COPYRIGHT[©] INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA

BY

ABDULKADIR BOLAJI ABDULKADIR

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Malaysia

JANUARY 2014

ABSTRACT

The protections of environment and human rights are among the foremost concerns of international community. Towards the end of twentieth century, the linkages between the protection of human rights and environment began to manifest. Since then, there has been increasing awareness and acknowledgement of the correlation between the two subjects. The degradation of the Niger Delta environment from petroleum activities has led to the incidences of human rights violations notwithstanding the adoption of human rights treaties and fundamental human rights in the Nigerian Constitution. This has led to the violation of the right to life, right to the enjoyment of property, access to clean water, and the right to a clean and healthful environment. Therefore, this thesis examines the relationship between human rights and the environment as an attempt to show the indivisibility of the two fields. It seeks to discover how environmental degradation affects the enjoyment of basic human rights to the people of Niger Delta Region. The research-work also assesses the effectiveness or otherwise of the legal framework on environmental protection in Nigeria. This is done through the examination of the constitutional status on environment and arrays of legislations dealing with environment. Also, the thesis assesses the effectiveness of tort law remedies to environmental dispute and justice system in Nigeria. It also explores how human rights provisions can be used to protect the environment. This was done through the examination of substantive and procedural rights such as the right to life, equality right, right to property, right of access to information and right to participation that have been found to be of immense use in the pursuit of environmental justice. The thesis primarily adopts qualitative method of research, which involves both doctrinal and non-doctrinal legal research. On this note, the research work finds the existing laws on environment in Nigeria to be weak and insufficient and this underscores the unsatisfactory performance of the regulatory bodies. This thesis also finds that judicial creativity and wisdom have shown that there are a number of benefits of using human rights provisions than other available remedies in the quest for environmental protection and justice. As a result of these findings, the research work suggests some recommendations in order to reinforce the legal frameworks and improve environmental justice. Also, important recommendations are made to both the government and the public so as to enhance access to environmental justice and promote human rights.

ملخص البحث

فإنَّ من أهم شواغل المجتمع الدولي حماية البيئة وحقوق الإنسان، وقد خضع كل واحد من هذين الموضوعين للتوسع المتزايد في مجال القانون الدولي بشكل مستقل، تاريخيا. وبدأت الروابط بين حماية حقوق الإنسان والبيئة تتجاهر في أواخر نهاية القرن العشرين. ومنذئذ، فقدكانت هناك زيادة من الوعى والإقرار بوجود العلاقة بين الموضوعين. وبناءا على ذلك، فإنَّ هذه الأطروحة تحدف إلى تحليل منهج حقوق الإنسان لحماية البيئة. فتبحث الأطروحة عن العلاقة بين حقوق الإنسان والبيئة على سبيل محاولة إظهار عدم إمكان تجزئة بين الموضوعين. ويسعى الباحث لاكتشاف مدى تأثير التدهور البيئي السلبي على حق التمتع بحقوق الإنسان الأساسية لساكني منطقة "نيجر دلتا" في نيجيريا، ولتحقيق هذا الهدفٍ، فقد فحصت الأطروحة عن المشاكل البيئية المختلفة التي تواجه ساكني "نيجر دلتا" بسبب أنشطة المصانع النفطية العاملة في هذه المنطقة وكيف استمرت هذه المشاكل في مخاطرة حقوق ساكني هذه المنطقةٍ. ويقيم البحث كذلك مدى فعالية الإطار القانوني لحماية البيئة في نيجيريا. وقد تم ذلك من خلال دراسة الوضع الدستوري المعنى للبيئة، بما في ذلك دراسة التشريعات التي وضعت للبيئة . وكذلك، فإن الأطروحة تقيّم فعالية قانون المسؤولية التقصيرية في حلّ المنازعات البيئية وكذا نظام العدالة النيجيرية. ولتحقيق هذا الهدف، فإن الأطروحة قامت بفحص حي عن سيادة قانون الإهمال، والإزعاج والمسؤوليات ذواتي عواقب الصارمة، وذلك لادراك موقف المحاكم القضائية نحو العدالة البيئية وفي حلّ المنازعات البيئية في نيجيريا. وبحث كذلك عن مدى إمكانية استخدام مبادئ أحكام حقوق الإنسان لحماية البيئة. وقد تم ذلك من خلال فحص الحقوق الموضوعية والإجرائية مثل حقية الحياة وحقية المساواة، وحقية الملكية، وحقية الحصول على المعلومات والبيانات وحقية المشاركة والاجتماع التي تم العثور على إمكانية دورها هائلة، متأخرا، لتحقيق العدالة البيئية . وبالتالي، فقد اكتشف الباحث بأن القوانين الموضوعة للبيئة في نيجيريا كانت قوانين ضعيفة وغير كافية، وهذا يمثل العائق الكبير أمام الأداء المرجو من قبل الهيئات التنظيمية. وفي الأخير، تواصل الباحث إلى الاقرار أنَّه قد تبين من خلال الدراس بأنَّ الإبداع القضائية والحكمة تظهربأًن هناك عددا من الفوائد أو مزايا في استخدام الأحكام المتعلقة بحقوق الإنسان بمزيد من المعلاجات الأخرى المتاحة في السعى حول حماية البيئة والعدالة. ومن خلال توضيح نتيجة البحث، اقترح الباحث بعض التوصيات لتعزيز الأطر القانونية وتحسين العدالة البيئية. وكذلك، قدّم توصيات مهمة إلى كل من الحكومة والجمهور العمومي لتعزيز العدالة البيئية وتعزيز حقوق الإنسان.

