COPYRIGHT[©] INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

LEGAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE FRAMEWORK ON THE ENFORCEMENT OF *SHARĪʿAH* PENAL LAW BY THE POLICE IN NIGERIA

BY

ADEDEJI AKEEM OKEMUYIWA

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Law (Department of Islamic Law)

> Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Malaysia

> > **DECEMBER 2015**

ABSTRACT

Nigeria is a Federal state with a central Federal Government and 36 federating units, each of which is constitutionally empowered to make laws subject to the extent permitted by the constitution. In line with the powers conferred on them about 12 States in Northern part of Nigeria about a decade ago enacted legislations introducing Sharī^cah Penal Laws into their domains. Meanwhile Sharī^cah Law is a residual matter for States while the Police that enforce all laws is a federal agency. The enforcement of the Sharī'ah Penal System is therefore bound to face some legal and administrative challenges. This research as such seeks to justify the introduction of Shari'ah Penal Law in Nigeria and argues that the Police as an institution must take responsibility for the enforcement of Sharī'ah penal law. In furtherance of the above, this research analyses the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, the Police Act and all relevant laws. In appropriate cases, references have been made into literature on law and Policing, not forgetting observations and experience of the researcher as a serving Police Officer. This research finds that the Nigeria Police shoulder a lot of responsibility in the enforcement of all laws in Nigeria including Sharī'ah but is dwarfed by gargantuan legal and administrative problems which are both internal and external to it. Another critical finding of our study is that a centralized police in a Federal State like Nigeria limits the power of the federating units to enforce their own laws. Unfortunately our study has shown that multiple policing is a remote possibility in Nigeria. Accordingly devolution of powers to State Police Commands has been recommended as a practicable solution to lift the police.

ملخص البحث

إن دولة نيجيريا دولة جمهورية فدرالية، وتتكون من ستة وثلاثين ولايات التي تمثل وحداتها الفدرالية، وتمنح الدستور الفدرالي كل من هذه الولايات القوة والحرية لوضع القوانين إلى الحدود المسموح بها في الدستور الفديرالي. وبناءا على هذه القوة الممنوحة في الدستور فقد عمدت اثنا عشرة من الولايات الشمالية إلى وضع التشريعات لتطبيق أحكام حدود الشريعة الاسلامية و الجنايات في مناطقها منذ العقد الماضي، ولكن المشكلة أن حدود الشريعة الاسلامية لاتعتبر من القوانين الفدرالية، مع أن الشرطة المكلفة بتطبيق وتنفيذ جميع القوانين في نيجيريا تعتبر وكالة فدرالية. وبتالي، الأمر الذي جعل تطبيق نظام حدود الشريعة الاسلامية في هذه الولايات يواجه تحديات قانونية وإدارية. ونظرا لذلك، فإن هذا البحث يسعى لتبرير وضع نظام حدود الشريعة الاسلامية و الجنايات في هذه الولايات النيجيرية، كما يثبت بإنه من مسؤولية الشرطة كمؤسسة مكلفة بتطبيق جميع القوانين في البلد أن تقوم بتطبيق وتنفيذ أحكام الجنايات في الشريعة الاسلامية في هذه الولايات. وقد اعتمد الباحث في هذا الصدد بالمواد الموضوعة في دستور الجمهورية الفدرالية النيجيرية وقانون الشرطة وجميع القوانين ذات الصلة، كما اعتمد على كتب القانون والشرطة أثناء المناقشة في الحالات المناسبة، كما دعّم رأيه بملاحظات استقاما من تجربة كضابط شرطي. ولقد توصل الباحث إلى أن من مسوؤلية الشرطة النيجيرية أن تتكفل بتطبيق جميع القوانين في الدولة بما في ذلك حدود الشريعة الاسلامية، ولكن يعيقها عن ذلك المشاكل القانونية والإدارية الداخلية منها والخارجية. كما استنتج الباحث، أن نظام الشرطة المركزية في الدولة الفدرالية مثل نيجيريا يمثل العائق أمام وحداتها الفدرالية في تطبيق قوانينها الخاصة بها. أن تعددية الشرطة هي الحل الوحيد لهذه المشلكة، وعلاوة على ذلك فإن الباحث يوصى بتفويض صلاحيات أوامر الشرطة إلى الولايات كحل عملي لهذه المشكلة.

