Syria.²³ Consequently, as discussed in Chapter Seven, all the 50,000 self-integrated refugees are presumed to be staying in Zambia illegally. For this reason, they are at heightened risk of becoming Stateless persons and susceptible to

_

¹⁸ Kelvin Shimoh and Muyeba Singumbe, "The History of Zambia and Refugees" (UNHCR, Zambia Office, 2007), 7.

¹⁹ UNHCR, "UNHCR Zambia Magazine, Issue No.5" (UNHCR, Zambia Office, 2015.), 28.

²⁰ Currently there is no official statistics of the total population of refugees in Zambia considering the mass exodus of refugees into Zambia from DRC as of 30th September 2017.

²¹ Mpho Makhema, "Mpho Makhema, 'Social Protection for Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC)', Social Protection & Labor, The World Bank, Discussion Paper No. 0906," 2009, p.13. <siteresources.worldbank.org/.../Resources/SP.../0906.pdf> (accessed 20 May 2015).

²² UNHCR, "Submission by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, For the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights' Compilation Report, Universal Periodic Review: Zambia," 2012, pp.3 -5.

²³ Kelvin Shimoh and Muyeba Singumbe, "The History of Zambia and Refugees," pp.2-5.