APPROVAL PAGE

The thesis of Abdulkadir Bolaji Abdulkadir has been approved by the following:

Maizatun Mustafa Supervisor

Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan Co-supervisor

> Abdul Haseeb Ansari Internal Examiner

Mohd Bakri Ishak External Examiner

El-Fatih Abdullahi Abdelsalam Chairman

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigation, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degree at IIUM or other institutions.

Abdulkadir Bolaji Abdulkadir

Signature.....

Date.....

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

Copyright © 2014 by International Islamic University. All rights reserved.

HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA

I hereby affirm that The International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM) holds all rights in the copyrights of this Work and henceforth any reproduction or use in any form or by any mean whatsoever is prohibited without the written consent of IIUM. No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder.

Affirmed by Abdulkadir Bolaji Abdulkadir

Signature

Date

This thesis is dedicated to my wife and my children: Mrs. Aishat Bolaji-Abdulkadir, Abdulkadir Fatima Segilola, and Abdulkadir Zulfah Ayinke

AND TO

My parents, Hajji Abdulkadir Oloruntele Saadudeen and Hajjia Ramatallahi Abdulkadir for inculcating in me the virtue of hard-work, love and belief in Allah.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All glory is due to Allah, the Almighty, whose Grace and Mercies have been with me throughout the duration of my programme. Although, it has been tasking, His Mercies and Blessings on me ease the herculean task of completing this thesis.

I am most indebted to my able and dynamic supervisor, Assistant Professor Maizatun Mustafa, whose enduring disposition, kindness, promptitude, thoroughness and friendship have facilitated the successful completion of my work. I put on record and appreciate her detailed comments, useful suggestions and inspiring queries which have considerably improved the quality of this thesis. Her brilliant grasp of the aim and content of this work led to her insightful comments, suggestions and queries which helped me a great deal. Despite her commitments, she took time to listen and attend to me whenever requested. I am also grateful to my co-supervisor, Professor Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan, whose supervision, encouragement and painstaking scrutiny of the work have helped in building the final draft of this work.

Sincere thanks to the entire management and staff of AIKOLs particularly the Dean of law, Professor Hunud Abia Kadouf. My thanks to the entire staff of the postgraduate Units, AIKOL for their support, cooperation and useful information given when requested. I am highly indebted to my dear friend, Dr. Abdulfatai Oladapo Sambo and to my wife Mrs. Aishat Bolaji-Abdulkadir. They are the planers, architects and designers of my doctoral programme. While they carefully designed and strategically planned the programme, I endured to execute the programme.

My profound gratitude goes to the following people without whose this research work would have been impossible. They are: Ahmad Popoola, Sulaiman Agboola, Abubakar Kolapo, Bolaji Oluomo, and Lukma Tuwo. Apart from their moral support, they also took charge of my domestic affairs while away. To them all I say may God continue to enrich you (Amin).

To my family is my heartfelt appreciation, particularly Hajji Abdulkadir Oloruntele Saadudeen and Hajjia Ramat (my parent) for their prayers without which I could not have succeeded in this programme and made such tremendous success in my undertakings. Special thanks to my brothers and sisters, Segilola, Salamat, Sakirat, and Abdulsalam and their families for their prayers and support. To my in-laws, Hajjia Halimat, Toyin Folorunsho and Titilayo Ajape and their families, is my deepest appreciation for their support and prayers. I cannot thank them enough.