APPROVAL PAGE

The thesis of Adedeji Akeem Okemuyiwa has been approved by the following:

SHAMRAHAYU. BINTI AB. AZIZ Supervisor

MOHD BAHARUDIN HARUN Co-Supervisor

> NASIMAH HUSSIN Internal Examiner

RUZMAN MD NOOR External Examiner

IYSA ADE BELLO External Examiner

MUSTAFA OMAR MOHAMMED Chairman

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Adedeji Akeem Okemuyiwa

Signature

Date

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

LEGAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE FRAMEWORK ON THE POLICE IN THE ENFORCEMENT OF SHAR \overline{I} ^CAH PENAL LAW IN NIGERIA

I declare that the copyright holder of this thesis/dissertation is Adedeji Akeem Okemuyiwa

Copyright © 2014 by Adedeji Akeem Okemuyiwa International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below.

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others except as provided below.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purpose.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

Affirmed by Adedeji Akeem Okemuyiwa

Signature

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All praise is due to Allah the lord of the worlds for making the accomplishment of this research a reality and may his blessings be upon the prophet Muhammad (s.a.w) the zeal of the prophets.

I wish to express my heartfelt gratitude to my supervisor Assoc. Prof, Dr. Shamrahayu. Binti Ab. Aziz and Assistant Prof, Dr. Mohd Baharudin Harun for their unrelenting guidance, untiring and timely advice, motivation and patience throughout the course of this study. Your motherly and fatherly handling and painstaking approach to guidance provided me the needed trigger for a speedy completion of the research. I wish to express my deepest and sincere appreciation to my better half for her unflinching patience, priceless assistance and encouragement throughout this work. My appreciation also goes to my parents, siblings and in-laws for their support morally and spiritually.

My special thanks go to my elder researchers in the department *Ma^cruf* Abdul Azeez Olayemi for his unflinching advice and support as well as my younger researcher Shafi'i Abdul Azeez Bello for his undeniable support. I wish to express my gratitude to my friends and well-wishers for their love and support throughout my sojourn. So many peoples have touched my life in one way or the other during this research and trying to thank them individually may result in leaving someone unintentionally. Thank you all.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
Approval page	iv
Declaration	
Copyright	vi
Acknowledgements	vii
Table of Contents	viii
List of Cases	xii
List of Statutes	xvi
List of Abbreviations	xvii

CHAPTER ONE: OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1.1 Background	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	
1.3 Objective of the Study	4
1.4 Hypothesis	
1.5 Methodology of Study	
1.6 Scope and Limitation of Study	
1.7 Literature Review	7
1.8 Outline of Chapters	19

CHAPTER TWO: HISTORY AND LEGAL STATUS OF SHARĪ AH CRIMINAL LAW IN NIGERIA LEGAL SYSTEM

CRIMINAL LAW IN NIGERIA LEGAL SYSTEM	.21
2.1 Introduction	.21
2.2 Sharīʿah in Pre-Colonial Nigeria	.21
2.3 Sharīʿah in Colonial Nigeria	.22
2.3.1 The Sharī'ah position towards Independence era (1947-1960)	.26
2.3.2 Sharīʿah in Nigeria after Independence till now (1960 – 1998)	.30
2.3.3 The Re-introduction of <i>Sharī^cah</i> Penal Law	.31
2.4 Legal Status of Sharīʿah in Nigeria	.32
2.4.1 Constitutionality of the Sharīʿah Penal Law	.33
2.4.2 Sharīʿah and the 1999 Constitution	.34
2.4.3 Other Legal Issues on Sharīʿah Penal Law	.35
2.4.4 Sharīʿah Penal System and Nigeria Secularity Status	.36
2.4.5 Sharīʿah Penal System and Discrimination	.39
2.5 Sharīʿah and Law of Evidence	.40
2.5.1 Appellate Courts / Superior Court of Records and Nigeria Legal	
System	.43
2.5.2 Sharīʿah Penal System and its Punishment	.46
2.5.3 Review of Laws and Legal Institutions after introduction of	
Sharīʿah Penal System	.49
2.6 Conclusion	

CHAPTER THREE: POLICING SYSTEM IN NIGERIA	55
3.1 Introduction	55
3.2 Origin of Police and its Transformation in Nigeria	55
3.2.1 Police in Colonial Nigeria	57
3.2.2 Development of Native Authority Police	61
3.3 Structure and Organisation of Nigeria Police Force	64
3.3.1 The Administrative Structure of Police	65
3.3.2 Grading of Police Station	73
3.3.3 The Police Station	73
3.3.4 The Charge Office	73
3.3.4.1 Duty of the Charge Room Officer	75
3.4 Recruitment and Training	76
3.4.1 Appointment of Superior Police Officers	77
3.4.2 Enlistment as Rank and File	
3.5 Assessing Police and its Transformation in Nigeria	
3.6 The Growth of Ad Hoc Security Organisation in Nigeria	
3.7 Conclusion	

