## LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND STRUCTURE OF COMMUNITY MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA: A PROPOSAL

BY

## HANNA BINTI AMBARAS KHAN

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Law

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Malaysia

FEBRUARY 2017

#### **ABSTRACT**

Community mediation is an extremely beneficial programme that enables the people to solve their neighbourhood problems within the community, without the hassle of bringing the matter to court. Under the Department of National Unity and Integration (DNUI), Malaysia has initiated a community mediation programme, however, it is without a proper legal framework or organisational structure, hence the DNUI and the community mediators faced many challenges such as no governing law, proper place to conduct mediation sessions and lack of continuous training. Ho Kek Hwa (2009) highlights the challenges faced by the DNUI. A proper institutionalised community mediation would, on the other, ensure effectiveness of the programme besides offering many other advantages to the nation. Thus, to streamline the practice of community mediators in Malaysia, a legal framework and a proper organisational structure of an institutionalised community mediation programme is necessary. One of the objectives of this study is to examine the current practice of community mediation in East and West Malaysia, Singapore and Kerala, India. Major part of the study is focused towards the proposal of a legal framework and organisational structure of community mediation in Malaysia with the intention to institutionalise the programme. A qualitative legal research has been conducted on the current practice of community mediation in Malaysia, Singapore and India. A hundred and seventy five (175) respondents comprising of directors and officers of DNUI, judges of high court and native courts, Penghulu (headman), professional mediators, community mediators Tetangga (Peaceful Neighbourhood) committee interviewed. The findings of this study reveal that the current community mediation programme needs to be revamped and regulated. This study further proposes a new Malaysian Community Mediation Act 2015. Overall, this study is a notable solution to the dispute solving mechanism in Malaysia and a significant contribution to the existing literature on community mediation in Malaysia.

## ملخص البحث

يعد الإصلاح المجتمعي من البرامج ذات الأهمية القصوى التي تسمح لأفراد المجتمع بحل مشكلاتهم في مجتمعاتهم المحلية دون الحاجة إلى التدخل أو المشاحنة والوصول إلى المحاكم. تحت وحدة الوطنية المدمجة المتكاملة (DNUI) أنشئت ماليزيا برنامجا للإصلاح المجتمعي، ولكن هذا البرنامج لا يحتوى على هيكلة قانونية ولا تشكيل منظّمي بعد، لهذه الأسباب فإن (DNUI) يواجه العديد من التحديات مثل عدم وجود قانون خاص به، وعدم توافر أماكن مخصصة لجلسات الإصلاح إو التوسط كما أن البرنامج يفتقر للتدريب المناسب والمتواصل فيه. أشار هو كيك هوا (HO KEK HWA,2009) إلى التحديات التي تواجه (DNUI) من ناحية، ومن جهة أخرى فإن أهمية وجود تأسيس وتنظيم، يؤكد ويضمن فعالية عالية للبرنامج بجانب طرح العديد من الامتيازات الأخرى للشعب. وبالتالي، يحقق تنظيم ممارسة برنامج الإصلاح المجتمعي في ماليزيا، لهذا فمن المهم وجود هيكلية قانونية ومؤسسية للسماح لهذا البرنامج بتحقيق الأهداف المرجوة منه. من أهم أهداف هذه الدراسة، هو فحص الممارسة الموجودة حاليا للإصلاح المجتمعي في شرق وغرب ماليزيا، سنغافورة ومدينة كيرلا في الهند. كذلك تسعى هذه الدراسة على التركيز نحو طرح هيكل قانوني وتنظيمي للإصلاح المجتمعي في ماليزيا بغرض تأسيس البرنامج. وقد تم بحث قانوني ونوعى لدراسة وفهم ممارسة الإصلاح المجتمعي المتبعة حاليا في المجتمع بماليزيا، سنغافورة والهند. مئة وخمس وسبعون استجابة متمثلة في مدراء ومسؤولون من (DNUI)، وقضاة للمحاكم العليا والمحاكم المحلية، ووسطاء مختصون ومصلحون محليون، ورؤساء مجتمعات محلية سلمية، تمت مقابلتهم وأخذ آرائهم. أما النتائج التي تم التوصل إليها من خلال هذه الدراسة فقد أوضحت أن برنامج الإصلاح المجتمعي الحالي يحتاج إلى التطوير ووضعه في إطار قانوني. عموما، فإن هذه الدراسة تقترح قانونا جديدا للإصلاح المجتمعي في ماليزيا ٢٠١٥ خصوصا إن هذه تقنية توفر حلا للمشكلات والخلافات المحلية في ماليزيا بالإضافة إلى أثراء المعلومات والمادة الأدبية الموجودة حول الإصلاح المجتمعي في ماليزيا.