Lastly, my gratitude goes to my beloved lovely children: Fatima and Zulfah for their understanding and endurance while away.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstractii		
Abstract in Arabiciii		
Approval Pageiv		
Declaration Page		
Copyright Pagevi		
Dedication		
Acknowledgmentsviii		
List of Tables		
Lists of Cases		
Lists of Statutesxvii		
Lists of Abbreviationsxix		
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION		
1.1 Background1		
1.2 Statement of Problem		
1.4 Hypothesis		
1.5 Methodology		
1.6 Scope and Limitation of the Study		
1.7 Literature Review		
1.8 Outline of Chapters		
CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTS OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND		
ENVIRONMENT		
2.1 Introduction 27		
2.1 Introduction		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights31		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development41		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human45		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle45		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human45Rights452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle50		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity52		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and36Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human45Rights452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle50		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA AND		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA ANDTHEIR IMPLICATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS58		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human45Rights452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA ANDTHEIR IMPLICATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS583.1 Introduction58		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA ANDTHEIR IMPLICATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS583.1 Introduction583.2 Environmental Problems in the Niger Delta as a Result61 Petroleum		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA ANDTHEIR IMPLICATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS3.1 Introduction583.2 Environmental Problems in the Niger Delta as a Result58		
2.2 Concept of Human Rights282.3 Environmental Rights312.4 Relationship Between the Protections of Human Rights and362.5 Environment362.5 Environment, Human Rights and Development412.6 General Principles on the Protection of Environment and Human452.6.1 The Precautionary Principle452.6.2 The Polluter Pays Principle502.6.3 Intergenerational Equity522.7 Conclusion56CHAPTER THREE: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS DUE TOPETROLEUM ACTIVITIES IN THE NIGER DELTA OF NIGERIA ANDTHEIR IMPLICATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS583.1 Introduction583.2 Environmental Problems in the Niger Delta as a Result61 Petroleum		

66		
•	e Construction of Roads and Pipelines68	
-	oblems from Petroleum Activities on the	
	er Delta69	
	Fisheries69	
3.3.2 Impact on Land and A	griculture73	
	llth75	
3.4 Implications of the Environn	nental Problems on the Enjoyment of	
Basic Human Rights of the Peop	ble of Niger Delta	
	Clean and Safe Water84	
CHAPTER FOUR: THE NIGERIAN	N ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY91	
4.1 Introduction		
4.2 A Brief History of Nigerian	Environmental Policy92	
4.3 Objectives of the Environme	ntal Policy93	
4.4 Environmental Policy Princi	ples For Sustainable Development	
4.5 Major Issues in the Nigeria E	Environmental Policy on the Protection of	
4.5.1 Land Use and Soil Con	nservation	
4.5.2 Water Pollution Control	ol100	0
4.5.3 Oil and Gas Activities		2
4.5.4 Protection of Health		5
4.5.5 Public Participation		7
	et	
e e		
CHAPTER FIVE: LEGAL FRAME	WORK ON ENVIRONMENTAL	
PROTECTION IN NIGERIA AND I		
RIGHTS		5
5.1 Introduction		5
5.2 Laws on Environmental Prot	ection in Nigeria110	б
5.2.1 The Nigeria's Constitu	ation on Environment110	6
-	Assessment (EIA)120	
	osphere from Pollution	
	m Petroleum pollution	
	om Pollution	
	of Water Pollution	
	of Water Pollution in the Course of	Ű
		2
	of Water Pollution in the Course of	_
	leum Products	6
	Environmental Protection in Nigeria13	
5.5 Institutional Fiantework Off	Invironmentari ritoteenon ni rugena	0

5.3.1 National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enfor	cement
Agency Act (NESREA)	
5.3.2 National Oil Spillage Detection and Responses Agency	141
5.3.3 Niger Delta Development Commission	142
5.3.4 Ministry of Environment	144
5.3.5 Department of Petroleum Resources	145
5.4 Shortcomings of Legal and Institutional Frameworks on the Prot	tection
of Environment and Human Rights	147
5.4.1 Inadequate Statutory Power of Enforcement	147
5.4.2 Issue of Institutional Autonomous	152
5.4.3 Penalty and Coercive Measures	156
5.4.5 Inadequate Administrative Remedy and Legal Right withi	n the
Legal and Institutional Framework	158
5.4.6 Inadequate Funding and Man Power of the Regulatory	
Institutions	164
5.5 Conclusion	166