CHAPTER FOUR: FUNCTIONS AND DUTIES OF POLICE AS

PRESCRIBED BY LAW IN NIGERIA	88
4.1 Introduction	88
4.2 Statutory Roles of the Police in Nigeria	89
4.2.1 Prevention and Detection of Crime	89
4.2.1.1 Prevention of Crime	90
4.2.1.2 Detection of Crime	92
4.2.1.2.1 Arrest of Suspected Persons	93
4.2.1.2.2 Interrogation and Search of Suspects	
4.2.1.2.3 Detention of Suspects	101
4.2.1.3 Apprehension of Offenders	
4.2.2 Limits of Police Power of Arrest	
4.2.3 Prosecution of Offenders	106
4.2.4 Maintenance of Law and Order	113
4.2.5 Protection of Life and Properties	
4.3 Sharīʿah Enforcement – A Police Role by Implication	115
4.3.1 Police and Enforcement of Sharīʿah Penal Law: legal	
Implications	117
4.3.1.1 Legality	118
4.3.1.2 Legislative Competence of States	119
4.3.1.3 Law of Evidence	122
4.3.1.4 Adoption of a State Religion	123
4.3.1.5 Fundamental Freedoms	126
4.3.1.7 Motive	130
4.3.2 The Birth of 'Hisbah' and its Challenges	132
4.3.3 'Hisbah' and Sharī'ah Enforcement in Nigeria	133
4.4 Conclusion	136
CHAPTER FIVE: ADMINISTRATIVE STRUCTURE AND	

INSTITUTIONAL CONTROL OF POLICE IN

NIGERIA13'	7
------------	---

5.1 Introduction	137
5.2 Police Training Institutions	139
5.3 The Mobile Police Force	
5.4. Police Investigation and Intelligence Bureau	141
5.4.1 The Legal Department	
5.4.2 Task Force on Serious Crimes	143
5.4.3 Police Administration and <i>Sharī ah</i> Administration	
5.5 Institutional Control of Legal Role of Police	
5.5.1 External Institutional Control	
5.5.2 Internal Administrative Structure	
5.6 Conclusion	
CHAPTER SIX: POLICE AND THE PROBLEM OF SHARI AH	
ENFORCEMENT	162
6.1 Introduction	162
6.2 Legal and Administrative Problems Affecting Police Enforcement	
Role	162
6.3 Legal Problems	163
6.3.1 Constitutional Problems	
6.3.2 The Conflict between Public Duty and Private Rights	166
6.3.3 Immunity	
6.3.4 Sharī ^c ah Crimes Punishments are Deemed to be Archaic	
6.3.5 Penal Legislation Too Many	176
6.3.6 Inelegant Drafting of Penal Legislation	
6.3.7 Police Act is Defective	
6.4 Administrative Problems	
6.4.1 Institutional Challenges of Nigeria Police Force	
6.4.2 Problems in the Justice Sector	
6.4.3 The Police in the Eyes of Nigerians	
6.4.4 Effect of Police Problem on Sharīʿah Implementation	
6.5 Conclusion	
CHAPTER SEVEN: SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS	195
7.1 Introduction	195
7.2 Summary	196
7.3 Recommendations	197
7.3.1 Constitutional Reforms	197
7.3.2 Abrogation of Executive Immunity	198
7.3.2.1 Power of Nolle Prosequi Must be Reviewed	200
7.3.2.2 Public Interest Must Prevail Over Private Rights	
7.3.3 Other Statutory Reforms	209
7.3.3.1 Procedural Reforms	
7.3.3.2 Substantive Law Reforms	214
7.3.4 Reform of the Court and Prison System	216
7.3.5 Police Must be Strengthened	
7.3.6 Police Must be Decentralised	
7.3.7 Training Must be Modernised	
7.3.8 Prosecution Department of the Police Must be Strengthened	
7.3.9 Policemen Must be Properly Utilised	

7.3.10 Welfare Package Must be Reviewed	227
7.3.11 Procedure for Discipline Must be Simplified	
7.4 Conclusion	
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION	230
REFERENCE	237