## APPROVAL PAGE

Nora Binti Abdul Hak Supervisor	
Farheen Baig Sardar Baig Co-Supervisor	
Internal Examiner	
External Examiner	
External Examiner	

Chairperson

## **DECLARATION**

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of my of	own investigation, except
where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been p	previously or concurrently
submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other	institutions.
Hanna Binti Ambaras Khan	
Signature	Date

#### INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

# DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

# LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND STRUCTURE OF COMMUNITY MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA: A PROPOSAL

I declare that the copyright holder of this dissertation are jointly owned by the student and IIUM.

Copyright © 2017 Hanna Binti Ambaras Khan and International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieved system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

By signing this form, I acknowledged that I have read and understand the IIUM Intellectual Property Right and Commercialization policy.

Affirmed by Hanna Binti Ambaras Khan	
Signature	Date

### For

Ambaras Khan B. Rahim Khan &

Bibi Zaitoon Bt. Mian Gul and

Rahela, Hasanah, Aminulla, Nur Hafiza and Khairah.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

If you should count the favours of Allah, you could not enumerate them. All praises belong to Allah alone, and blessings and peace be upon the Prophet Muhammad (p.b.u.h).

The journey of completing this thesis is the best journey of my life. I have wonderful experiences and meet great people. I owe gratitude to all those people who have made this thesis possible.

I would like to express my deep and sincere gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Nora Abdul Hak, who has tremendously mentored, supervised and motivated me, and my co-supervisors Assoc. Prof. Dr. Farheen Baig Sardar Baig for her encouragement, invaluable comments and constant supports. I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Mushera Ambaras Khan, Prof. Dr. Ainul Jaria Maidin, Prof. Haseeb Ansari, Prof. Waleed Fekri Faris, and Asst. Prof. Dr. Umar Aimhanosi Oseni for their academic supports regular advice throughout my studies in IIUM. My sincere thanks to Assoc. Prof. Zaharah Elias (UITM) for her precious time and advise and Dr. Hamimah Hamzah for her encouraging words.

In completing this thesis I have received assistance from several people at Department of National Unity and Integration (DNUI). I would, therefore, like to offer my sincere thanks to all of them. My gratitude to Dato Azman Amin B Hassan, former Director General of DNUI, Dato Gandesan Letchumanan, Director General of DNUI, En Zulkifli Hashim, Director of Management Unity, Putrajaya, En. Roslan Seman, Assistant Director of Management Unity, Putrajaya, En Ho Kek Hua, Director of National Integration Research and Training Institute, DNUI, Pn Naizarina Isa, Cik Liew, Puan Ruzylawati Binti Mustpha Kamar and all the staffs who have assisted me directly and indirectly in reaching out community mediators in Malaysia for interview sessions and gave me the opportunities to train community mediators in West and East Malaysia in 2014 & 2015. My special thanks to Dato Khutubul Zaman Bukhari, President of Malaysian Mediation Centre, Mr. Anil Xavier, President of Indian Institute of Arbitration and Mediation, En. Rimin Sandah, President of Sabah Community Mediator Association, En. Mustapah Kamal, President of Malaysian Community Mediator Association and Pn. Fadlilawati Masran, President of Johor Community Mediator Association.