CHAPTER SIX: JUDICIAL ATTITUDE TO PROTECTION OF ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN

NIGERIA	167
6.1 Introduction	167
6.2 Environmental Disputes and Access to Environmental Justice	168
6.3 Torts And Environmental Dispute Resolution	168
6.3.1 Nuisance	169
6.3.2 Negligence	175
6.3.3 Strict Liability	182
6.4 Remedies in Environmental Litigation	186
6.4.1 Compensation	186
6.4.2 Injunction	
6.4.3 Remediation	
6.5 Challenges Involved in Seeking Environmental Justice	194
6.5.1 Strict Application of the rule of "locus standi"	194
6.5.2 Costs of Litigation	198
6.5.3 Duration of Litigation	200
6.5.4 Inadequate Remedy	202
6.6 Conclusion.	
6.5.2 Costs of Litigation6.5.3 Duration of Litigation6.5.4 Inadequate Remedy	198 200 202

7	7.2 Environmental Protection through the Enjoyment of Substantive	
ŀ	Human Rights	206
	7.2.1 Protection of the Right to Life	207
	7.2.2 Protection of the Right to be Free of Interference with One's	
	Home and Property	215
	7.2.3 Protection of Freedom of Association, Expression and Thoug	ght 220
	7.2.4 Protection of the Right to Equality	225
	7.2.5 Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	228

7.3 Environmental Protection through the Enjoyment of Procedural	
Rights	231
7.3.1 Right to Public Participation in Environmental Decision	
Process	232
7.3.2 Right of Access to Environmental Information	237
7.3.3 Right of Access to Remedy	243
7.4 Analysis of Human Rights Approach to Environmental Protection	245
7.5 Conclusion.	
7.5 Conclusion	
7.5 Conclusion	200
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS	
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS	251
	251
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS	251
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS	251 251 254
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS 8.1 Conclusion 8.2 Suggestions	251 251 254
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS 8.1 Conclusion 8.2 Suggestions	251 251 254
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION AND SUGGETIONS	251 251 254 259

LIST OF TABLES

Table No.		Page No.
3.1	Table	61
3.2	Table	64
3.3	Concentration of Crude Oil Detected in Surface Water (Rivers)	71
3.4	Concentration of Crude Oil Detected in Ground Water	72
3.5	Table	74
3.6	Sources of Drinking Water	85
3.7	Sources of Bathing and Washing Water	85
6.1	Table	199

LIST OF CASES

7up v Abiola (2001) 5 MJSC 93.

Abraham Adesanya v President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (1982) 1 ANLR 1. Adediran and Another v Interland and Transport Limited (1991) 9 NWLR (pt. 214) 155. Advisory Opinion on the Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons (1996) ICJ. Report, 226. Akintole v Guffani and co. Ltd (1974) 5 CCH CJ 671. Amos v Shell BP Petroleum Company of Nigeria Ltd (1977) SC 109. Apirana Mahuika and Others v New Zealand (Communication No: 547/1992.) Atunbi v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (Unreported) Suit No: UCH 48/73 of Nov. 12^{th} 1974. Banawasi Seva Ashram v State of Uttar Pradesh (1987) AIR SC 374. Bp Souther Africa (pty) Lt v MEC for Agricultural, Conservation, Environment and Land Affairs (2004) 5 SA 124. Charam Lai Sahu v. Union of India, Air (1990), SC 1480. Chief Irene Thomas and 5 Others v Timothy Olufosoye (1985) NWLR (pt. 18) 669. Chinda and 5 Others v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1972) 2 RSLR 1. Corful Channel Case (1949), ICJ Rep., 22. Delhi Development Horticulture Employees' Union v Delhi Administration, Delhi and others (1993) 4 Law Reports of the Commonwealth 182. Diego Cali & Figli Srl v Servizi Ecologici Porto Di Genova SPA (SEPG) (1997) 5 CMLR 484. Donoghue v Stevenson (1932) AC 502. Douglass v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1992) 2 NWLR (pt. 591) 466. Dr. M. Farooque v. Bangladesh (1997) 49, Ahaka Law Reports (AD), 1. Dumez Nigeria Limited v Ogboli (1972) All NLR 241. Earthlife Africa (Cape Town) v Director-General. Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism and Another (2005) (3) SA 156. EHP v Canada (Communication No: 67/1980. Fadeyeva v Russia (2005) IV 45 Eur. Ct. H.R. 10. Francis Coralie Mullin v Union of Territory of Delhi (1981) AIR SC 746. Gbemre v Shell (2005) Suit No. FHC/B/CS/53/05. General Secretary West Pakistan Salt Miners Labour Union (CBA) Khewara, Jhelum v The Director, Industries and Mineral Development (1994) SCMR 2061. Guerra v Italy (1998) 26 Eur. Ct. H.R. 357. Ikpede v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1973) AUNLR 61. Irou v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (Unreported) Suit No; W/ 89/71, Warri High Court. Jimoh Lawani & Ors v West African Portland Cement Company Ltd (Unreported) Suit No: AB /82/71/13/7/72. Juan Antonio Oposa and Others v The Honourable Tulgencio S. factoran and another

(1993) GR No: 101083, July 30.