LIST OF CASES

A.G. Federation v Guardian Newspapers (1999)5 S.C.59 A.G. of Abia State & ors v A.G of Federation (2002) 3 SC 107 Abacha v State (2002) SC pt. 1 Abdullahi Kogi ors v Katsina Native Authority (1930) 14 NLR 49 Adam v State (1986) 3 NWLR (Part 32) 865 Adebayo v State (1987) 2 NWLR (Part 57) 468 Adedeji v State (1971) All NLR 75 Adedibu v Adewoyin (1951) 13 WACA 91 Adeoye v State (1999) 4 S.C Part 2 67 Adeove v State (1999) 4 S.C Part II 67 Adesubokan v Yinusa (1971) NNLR 77 African Press Ltd v R (1960) (1952) 14 WACA 57 Agbai v Okagbue (1991) 7 NWLR 391 Agbaje v C.O.P Suit no. CAW/81/69 (Unreported Judgment of Western State High Court of Nigeria). Aquila v Fawehinmi (1989) 3 NWLR Part 112 Akinfe v State (1988) 7 S.C (Part II) 131 Alake v Pratt (1955)15 WACA 20. Ali Alhassan & ors v Inspector General of Police and ors Suit no ID/1025m/2010 9 (Unreported Case) of Lagos State High Court Ali v Okulaja (1970) 2 All NLR 35 Aluko v DPP western Nigeria (2006) 2 SCM 15 Amachree v Good head (1923) 4 NLR 101 Amadi v NNPC (2002) 10 NWLR (pt. 674) Amodu Tijani v Secretary, Southern Nigeria (1921) A.C 399 Archbishop Olubunmi Okogie & ors v Attorney General of Lagos State (1981) N.C.L.R 218 At Gen of Lagos State v Att. Gen of Federation & ors (2003) 6 SC (part 1) Attorney General of Abia State & Ors v Attorney General of the Federation (2002) 4 S.C. Part 1 Attorney General of Abia State & Ors v Attorney General of the Federation (2002) 3 S.C.1 Attorney General of Kaduna State v Hassan (1985) 2 NWLR (pt8) 483 Attorney General of Kano State v Attorney General of the Federation SC/26/2007 Attorney General of Ondo State & Ors v Attorney General of the Federation (2002) 6 SCNJ 1 Attorney General of Ondo State v Attorney general of Federation (2002) 6 S.C. (pt1) Attorney General v John Holt (1910) 2 NLR 1 Attorney-General of Abia State & Ors v Attorney-General of the Federation (2002) 3 S.C1 Attorney-General of Ondo State v Attorney-General of the Federation (2002) 9 NWLR (pt722) 222 Auta v State (1975) 4 SC 125. Ayinde v State (1980) 2 NCR 242

Attorney-General of Abia State & Ors v Attorney-General of the Federation (1998) SC NLR 94 Bashaya & Ors v the State (1998) 4 S.C. 199 Bowman v Secular Society Ltd (1916 – 1917) A.C. 406 Burnt v Public Prosecutor (1995) 2 AC 579 C.O.P (Katsina) v Amina Lawal & anor Suit no /k/9/2002 (unreported) Chukwuka v C.O.P (1964) NNLR 21 Clark & Ors v Attorney General of Lagos State (1986) QLRN 119 Cole v Akinyele (1960) 5 F.S.C. 84 D.P.P v Obi (1961) 1 All NLR 186 Daodu v Danmole (1958) 3 F.S.C 46 Director of S.S.S. v Olisa Agbakoba (1999) 3.S.C 59 Donald Ikomi v State (1986) 3 NWLR pt 26 Eda v C.O.P Bendel State (1962) 3 NCLR 219 Eda v Commissioner of Police (1982) 3 NCLR 219 Edet v Essien (1932) NLR 47 Edgington v Fizmaurice (1885) 29 Ch d 459 Edinburgh & Dalkath Railway v Wauchope (1871) L.R. 6 cp 576 Edu v Commissioner of Police 14 WACA 163 Egbe v State (1980) 1 NCR 341 Eghonome v State (1993) 1 NWLR Pt 306 *Emeka v State* (2001) FWLR (pt 66) 682 S.C Esangbedo v State (1989) 7 S.C. Pt at. 36 Eze Ibeh v State (1997) 1 NWLR Pt 484 Fawehinmi v Akilu (1987) 4 NWLR (Pt 67) 797 Fawehinmi v I.G.P (2002) 7 NWLR (Part 767) 606 Fawehinmi v IGP (2002) 23 WRN 1 Fawehinmi v State (1990) 1 NWLR (Part 127) 486 Fawehinmi v .I.G.P (2002) 7 NWLR (Pt767) 606 Federal Minister of Internal Affairs v Shugaba Darman (1982) 3 NCLR 915 Federal Republic of Nigeria v Osahon (2006) 2 SCM 15 FRN v Osahon (2006) 2 SCM 157 Gaji v State (1975) 5 S.C. 61 Greene v Secretary of State v Home Affairs (1942) AC 284 Gubba v Gwandu Native Authority (1947) 12 WACA 141 Guri v Hadejia Native Authority(1959) 4 FSC 44 Gwonto v State (1982) 3 NCLR 321 Igbi v State (2000) 2 S.C. 67 Ilori v State (1983) SCNLR 94 INEC v Musa &Ors (2003)1S.C. 106 Inspector General of Police v Kamara (1943) 2 WACA 185 Jackson v Omorokuna (1981) (1) NCR 283 Kalu v State (1998) 11-12 S.C 4 Kotoye v Central Bank of Nigeria & 7 Ors (1989) All NLR 76 Kuruma v R (1955) 1 ALLER 236 Larcashire Yorkshine Railway Company v MacNichol (1919) 88 L.J.K.B 601 Lawal v Younan (1961) 1 & AII NLR 245 Lawan Maigama v Fatimata Alhajiram (Unreported) suit no CA/J/65/5/94 Lawrence v R (1933) A.C.699