My appreciation to the Ministry of Higher Education for granting me scholarship under the MyBrain15 project which had been a great help for me to complete my study. My thanks to my beloved friends, Raini Hassan who always be there for me; Hazera Hameed, Mahfuz Sanyang, Khalid Ansari, Sharifah Nur Jehan, Izzatie Seraj, Nur Farahin A'skiah bt Abdul Hamid and Ali Musa Harahap, and many others for their advice, constant supports and encouragement.

My whole hearted appreciation to my parents for the love, care, encouragement, prayers and continuous support. My deepest gratitude to my siblings; Saira, Mushera, Zaheera, Zakir, Zahir and Zahid for everything that they

compromised to ensure my well-being, all their assistance for the past five years, all the exceptions and exemptions from fulfilling my duty towards my family for the sake of community mediation research and for their prayers, understanding and support of my passion towards mediation. Last but not least, my gratitude to each and every person who assist, help, support, encourage and pray for me in writing this thesis.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstracti	i
Abstract in Arabicii	ii
Approval Pagei	V
Declarationv	
Copyrightv	⁄i
Dedicationv	
Acknowledgementsv	/iii
List of Tablesx	
List of Figuresx	
List of Statutesx	
List of Abbreviationsx	
	. , 111
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	
1.0 Introduction	
1.1 Background of the Study	
1.2 Statement of Problem9	
1.2 Statement of Froblem 1.3 Research Questions 1.3	
1.4 Objectives of the Study	
1.5 Literature Review	
1.6 Scope and Limitations	
1.7 Research Methodology	
1.7.1 Sampling	
1.7.2 Data Collection	
1.7.2.1 Interview	
1.7.3 Observation	
1.7.3.1 Mediation Courses	
1.7.3.2 Mediation Session	
1.8 Structure of the Thesis	
1.9 Conclusion	28
CHAPTER TWO: THE THEORETICAL CONCEPT OF COMMUNITY	
MEDIATION3	30
2.0 Introduction	30
2.1 Alternative Dispute Resolution ("ADR")	31
2.1.1 Definition and Types of ADR	31
2.1.2 Disadvantages of Litigation	
2.2 Mediation 3	34
2.2.1 Definition of Mediation	35
2.2.2 Mediation Process	
2.2.3 Roles of Mediators	
2.3 The Foundation of Community Concept	
2.3.1 The Concept of Community Mediation	
2.3.2 The Concept of Traditional Community Mediation	
2.3.3 Institutionalised Community Mediation	
	1 <del>9</del>

2.4.1 Community Mediator	49
2.4.2 Community Mediation Centre	
2.4.3 Community Mediation Process	
2.4.4 Scope of Community Mediation	
2.4.5 Models or Approaches of Community Mediation	
2.5 The Significance of Community Mediation	
2.6 Conclusion	
CHAPTER THREE: COMMUNITY MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA: THE	
LAW AND PRACTICE	
3.0 Introduction	62
3.1 The Practice of Traditional Dispute Resolution in Pre and Post-	
Colonial Period	
3.1.1 Peninsula Malaya / West Malaysia	
3.1.1.1 The Malays	
3.1.1.2 The Chinese	
3.1.1.3 The Indians	
3.1.1.4 Orang Asli (Aborigine)	
3.1.2 East Malaysia	
3.1.2.1 Sabah/Borneo	
3.1.2.2 Sarawak	82
3.2 The Practice of Community Mediation in Malaysia after	
Independence	
3.2.1 West Malaysia	
3.2.1.1 The Institution of Penghulu	
3.2.1.2 Community Mediation	
3.2.2 East Malaysia	
3.2.2.1 Sabah	
3.2.2.2 Sarawak	
3.3 Conclusion	102
CHAPTER FOUR: THE PRACTICE OF COMMUNITY MEDIATION	
IN INDIA AND SINGAPORE	104
4.0 Introduction.	
4.1 India	
4.1.1 Traditional Dispute Resolution in India	
4.1.1.1 Panchayat	
4.1.1.2 Panchayati Raj	
4.1.2 Alternative Dispute Resolution in India	
4.1.3 Community Mediation in India	
4.1.3.1 Indian Institute of Arbitration & Mediation (IIAM),	
Kerala	111
4.1.3.2 Conflicts Handled by the IIAM CMS	114
4.1.3.3 Mediation Process	115
4.1.3.4 IIAM CMS's Mediator	
4.1.4 Training and Accreditation of IIAM CMS's Mediators	117
4.1.5 The IIAM Community Mediation Service's Organisation	
Structure	
4.1.6 Funding of IIAM CMS's Mediation Clinic	123