K. Ramakrishman v State of Kerala (1999) AIR 385. Kirloskar Bros Ltd v ESI Corporation (1996) 2 SCC 682. Lanoux Arbitration, (1957), 24 ILR 101, 123. Leaders, Inc. v Godawari Marble Industries (Supreme Court of Nepal, Oct. 31, 10995). Lopez Ostra v Spain (1994) 20 Eur. Ct. H.R. 277. M.C. Mehta v Kamal Nath and Others (1997) 1SCC 388. M.C. Mehta v Union of India, AIR (1986) 2SCC 176. M.I. Builders Pvt. Ltd. v Radhey Shyam Sahu (1999) SC 2468. Maya Indigenous Community of the Toledo District v Belize (2004) case 12.053, Report No. 62/04, OEA/Ser.L/V/II. 122 Doc. 5 rev. 1, 308. Maya Indigenous Community of Toledo District v Belize (2004) Inter.Am. Chr. McGhee v National Coal Board (1973) 1 WLR 1. Meyers (Next friend of) v Stanley (2003) AJ 685. Nepa v Alli (1992) 8 NWLR (pt. 259) 279. Nigeria National Petroleum Corporation v Sele (2004) ALL FWLR (pt. 223) 1859. North Sea Continental Shelf Case, ICJ Rep. (1996), 46-47. Nuclear Test Case (Australia V. France) ICJ. Rep. (1974), 388. Nvogoro v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1973) RSLR 75. Odim v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1974) RSLR 93. Olga Tellis v Bombay Municipal Corporation (1986) AIR SC 180. Onervildiz v Turkey (2004) XII 41 Eur. Ct. H.R. 20. People United for Better living in Calcutta v State of West Bengal (1993) AIR 215. Petro Props (pty) Ltd v Barlow and Another (2006) 5 SA 160. R v IRC, exp. National Federation of Self-Employed and Small Business Ltd (1982) AC 617. R.C.C. (Nig) Ltd v Edonwonyi (2003) 4 NWLR (pt. 811) 513. Rayner v United Kingdom (1986) Application 9310/81, 47 D & R 1-14. Rural Litigation and Entitlement Kendra V. State of U.P. AIR (1985), SC652. Ryland v Fletcher (1865) 3 H & C 774. S v France (1990) Application 13728/88, 65 D & R, 250. Saramaka People v Suriname (2007) Inter-Am. Chr. Seismograph service (Nigeria) Limited v Ogbeni (1976) 4 SC 85. SERAC v Federal Republic of Nigeria (Communication 155/96, Case No: ACHPR/COMM/A044/1). Shela Zia .v. WAPDA PLD (1994) SC 693. Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited v Abel Isaiah (2001) 5 SC (pt. 11) 1. Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited v Chief G.B.A. Tiebo VII and Others (2005) 4 SCM 132. Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited v Chief Otoko and Others (1990) 6NWLR (pt. 159) 657. Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited v Farah (1997) 6 NWLR (pt. 508) 236. Snell v Farrell (1990) 2 SCR 311. SP Gupta v Union of India (1985) AIR SC 149. State of Himachal Pradesh v Ganesh Wood products (1996) AIR SC 149. Subhash Kumar v. State of Biahr (1991), AIR SC, 420. Taskin and Others v Turkey (2006) 42 EHRR 50. Tergniet and Toekoms Action Group v Outeniqua Kreosootpale (pty) Ltd (Unreported) case 10083/2008, 23 january 2009.

Tory Canyon Disaster's Case (1976) 6 ILM 480. Trial Smelter Arbitration (1957) 33 AJIL, 182. Uhunmwangbo v Uhunmwangbo (1992) 2 NWLR (pt. 226) 709. Umudje v Shell Petroleum Nigeria Limited (1975) 9-11 SC 115. Vellore Citizens Welfare Forum v Union of India (1996) 5 SCC 647. Walker Estate v York-Finch General Hospital (2001) SCR 647. Woon Tan Kan&Ors v. Asian Rare Earth, Civil Suit No. 02-313-92. Yahaya v State (2002) 3 MJSC 103. Yanomani v Brazil (1894-1985) Inter-Am-Chr., Case 7615.