Lewis v Bankole (1906) NLR 81 Maida v Modu (2002) NWLR Part 659 Maizabo v Sokoto Native Authority (1957) NRWLR 133. FSC Mayaki v The State (1981) 1 NCR 25 MCCulloch v Maryland (1819) 4 17 U.S.316 Miranda v Arizona (1996) 384 US 436 Mohamed Abacha v State (2002) 1.S.C. pt 1 Musa Sadau & Ors v State (1968) NMLR 208 Njovens v State (1973) NNLR 13 Obih v Mbakwe (1984) 1 SCNLR 192 Ohwovoriole v FRN (2003) 1 SC. Part 1 Ohwovoriole v FRN (2003) 1.S.C. 1 Okeke v Nigeria Railway Corporation 12 WACA 363 Okeke v State (2003) 2S.C 63 Okeke v Yaroson (1999) 11 NWLR pt625 106 Okoro v State (1998) 11-12 S.C. 4 Okotie v Police 4 FSC125 Olafisoye v FRN (2004) 4 NWLR (pt 864) 580 Olalekan v State (2001) 12 S.C Part 1 Olalekan v State (2001) 12 SC Part 1 *Omoju v F.R.N.* (2008) All FWLR (Pt 415) Onafowokan v State (1987) 7 S.C. 538 Onu Obekpa v C.O.P (1981) 2 NCLR 420 Owodunni v Registered Trustees of Celestial Church of Christ &Ors (2000) 6 sc. Part Ш Oziki Danlami v State (1990) I SC 109 R v African Press Ltd (1957) WNLR 1 R v Anya Ugwuogo & Ors (1943) 4 WACA 73 @ 74 R v Gowan (1982) Crim LR 821 R v Hudson (1980) 72 Cr App R 163 R v Jackson Akpon Umo & Ors (1944) 10 WACA 254 R v Okoye (1953) NLR 138 R v Omisade & Ors (1964) NMLR 67 *R v Prager* (1972) 56 Cr App R 151 *R v Priestly* (1967) 51 Cr App R 1 R v Princewill (1963) NRNLR 5 *R v Senat & Sin* (1968) 52 Cr App R 282 Ribeiro v Chahin (1954) 14 WACA 476 S.S.S. v Agbakoba (1999) 3 SC 59 Sadiq v State (1982) 2 NCR 142 Safiyatu Hussain Tudu v Att. Gen. of Sokoto State Suit No. USC/ GW/CR/FI/10/01 Secretary of State for Home Affairs v O' Brine (1923) A.C. 603 Soliven v Makasiar (1988) 167 SCRA 393 State v Aibangbee (1988) 7 S.C. 96 State v Isiaka Rufai (2001) I.S.C Pt 1 State v Zamani Lekwot & Ors Suit No. KDC/CDT/10/92 Unreported decision of Civil Disturbances Tribunal Kaduna Tinubu v IMB Securities PLC, (2001) 16 NWLR (Pt 740) 670 U.A.C v Mcfoy (1961) 3 WLR 1405

Ukeje v Ukeje (2001) 27WRN 142 Yesufu v State (1976) 6 S.C 167 Zakwakwa v the Queen (1960) SCNLR 36

LIST OF STATUTES

Administration of Criminal Justice Law no 10 of Lagos State 2007 Anti-Terrorism Act 2009 Bauchi State Guidelines on the Formation, Functions and Operations of Hisbah Committees in Bauchi State Bauchi State Sharia Commission Law **British Police Act** Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979 Convention against Torture and other cruel, inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT 1984) Criminal Code Act Law C77 Laws of the Federation 1990 Criminal Procedure (Amendment) Edict No 7 of Lagos State 1987 Criminal Procedure Act and Criminal Procedure Code Criminal Procedure Act and Section 223 of the Criminal Procedure Code Criminal Procedure Code of Northern Nigeria Criminal Procedure Law of Lagos State Customs & Excise Management Act 1958 Decree 3 of 1995 Decree no 44 of 1977 Decree no 84 of 1966 Description of Ordinances Act, Law no 57 of 1961 E.F.C.C Act 2004 Electoral (Amendment) Act 2010 Evidence Act 2011 Kwara Area Court Edict no. 2 of 1967 Lagos Laws 1973 Cap 33 LFN 1990 and Cap 123 LFN 2004 Money Laundry Act, No 63 of 1995 NAI {National Archive Ibadan} 1863 Nigeria Police Act 1967 Northern Nigeria laws 1963 Cap 33 Northern Nigeria Region Law 106 of 1960 Penal Code Law of Northern Region of Nigeria applicable throughout Northern Nigeria, 1959, Act No 6 2000 Police regulations made pursuant to the Police Act Preamble to the Fundamental Rights (Enforcement Procedure) Rules 2009 of Nigeria Regulation 273 made pursuant to the Police Act Sharia Court of Appeal (Amendment) Law No 6, 2000 of Zamfara State and Sharia Court of Appeal (Amendment) Law no 13, 2001 of Kaduna State Sharia Courts (Establishment) Law, Law no 5 of 1999 Sharia Criminal Procedure Code of Zamfara state Sharia Penal Code Law no 10 of Zamfara State Supreme Court Ordinance No 3 of 1863 Zamfara State Hisbah Commission Law Zamfara State Sharia Penal Code