4.1.7 The Governing Rules for Community Mediation Programme	
4.1.8 The Challenges and Effort taken by IIAM	124
4.1.8.1 Awareness Programme	124
4.1.8.2 Education Programmes	124
4.1.8.3 Lack of Promotion to Public and Legal Practitioners	125
4.1.9 The Achievement of IIAM CMS Mediation Clinic	126
4.2 Singapore	126
4.2.1 Nature of Community Mediation	127
4.2.2 The Practice of Community Mediation in Singapore	128
4.2.2.1 Conflicts Handle by the CMC	
4.2.2.2 Mediation Process	130
4.2.2.3 Community Mediator	135
4.2.3 Training and Accreditation of Mediators	
4.2.3.1 Training of Mediators	
4.2.3.2 Accreditation of Mediators	141
4.2.4 The Singapore Community Mediation Centre's Structure and	
Its Development	
4.2.5 Funding of Community Mediation Centre	149
4.2.6 The Laws that Govern Community Mediation Centre	
4.2.7 The Challenges	
4.2.7.1 Lack of Singaporeans' Awareness	151
4.2.7.2 One Party Refused to Join Mediation Session	
4.2.8 The Achievement of the Community Mediation Centre	
4.2.8.1 Increased in Number of Cases Mediated	154
4.3 Conclusion	156
7.5 Conclusion	100
7.5 Conclusion	150
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY	150
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY	157
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	<b> 157</b> 157
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	<b>157</b> 157 157
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	<b>157</b> 157 157
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 157
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 157 159 160
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 157 159 160
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 160
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 160 162 168
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 160 162 168
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172 172
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172 172 181 181
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY  MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 172 172 178 181 188 191
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY  MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 172 172 178 181 188 191
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY  MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172 172 181 181 181 191 200
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY  MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172 172 181 181 188 191 200 203
CHAPTER FIVE: THE NEED TO ESTABLISH COMMUNITY  MEDIATION CENTRE IN MALAYSIA	157 157 159 160 162 168 172 172 181 181 188 191 200 203 203

CHAPTER SIX: THE PROPOSED LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND STRUCTURE FOR COMMUNITY MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA	212
6.1 Legal Framework for Community Mediation in Malaysia	
6.1.1 Subject Matters	
6.1.2 Mediators	
6.1.2.1 Mediators' Selection	
6.1.2.2 Mediators Qualification	
6.1.2.3 Mediators Training	
6.1.2.4 Mediators Accreditation	
6.1.3 Ethical Standard and Conduct	
6.1.3.1 Impartiality	224
6.1.3.2 Coercion	
6.1.3.3 Competence	226
6.1.3.4 Confidentiality	227
6.1.3.5 Termination of Mediation	227
6.1.3.6 Conflict of Interest	228
6.1.3.7 Marketing, Publicity and Advertising	228
6.1.3.8 Compensation and Gift	228
6.1.4 Community Mediation Process	
6.1.4.1 First Stage: Pre-Mediation	
6.1.4.2 Second Stage: Mediation Process	
6.1.4.3 Third Stage: Agreement	
6.1.4.4 Fourth Stage: Post-Mediation	
6.1.5 Co-Mediation	
6.1.6 Shuttle Mediation	
6.2 Organisation Structure of Community Mediation in Malaysia	236
6.2.1 Proposed Malaysian Community Mediation Centre	
("MCMC") Organisation Structure	
6.2.2 Funding	
6.2.3 Proposed Outreach and Awareness Programme	
6.2.4 Training Module Framework	
6.3 Proposed Legal Framework	
6.4 Conclusion	257
CHAPTER SEVEN: COMMUNITY MEDIATION IN ISLAM	258
7.0 Introduction.	
7.1 Amicable Settlement and Mediation	
7.1.1 Mediation Prior to Islam	
7.1.2 Mediation in Islam	264
7.1.2.1 Authorities of Mediation in the Qur'an	265
7.1.2.2 Authorities of Mediation from the Tradition of	
Prophet Muhammad and his Companions	267
7.2 The Concept of Community Mediation in Islam	
7.3 The Important Elements and Principles of Community Mediation in	1
Islam	
7.4 Conclusion	280