LIST OF STATUTES

Additional Protocol to the American Declaration of Human Rights (1988) African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (1982) American Convention on Human Rights (1969) Associated gas re-Injection Act (2004) Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal (1989) Bergen Declaration on Sustainable Development (1990) Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety (2000) Constitution of Federal Republic of Nigeria (1999) Constitution of South African (1996) Convention for the Regulation of Whaling (1946) Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (1988) Convention on Biological Diversity (1992) Convention on Civil and Political Rights (1966) Convention on Civil Liability for Oil Pollution Damage (1992) Convention on Economics, Social and Cultural Rights (1966) Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context (1991) Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (1973) Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats (1979) Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (1979) Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) Convention on Wetlands of International Importance especially water Fowls Habitat (1971)Criminal Code Act (2004) Environmental Impact Assessment Act (Decree No. 86 1992) European Convention for the Protection of Human rights and Freedom (1950) Factory Act (2004) Harmful Waste (Special criminal provisions) Act (1988) Hydro Carbon Oil Refineries Act (2004) Inland Fisheries Act (2004) Minerals and Mining Act (2007) National Environmental Standard Regulations Enforcement Agency Act (2007) National Oil Spillage Detection and Response Agency Act (2006) Niger Delta Development Commission Act (2000) Oil in Navigable Water Act (2004) Oil Pipelines Act (2004) Petroleum Act (2004) Sea Fisheries Act (2004) Stockholm Declaration (1972) The Constitution (Forty Amendment Act,) India (1976) The Land Use Act (1978) UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982) UN Declaration on Environment and Development (1992)

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) Water Resources Act (2004) World Charter for Nature (1982)

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AG	Attorney General
AGF	Attorney General of Federation
ANLR	All Nigerian Law Report
Anor	Another
ACHR	African Commission on Human Rights
AMCHR	American Commission on Human Rights
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AIR	India Reporter
AUNLR	Awolowo University Nigerian Law Report
CJN	Chief Justice of Nigeria
DPR	Department of Petroleum Resources
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ed. /eds.	Editor/editors
EHRR	European Human Rights Report
ESR	Economic and Social Rights
etc.	et cetera and so forth
EU	European Union
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
JCA	Justice of Court of Appeal
JSC	Justice of Supreme Court
LFN	Laws of Federation of Nigeria
MOSOP	Movement for the Survival of Ogoni People
M oF	Ministry of Environment
NWLR	Nigerian Weekly Law Report
NLR	Nigeria Law Report
NDDC	Niger Delta Development Commission
NESREA	National Environmental Standard Regulation Establishment Agency
NOSDREA	National Oil Spillage Detection and Response Establishment Agency
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OAS	Organisation of American States
RSLR	Rivers State Law Report
SC	Supreme Court
SCJ	Supreme Court Judgment
SCNJ	Supreme Court of Nigeria Judgment
SCMLR	Supreme Court Monthly Report
SCJ	Supreme Court Justices
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UILR	University of Ife Law Report
UN	United Nations
Vol.	Volume

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

In any nation, developmental process has always had a close interface with its surroundings called the environment.¹ History has shown that the process of development has done enormous damage to the natural environment because it has led to pollution of the essential elements of the environment (air, water, and land).² This is due to the over-use of the available resources that do not only belong to the current generations but also the future generations.³ This suggests that the process of development has not been compatible with the natural environment.⁴

Consequently, humankind, all over the world, is encountering the consequences of the decline in the ecosystem.⁵ In countries like Nigeria, sufferers of these consequences are mainly the less privileged and the tribal minorities who usually shouldered high level of environmental abuse.⁶ By this, a number of basic

¹ See the preamble to the "Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment", Stockholm 1972. This Declaration requires members' states to safeguard the natural environment that are necessary for human survival in the course of development. ² See the 5th IPCC Report Retrieved from <u>http://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar5/wg1/</u> [accessed on 27/11/2013].

² See the 5th IPCC Report Retrieved from <u>http://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar5/wg1/</u> [accessed on 27/11/2013]. See also United Nations Environmental Programme, "Global Environment Outlook" *UNEP*, 2007, 1-3; United Nations, "Resilient People, Resilient Planet: A Future Worth Choosing" United Nations, 2012, 1-5; World Commission on Environment and Development, *Our Common Future, From One Earth to One World*, WCED, 1987, 4-8.

³ Ibid.