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AC	Appeal Cases
All FWLR	All Federation Weekly Law Reports
All NLR	All Nigeria Law Reports
All ER	All England Reports
COP	Commissioner of Police
CPA	Criminal Procedure Act
CAP	Chapter
CAW	Court of Appeal Western Nigeria
CPC	Criminal Procedure Code CR
CR App R	Criminal Appeal Report
DPP	Director of Public Prosecution
EFCC	Economic and Financial Crimes Commission
FRN	Federal Republic of Nigeria
FSC	Federal Supreme Court
FWLR	Federation Weekly Law Reports
JSC	Justice of Supreme Court
JCA	Justice Court of Appeal
IGP	Inspector General of Police
IMB	International Merchant Bank
INEC	Independent National Electoral Commission.
LJKB	Law Journal of King's Bench
LR	Law Reports
LFN	Laws of the Federation of Nigeria
NCLR.	Nigeria Criminal Law Reports
NAI	National Archives Ibadan
NCR	Nigeria Criminal Reports
NLR	Nigeria Law Reports
NMLR	Nigeria Monthly Law Reports
NNLR	Northern Nigeria Law Reports
NRNLR	Northern Region of Nigeria Law Reports
NWLR	Nigerian Weekly Law Reports
QLRN.	Quarterly Law Reports of Nigeria
SC	Supreme Court
SSS	State Security Service
SCM	Supreme Court Monthly
SCNJ	Supreme Court of Nigeria Judgment
SCNLR	Supreme Court of Nigeria Law Reports
SCRA	Supreme Court Report Annotated (Philippines)
UAC	United African Company
USC	United States Supreme Court
WACA	West African Court of Appeal
WLR	Weekly Law Reports
WNLR	Western Nigeria Law Reports
WRN	Western Region of Nigeria

CHAPTER ONE

OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1.1 BACKGROUND

Nigeria Police force is the main Law enforcement agency in the country. It is a federal agency. A specific law, namely the Police Act of 1967 specifies specific powers and duties of the Police in enforcing the law. Meanwhile, the re-introduction of *Sharī'ah* Penal Law to Northern Nigeria in 2000¹ by the Zamfara State government was greeted with wide acceptance among the Muslims. Although there were pockets of protests in the country,² many Nigerians believed that the *Sharī'ah* Penal Law is the only to several social malaises that have eaten deep to the fabrics of the country.³ Little wonder then that eleven other states followed the Zamfara State's example in quick succession.⁴

However, the proponents of the *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law observed that one of the obstacles confronting it is the inability of Nigeria Police Force to legally enforce the law.⁵ Since a decade of re-introduction of *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law in Nigeria only few cases were decided despite its existence in Nigerian legal system.⁶ This emanates from

¹ Sharī^cah Penal Code Law no 10 of 2000 and Sharī^cah Criminal Procedure Code law (law no 18 2000).

² Brandon Kendhammer., *The Sharī ch Controversy in Northern Nigeria and the Politics of Islamic Law in New and Uncertain Democracies* (Ohio: Ohio University, June 2012) at. 9.

³ Philip O., & Umaru, M.J.. "Introduction to Chapter 3 - Sharī'ah Debates in Africa", at. 10. Retrieved from https://www.sharia-in-africa.net/media/publications/sharia-implementation-in-northern-nigeria/vol_3_3_chapter_3_part_II.pdf>, Accessed on 05th of January 2015.

⁴ The States are Bauchi, Gombe, Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Kastina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, Yobe and Borno.

⁵ Rasheed O., *Hisba and the Sharia Law Enforcement in Metropolitan Kano* (Ibadan: Department of History, University of Ibadan, 2011) at. 9.