<b>CHAPTER EIG</b>	HT: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	282
	uction	
8.1 Summ	nary	283
	rch Findings	
	Major Findings	
	8.2.1.1 Governing Laws	
	8.2.1.2 Community Mediation Centre	294
	8.2.1.3 Structure of Community Mediation	295
	8.2.1.4 Practicability to Establish Community Mediation	
	Programme in East Malaysia	296
	8.2.1.5 Training	
	Findings	
	8.2.2.1 Effectiveness of Programme	
	8.2.2.2 Awareness Programme	298
	8.2.2.3 Non-practicing Mediators	
	8.2.2.4 Mediators are not Computer Literate	
	8.2.2.5 Community Mediation Scope	
	8.2.2.6 Funding	
	8.2.2.7 Mediation Model or Approaches	
	8.2.2.8 Rukun Tetangga Committee Members	
	8.2.2.9 Inclusion of Penghulu in Community Mediation	
	Programme	302
8.3 Recon	nmendations	
8.4 Implic	eations for Further Research	306
_	usion	
BIBLIOGRAPH	IY	310
ADDENIDATE		
APPENDIX I	MEDIATION CERTIFICATE GRANTED TO THE	
	RESEARCHER FOR ATTENDING MEDIATION	225
A DDENIDIN II	COURSES	527
APPENDIX II	INVITATION LETTER AND SCHEDULE OF	222
	TRAINING CONDUCTED BY THE RESEARCHER	333

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 5.1	Cases Handle by Community Mediators in East Malaysia	167
Table 5.2	Cases Handle by Community Mediators in West Malaysia	171

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1	The Position of Community Mediation and <i>Rukun Tetangga</i> in the Department of National Unity and Integrity Organisation Chart	91
Figure 3.2	The Hierarchy of the Native Court of Appeal in Sabah	96
Figure 3.3	The Hierarchy of the Native Court of Appeal in Sarawak	101
Figure 4.1	The Structure of IIAM CMS	119
Figure 4.2	The Structure of Mediation Clinic of IIAM CMS	122
Figure 4.3	Mediation Session	131
Figure 4.4	Pre-Court Referral Arrangement	132
Figure 4.5	Post- Court Referral Arrangement	133
Figure 4.6	Organisation Structure of CMC in 2002/2003	146
Figure 4.7	Organisation Structure of CMC in 2005/2006	147
Figure 4.8	Organisation Structure of CMC in 2011/2012	148
Figure 4.9	Organisation Structure of CMC in 2012/2013	149
Figure 6.1	Proposed Organisation Structure of Malaysian Community Mediation Centre	239

#### LIST OF STATUTES

73rd Indian Constitutional Amendment Act 1992 (India)

Aboriginal Peoples Act 1954 (Act 134) (Malaysia)

Arbitration & Conciliation Act, 1996 (India)

Code of Civil Procedure 1908 (India)

Community Mediation Centres Act 1997 (Chap 49), Act 10 of 1997 (Singapore)

Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973

Federal Constitution 1957 (Malaysia)

Indian Arbitration Act 1899 (India)

Legal Services Authority Act 1987 (India)

Mediation Act 2012 (Act 749) (Malaysia)

Native Courts (Practice and Procedure) Rules 1995 (Malaysia)

Native Court Enactment 1992 (Enactment No. 3 of 1992) (Malaysia)

Native Courts Ordinance 1992 (En. No. 3 of 1992) (Malaysia)

Peaceful Neighbour Regulation 1975 (PU (A)279/75) (Malaysia)

Rukun Tetangga Act 2012 (Act 751) (Malaysia)