⁴ See for instance principle 2 of the "Stockholm Declaration" which requires state to safeguard the natural environment for the benefit of current generations and of generations to come.

⁵ See the Report of the World Commission on Environment, UN Doc A/RES/42/187; United Nations Environmental Programme, *Global Environment Outlook, UNEP*, 2007, 1-3.

⁶ UNDP, *Niger Delta Human Development Report*, UNDP, 2006, 1; for more discussion on this, see Francis O. Adeola, "Environmental Injustice and Human Rights Abuse: The States, MNCs and Repression of Minority Groups in the World" (2001) *Vol. 8 No. 1, Human Ecology Review*, 39; Gurr, Ted. R. "Why Minorities Rebel: A global Analysis of Communal Mobilization and Conflict Since 1945" (1993) *IPSR* 14, 161-201.

human rights are increasingly being put at risk.⁷ This is because the right to life can be affected by spoilage of resources while property and cultural rights can be endangered by interference with the land of the community.⁸

Thus, the early 1970s witnessed ecological consciousness which resulted in the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment, held in Stockholm in 1972.⁹ The Conference drove the states' attention to the need to protect the environment which serves as the resource base for human survival and realisation of basic human rights.¹⁰ As a result of this realisation, states began to make efforts towards putting in place the legal framework to protect the environment. This was done through negotiation and conclusion of treaties at international level.¹¹ and making of laws and regulations at national level.¹²

Consequently, states began to appreciate that a clean and healthful environment is fundamental in order to realise basic the human rights, such as the

⁷ See Human Rights Council, *Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights on Analytical study on the relationship between human rights and the environment*, Human Rights Council, 2011, 6-14. For more discussion on this see: Vibhute K.I., "Environment, Present and Future Generations: Inter-Generational Equity, Justice and Responsibility" (1998) vol. 38, *Indian J.Int'l L.*, 65-73; Midgley, "The End of Anthropocentrism" in Attfield and Belsey (eds.), *Philosophy and the Natural Environment Royal*, Institute of Philosophy Supplement No. 36, 1994, 111; Symonides J., "The Human Right to a Clean Balanced and Protected Environment" (1992) 20/1 *Int'l J. Of Legal Information*, 24-40 at 29; Contra Downs J.A., "A Healthy and Ecologically Balanced Environment: An Argument for a Third Generation Right" (1993) 3 *Duke J. Comp. & Int'l L* 351-385.

⁸ UNEP, "Human Rights and the Environment: the Joint Report OHCHR and UNEP" United Nations Environmental Programme, 2004, 8-17. For more discussion, see: Anderson, M.R. and Ahmed A., "Assessing Environmental Damage under Indian Law" (1996) 5(4) *RECIEL*, 335-341; Anderson, M.R., "International Environmental Law in Indian Courts" (1998) 7(1) *RECIEL*, 22-31; Jariwala, C.M., "A Judicial Approach in the Fire Works Noise Pollution: A Critical Overview" (1999) *All Indian Reporter Journal Section* 72-74 ; La Vina A.G.M., "The Right to a Sound Environment in the Philippines: The Significance of the *Minors Oposa Case*" (1994) 3(4) *RECIEL*, 246-252; Sachs Aron, "Upholding Human Rights and Environmental Justice" In L. Starke (ed.), *State of the World* W.W. Norton and Company, New York, 1996, 131.

⁹ See "Stockholm Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment", 16 June 1972, U.N. Doc. A/CONF.48/14 Rev. 1at 3 (1973).

¹⁰ See Principle 1 of the "Stockholm Declaration" 1972.

¹¹ See for example, "International Convention for the Protection of Birds" (Paris) 638 UNTS 185; "International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling" (Washington) 161 UNTS 72; "International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution of the Sea by Oil" (London) 327 UNTS 3.

¹² For instance, the adoption of the National Policy on Environment for Nigeria was in part as a result of the participation of Nigeria in the Stockholm Conference.

right to life, health, family life, personal integrity, and development.¹³ This is because every state depends on the protection of the environment as necessities of life.¹⁴ The push to human rights approach began with linking of human rights to instances of environmental destruction, such as the Bhopal disaster.¹⁵ It has turned out to be more accepted over time that human rights and environment are so intrinsically intertwined that a clean and healthy environment is seen as a human right.¹⁶ It is on this premise that Kofi Anan, in his Millennium Report, drew our attentions to the interrelationship between human rights and the environment. The report stresses environmental accountability for bequeathing to future generations a healthful and clean environment.¹⁷ It further added that to realise and understand human rights, there is the need to explore the "environmental dimension of eco-system services" vital to the security of lives and other basic rights.¹⁸