⁶ Dozie Okebalama., "FG and past governors: Mocking the fight against corruption", *National Mirror*, November 30, 2012). Retrieved from < *http://nationalmirroronline.net/new/fg-and-past-governors-mocking-the-fight-against-corruption/*, Accessed on December 2015. On 24/3/2000 Bello Garki

the provisions of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria which recognizes Nigeria Police Force as the only institution empowered to enforce law and order in the country,⁷ the Police Force, is a federal institution, while the introduction of the *Sharī*^cah Penal Law could be traced to the efforts of a certain number of northern states, now known as *Sharī*^cah states.

Nigeria is a federation of 36 states and a federal capital territory. One odd feature of the Nigerian federal system is that the 36 federating states have no state police to enforce the law. Besides, the Federal Constitution which establishes the Nigeria Police Force is silent on the applicability of the *Sharī*^cah Penal Laws to criminal cases.⁸ Although the constitution created and recognises *Sharī*^cah Court of Appeal of the Federal Capital Territory and *Sharī*^cah Courts of Appeal for each state of the federation, the constitutional provisions on the jurisdiction of those courts conspicuously leave out criminal matters.⁹ The relevant provisions of constitution prescribe the jurisdiction of the courts to civil proceedings involving; amongst others, questions of Islamic personal law; which includes questions of Islamic personal law regarding a marriage concluded in accordance with that law; questions of that law regarding gift, will, or succession where the endower, donor, testator or deceased is a Muslim.¹⁰ The parties must be Muslims who have voluntarily submitted to the jurisdiction of the courts.¹¹

Jangedi's hand was amputated for stealing cattle. Although courts have imposed the penalty of stoning for adultery in a couple of cases, no single execution has been carried out.

⁷ Section 214 of the 1999 Constitution of federal Republic of Nigeria.

 ⁸ Asein, J. O. Introduction to the Nigerian legal system 2nd Ed. Lagos: Ababa Press Ltd 2005 P. 193-195
⁹ See sections 260-264 and Sections 275 – 279 of the Constitution of Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999.

 $^{^{10}}$ See Sections 262-276 of the 1999 Constitution.

¹¹ Section 275 (i) which provides thus "There shall be for any state that requires it a *Sharī*'ah Court of Appeal for that state" This provision underscores the fact not all states are compelled to adopt the *Sharī*'ah legal System hence, the limited number of states practicing it, even in the North. For example Kwara State did not adopt the *Sharī*'ah penal law yet it is a Northern state.

From the foregoing therefore, it is contentious whether the Nigerian Police Force, which is a federal institution, can enforce the *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law owing to the silence of the constitutional provisions on the place of *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law *vis- a- vis* the Constitution.¹² This constitutional lacuna best explains why states that have adopted the Sharia Penal system have established special police to perform the duties the federal police ordinarily should be performing. It is in view of this fact that this study, while identifying the several other factors, singles out the incapacity of the police as the most significant reason for the passive status of *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law in Nigeria.

The argument is made in line with the provisions of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999¹³ as read together with the Nigeria Police Act 1967.¹⁴ Moreover, the argument is also reinforced by the fact that the *Sharī ah* Penal Law is a valid component of Nigerian Legal System. A suggestion is therefore made for the establishment of a subordinate body to the Police Force which will be equipped with the necessary knowledge regarding the enforcement of the law. Such agency will have the same status with that of the other security outfits in the country, such as the Security and Civil Defense Corps, Federal Road Safety Commission and the Lagos State LASTMA that assist the Nigeria Police Force in the performance of its duties.¹⁵

1.2 STATEMENT OF PROBLEM

The reintroduction of Sharia Penal Law in the 12 states of northern Nigeria underscores the importance of the Islam in the politics and culture of the people of the

¹² Sections 2 & 3, the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria1999.

¹³ Section 214, the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria1999.

¹⁴ Nigeria Police Act 1967.

¹⁵ The National Drug Law Enforcement Agency (NDLEA) and Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC) are examples of security agencies that are carrying out enforcement of penal legislations which ordinarily ought to be the sole responsibility of Nigeria Police Force.

region. Zamfara State led the way in 1999 by making certain laws, which, amongst other things, introduced *Sharī'ah* Penal Law,¹⁶ an action considered revolutionary, given the fact that hitherto existing Sharia courts exercised jurisdiction on only civil proceedings related to Islamic Law. The reintroduction of *Sharī'ah* Penal Law immediately raised some problems, such as constitutionality of the *Sharī'ah* Penal law *vis-à-vis* the provisions of 1999 constitution, the implications for the secular status of Nigeria, the penalties prescribed by *Sharī'ah* for offences under it were considered barbaric and incompatible with modern civilisation and whether it is legal and effective to use the Nigeria Police-a federal apparatus- as agency of enforcing *Sharī'ah* Penal Law in the 12 states. The last problem forms the fulcrum of this study. This study examines whether the enforcement of *Sharī'ah* falls within the mandate of the police. If so, can the Nigeria Police, given its administrative structure and legal mandate, and also taken into accounts its various institutional and other challenges, effectively enforce Sharia Penal Law? Also, whether any organized body (such as *Hisbah*) can lawfully and practically play a complementary role in enforcing *Sharī'ah*.