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADR Alternative Dispute Resolution CMC Community Mediation Centre CMU Community Mediation Unit

DNUI Department of National Unity and Integrition
DPM Dispute Prevention and Management services

Etc. And so forth

IIAM CMS IIAM Community Mediation Service

IIAM Indian Institute of Arbitration and Mediation IKLIN Institut Kajian dan Latihan Integrasi Nasional

(National Integration Research and Training Institute)

IMIInternational Mediation InstituteIMYCMinistry Committee on Youth CrimeIPOSIntellectual Property Office of SingaporeIPTOInsolvency and Public Trustee's OfficeKANKetua Anak Negeri (The Chief of Native)KLRCAKuala Lumpur Regional Centre for Arbitration

LAB Legal Aid Bureau

MMC Malaysian Mediation Centre

Nafcm National Associate for Community Mediation

NYC National Youth Council

QAP Qualifying Assessment Programme SCMC Singapore Community Mediation Centre

SLA Singapore Land Authority USA United States of America

#### **CHAPTER ONE**

#### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.0 INTRODUCTION

This chapter examines the preliminary issue in this research beginning with the concept of mediation and community mediation and the practice of mediation in Singapore, Australia and Malaysia in the first section. This is followed by the research questions, objectives of the study, the hypothesis, literature review, scope and limitation, research methodology and structure of the thesis. The research questions identify scope posing the central question guiding this study. The objectives in the third part of the chapter are significant in showing the direction of this study and the tasks that the researcher needs to undertake. The section on scope and limitation sets the extent or boundaries of the research. The research methodology explains how the research is carried out to answer the research question. It focuses on the research design, the approach to take in the necessary direction of the research. Finally, the outline of this research in 8 chapters will be summarised in the structure of this thesis within.

Community mediation, a process to resolve conflicts within a community has been widely practised in developed and developing countries, Singapore has established the practise of community mediation since 1998. The drawbacks of litigation and the excellence result of community mediation processes are the reasons for the practitioner to embrace the mediation practise. Malaysia promotes harmony life and tries her best to provide the same to her citizens. For example, the establishment of the Department of National Unity and Integration ("DNUI") with the

mission to increase and strengthen unity and societal harmony; is one of the efforts of the Malaysian Government in ensuring the citizens live a peaceful life. The Department has initiated many programmes in its effort to promote unity and integration in this country. *Rukun Tetangga* (Peaceful Neighbourhood) is one of the programmes. Under *Rukun Tetangga*, a Community Mediation pilot project was initiated in 2008. However, there is no specific rules and regulation governing this practice specifically, no administrative centre to conduct the mediation session and no proper training given to the mediators. It is essential to ensure that Malaysia has an effective institution that could resolve disputes between its citizens from different races, ethnicities, religion and culture as well as to maintain the current peace.

This thesis studies the current practice in Malaysia and the selected jurisdiction i.e., India and Singapore, and thereafter suggests the best legal framework and administrative structure for Malaysian community mediation. The followings are the detail of this introductory chapter.

#### 1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Mediation is one of the methods of the alternative dispute resolution (ADR).<sup>1</sup> It is a process that uses a third party (a neutral party to the conflict), known as the mediator, to clarify communicate between the parties on their positions.<sup>2</sup> There are many definition of mediation. For example according to Liebmann,

Mediation is a process by which an impartial third party helps two (or more) disputants work out how to resolve a conflict. The disputants, not

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Syed Khalid Rashid, "The Importance of Teaching and Implementing ADR in Malaysia", *Industrial Law Report*, Vol. 1 (2000): i. *Current Law Journal Online*, <a href="http://www.cljlaw.com">http://www.cljlaw.com</a> viewed on 21 October, 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> David A. Hardcastle, Patricia R. Powers, Stanley Wenocur, *Community Practice: Theories and Skills for Social Workers*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition, 2011) at 286.

the mediators, decide the terms of any agreement reached. Mediation usually focuses on future rather than past behaviour. <sup>3</sup>

ADR has religious roots, namely in the three main monotheistic religions, Judaism, Christianity and Islam, that apply ADR to resolve conflicts among their followers.<sup>4</sup> In Islam, *waṣaṭa* is the common term for mediation which means a benevolent and non-binding procedure to end a dispute<sup>5</sup>. For centuries mediation has been the traditional method of settling disputes within the Arab world. In many urban societies in the Middle East, the problems were often resolved by the elders in a community meeting since there was no formal court mechanisms designed for that purpose.<sup>6</sup> The community meeting process serves as a vital function in the local community in the Middle East is community mediation. It plays the same role as community mediators.