1.3 OBJECTIVES OF THE THESIS

- To examine the relevant Nigerian law in a bid to justify that the *Sharīʿah* Penal Law is a component of the Nigeria legal system.
- To consider the administrative and legal structure peculiar to Nigeria Police Force.

¹⁶ For example, *Sharī^cah* Court (Administration of Justice and certain consequential changes) law No 5 1999. *Sharī^cah* Court of Appeal (Amendment) Law No 6, 2000. Area Courts (Repeal) Law No 13, 2000 *Sharī^cah* Penal Code Law, 1999; *Sharī^cah* Criminal Procedure Law No 18, 2000.

- To analyze and discover the various legal and administrative challenges confronting the Nigeria Police in its enforcement of the *Sharīʿah* Penal Law
- To suggest for an improvement in the performance of the police role in enforcing *Sharī^cah* Penal law.

1.4 HYPOTHESIS

- 1. Constitution allows the creation of *Sharī'ah* Penal System.
- Since Sharī^cah Penal law is a component of Nigeria legal system it is validly enforceable by the police.
- The current legal framework allows the police to enforce *Sharī^cah* Penal Law.
- 4. Since the current legal framework allows the police to enforce *Sharīʿah* Penal Law, a specific unit can be set up in the police force under the current legal framework to make the role of police more effective

The research therefore, will address the following questions;

- What are the provisions in Nigeria Constitution for Sharīʿah Penal System?
- 2. What are the provisions for the enforcement institution?
- 3. What are the provisions of law regarding police powers?
- 4. How can police exercise the powers?
- Is it possible to have a separate institution that may be set up to enforce *Sharī^cah* Penal law?

1.5 METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY

The study is a qualitative research which involves doctrinal and non-doctrinal analysis. Under the doctrinal analysis method, this research considers the provisions of Nigerian laws generally. This includes the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, Common Law of England, Statutes of General Application, local Acts and states' laws, subsidiary legislations and decided cases. Besides, copious reference will be made to law text books, journals, scholarly articles, encyclopedias, dictionaries, and online materials.

The non-doctrinal analysis involves; firstly, library research which involved sourcing and thorough study of the materials gathered; secondly, observations, relating to the subject of this study, gained as a Nigerian citizen and a law enforcement agent with over 15 years working experience within the Nigeria Police Force; and thirdly, interviews with eminent legal practitioners, judges, alkalis, senior police officers, civil servants, complainants and prosecutors and other relevant stakeholders, in the course of police duty. The questions posed in the interviews and above mentioned personal observations were open ended as they occurred over a long period of time; with a purpose to satisfy curiosity and gain knowledge.

The data obtained were subjected to in-depth and critical analysis.

1.6 SCOPE AND LIMITATION OF THE STUDY

The research will focus on only three of the *Sharī* ah states. These are Zamfara, Bauchi and Kano states respectively. The reasons for the adoption of these 3 states are three-fold; firstly, Zamfara State is unique for spearheading the revolutionary decision for introducing the *Sharī* bhari Penal Law; and was the first legislate on the decision. Secondly, Kano State has the highest number of Muslims concentrated in a single

State in Nigeria; and thirdly, Bauchi State has been chosen because of its being the most liberal northern state in Nigeria with respect to Islamic tents. These choices make it easy to do a critical and balanced examination of the subject of study. This study will examine the challenges that confront the Nigeria Police as regards the enforcement of the newly reintroduced Islamic Penal law in some northern Nigeria states.

The challenges mainly emanated from the available laws. That is the constitution, the Police Act and the various state edicts. The lacuna in the laws shall be pinpointed, and suggestions on how to rectify the problems shall be made. The research will not discuss any other laws except for the purpose of analysis. There is a dearth of literature and decided cases on the implementation of the *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal System in Nigeria. It is hoped that this gap will be filled with an abundance of materials on the received English Criminal Law. The fact that both the received English Penal System and *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal System operate in the same environment makes deduction and comparison easier.

1.7 LITERATURE REVIEW

There are enough works of literature on the issue of the enforcement of the *Sharī*^c*ah* Penal Law in Nigeria. The subject is one of the topics which are central to discussions among the legal practitioners and law enforcement agencies in Nigeria. However, the reviewed literature is divided into two segments. The segment (a) discusses the Nigeria Police Force in general, while the segment (b) discusses *Sharī*^c*ah* in Nigeria.