Community mediation is a method that applies the mediation process to resolve conflicts between persons within the same community and may be applied to resolve disputes occur in the workplace or with local organizations, such as health practices, and local council authorities.<sup>7</sup>

Community mediation is not a new method of dispute resolution in Malaysia. It has been practised by the Malays long time ago without them realising it. Wall and Callister (1999) in enlightening the practise of dispute resolution in Malaysia explain

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Marian Liebmann, 'Community and Neighbour Mediation, (Great Britain: Cavendish Publishing Limited, 1998) at 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See G. Sofia Avilova, "Attaining Democracy in Georgia: Using Mediation to Rescue Georgia's Democratic Transformation", *Michigan State Journal of International Law*, Vol. 17 (2008-2009): 465 – 490 at 476 LexisNexis <via: http://www.lexis-nexis.com/terms/general/> (accessed on 28 January, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Said Bouheraoua, "Foundations of Mediation in Islamic Law and Its Contemporary Application" in Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan, Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed (eds.) *Mediation in Malaysia: The Law and Practice*, (Kuala Lumpur: LexisNexis, 2010) at 387.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Cheri M Ganeles, "Cybermediation: A New Twist on and Old Concept", Albany Law Journal of Science & Technology, Vol. 12 (2002): 715 LexisNexis <via: http://www.lexis-nexis.com/terms/general/> (accessed on 28 January, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Loukas A. Mistelis. "ADR in England and Wales", *The American Review of International Arbitration*, Vol. 12 (2001): 167 LexisNexis <via: http://www.lexis-nexis.com/terms/general/> (accessed on 28 January, 2011).

that the conflicts in the cities in Malaysia were either tolerated, managed or required police intervention. But, in the villages, the members of the community adopted different approach to resolve dispute. The disputes normally will be reported to the village administrator (*Ketua Kampung*) or to the religious mosque leader, an *Imam*.<sup>8</sup> The ethnics of India and Chinese are also familiar with mediation as dispute resolution in solving problems within their community. G Raman (1998) states that the Indians and Chinese resolved their disputes through mediation by elders of the community, clans or guilds prior to the introduction of English common law.<sup>9</sup>

In Australia, mediation has developed through government financing and non-government financing. There are numerous community mediation centres that address both small civil and neighbourhood disputes. For example, in South Australia, the Government has established Australian Community Legal Centres under the territory council to operate Southern Community Justice Centre. The purpose of this Southern Community Justice Centre is to provide free legal assistance, court representation (in some cases) and/or referral in many areas of law to people, simultaneously function as operator of Community Mediation Services with the objectives to assist the people with their neighbourhood disputes. 11

In Singapore, the Ministry of Laws has established the Community Mediation Centre under the Community Mediation Unit.<sup>12</sup> The Community Mediation Centres

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> James A Wall & Ronda Roberts Callister, "Malaysian Community Mediation," vol. 43 (1999) *Journal of Conflict Resolution* at 345.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> G. Raman, *Probate and Administration in Singapore and Malaysia: Law and Practice*, (Singapore: LexisNexis, 2005) at 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See Cheri M Ganeles, "Cybermediation: A New Twist on and Old Concept," vol. 12 (2002), *Alb. L.J. Sci. & Tech* at 715 LexisNexis <via: http://www.lexis-nexis.com/terms/general/> (accessed on 28 January, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Government of South Australia http://www.sa.gov.au/government/entity/1741/2009 (accessed on 30 January, 2011); Legal Services Commission of South Australia http://www.lawhandbook.sa. gov.au/print/ ch25s12.php/2011 (accessed on 30 January, 2011).

Ministry of Laws, Singapore Government http://app2.mlaw.gov.sg/AboutMinLaw/WhatMinLawDoes/CommunityMediation/tabid/243/Defaul ult.aspx/2009 (accessed on 30 January, 2011).

were set up by the Ministry of Law to resolve social and relational conflicts amicably through mediation. The Singapore Community Mediation Centres Act (Chapter 49A) provides for the establishment and operation of the Community Mediation Centre. The Act came into force in January 1998 and shortly after it was enforced, Singapore's first Community Mediation Centre was officially opened in November 1998. The Ministry of Law supervises the Community Mediation Centres and remains an active promoter of mediation and ADR. 14

Singapore and many other countries have established community mediation. Centres or institutions as early as from the 1970's. Malaysia may look at their experience to structure a Malaysian model. The reasons to adopt ADR process i.e., mediation and to propose a legal framework and a structure of community mediation in Malaysia is to increase access to justice for disadvantaged groups, enhance the community's involvement in the dispute resolution process and further strengthening social stability and forging a civil society. It is important for the Government to provide an avenue to the Malaysian in resolving disputes at the community level that could promote integration and avoid polarisation considering the nature of the community i.e. multi-races, multi-ethnics and multi-cultural.

The advantages of mediation attracted people to apply this method such as less expensive and generally more personal in nature enables a poorer party to spend less money.<sup>16</sup> It is a recent innovation that is speedier, more humane and less expensive

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Community Mediation Centre, Singapore Government http://www.spf.gov.sg/epc/procedures/purviewotheragencies.htm/2010 (accessed on 30 January, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See Loong Seng Onn, Singapore Academy of Law, http://www.Singaporelaw.sg/content/Mediation.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See Aida Othman. "Introducing Alternative Dispute Resolution In Malaysia: Prospects and Challenges" vol. 2, (2002), Malayan Law Journal Article. ccxxiv.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> See Avilova, n. 4. at 486.

alternatives to the court, and the citizens could receive a more expeditious and selfgenerated process to justice.<sup>17</sup>

The outcome of mediation is a win-win situation, whilst in litigation there will be a losing party which results might cause the disputants to hate each other and afterward cause irreparable damage of their relationship. In mediation both parties share the same focus i.e., to settle the dispute or solve their problem rather than to defeat each other. On the contrary, mediation by its nature of informality and mutuality is designed to reduce both economic and the emotional cost of dispute settlement. The stress and emotional cost of litigation might create conflicts in the personal life and community relations, especially if the case involves disputants from different ethnicities and religion.<sup>18</sup>

Mediation will encourage a more participatory or democratic society by educating and changing peoples' modes of communication or methods of resolving disputes. People involved in a conflict are encourage to look at conflict as an opportunity to improve their situation, families, communities and society as a whole. According to Sir Lawrence Street (1997), the proper place for mediation mechanism is within the community justice centre that establish by the legislation for resolving interpersonal frictions that unavoidably arise within local communities. Hence, the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Karen Grover Duffy, "Introduction to Community Mediation Program: Past, Present and Future" in Karen Grover-Duffy, James. W. Grosch, Paul. V. Olczak (Eds). *Community Mediation: A Handbook for Practitioners and Researchers*, (New York: Guilford Press, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, 1991) at 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Laurence Boulle, Teh Hwee Hwee, *Mediation Principles Process Practice*, (Butterworth Asia, 2000) at 31; *See* Lee Hun Hoe, "Alternative Methods of Dispute Settlements" vol. 1 (1987) Current *Law Journal 423*; *See* Joseph P. Folger, Robert A. Baruch Bush, *The Promise Of Mediation: The Transformative Approach To Conflict*, (John Wiley & Son, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, 2004) at 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See Thomas J Moyer. "Mediation as a Catalyst for Judicial Reform in Latin America", vol. 18 (2003) Ohio State Journal on Dispute Resolution 619 LexisNexis <via: http://www.lexisnexis.com/terms/general/> (accessed on 30 January, 2011).