To show the extent of relationship between human rights and the environment, researchers have examined the extent to which one depends on the other. Some argue that protection of the environment is a good means of realising basic human rights.¹⁹ By this, it means that the end is achieving human rights but the road is through

¹³ See Principle 1 of the "Stockholm Declaration", 1972. For more discussion on this, see: Pathak R.S., "The Human Rights System as a Conceptual Framework for Environmental Law" in Brown Weiss (ed.), Environmental Change and International Law: New Challenges and Dimensions, UN University Press, Tokyo, (1992), 205-243; Shutkin W.A., "International Human Rights Law and the Earth: The Protection of Indigenous Peoples and the Environment" (1991) 31/3 Virginia j. of Int'l L., 479-511 at 504. ¹⁴ See the preamble to the Stockholm Declaration, 1972.

¹⁵ The Bhopal disaster is also referred to as the Bhopal gas tragedy that happened sometimes in December, 1984 in India. It occurred as a result of a gas leak from a pesticide plant company (Union Carbide India Limited) where lives and properties are claimed. Information on this is available at http://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/bhopal-set-to-mourn-28-years-of-infamy-when-india-couldnt-bringanderson-union-carbide-to-book/1/235289.html [accessed on the 25th January, 2013].

¹⁶ Pallemaerts M., "International Environmental Law From Stockholm to Rio: Back to the Future" in Sands P. (ed.), Greening International Law, Erath scan, London, 1993, 9-10; Roots E.F., "Population, Carrying Capacity and Environmental Processes" in Mahoney K.E., & Mahoney P., (ed.), Human Rights in the Twenty-first Century- A Global Challenge, Nijhoff, Dordrecht, 1993, 529-561. ¹⁷ United Nations Millennium Project, Task Force on Hunger, 2003, 43.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ See detail discussions of this in chapter 2 of this thesis.

environmental law.²⁰Another perspective places the two concepts in reversed position. It states that protection of human rights is a practical way of protecting the environment. Here, the end is achieving environmental protection but the road is through human rights laws.²¹ The modern approach sees the two concepts as inseparable as each depends on the other.²² The better perspective seems to be that human rights and the environment are inseparable. The reason is that protection of one necessitates the protection of the other. The thesis adopts this latter view of interconnectedness of human rights and the protection of the environment. In fact, security of lives and properties is the subject that connects environmental protection and human rights in places or communities that experience environmental degradation like the Niger Delta of Nigeria which is the main focus of this thesis.²³

Niger Delta of Nigeria consists of nine out of the 36 states making up the Federal Republic of Nigeria.²⁴ They are: Abia, Akwa-Ibom, Bayelsa, Cross-River, Delta, Edo, Imo, Ondo and Rivers States.²⁵ The three major states producing oil in high quantities are Delta, Bayelsa and Rivers States. Crude oil was originally discovered in large quantities at Oloibiri, a community in Bayelsa State.²⁶ This was

²⁰ See Dinal Shelton, "Human Rights, Health and Environmental Protection: Linkages in Law and Practice" being a background paper presented at the World Health Organisation, 2002, 6-7 &23.

²¹See Pathak, R.S "The Human Rights System as a Conceptual Framework for Environmental Law" In E. Brown Weiss (Ed). *Environmental Change and International Law- New Challenges and Dimensions*. Tokyo: UN University Press. 1992, 205-243; Symonides .J. "The Human Right to a Clean, Balanced and Protected Environment." (1992) 20 *International Journal of Legal Information*, 24-40; Karie Wolfe. "Greening the International Human Rights Sphere: Environmental Rights and the Draft Declaration of Principles on Human Rights and the Environment." (2003) 9 *Appeal: Review of Current Law and Law Reform*, 2003, 45-58.

²² Malgosia Fitzmaurice. "Linking Environment and Human Rights" (2004) 16(3) Journal of Environmental Law, 411-413.

²³ See principle 1 of the "Stockholm Declaration." See also interview with Dr Sam Agalihno in Ilorin, Kwara State, Nigeria on the 5th of May, 2012.
²⁴ Wahab Egbewole, "Millennium Development Goal and the Niger-Delta in The Jurist (2006) A

 ²⁴ Wahab Egbewole, "Millennium Development Goal and the Niger-Delta in The Jurist (2006) A Publication of the Law Students' Society, University of Ilorin, 36.
 ²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Paul M. Lubeck, Michal J. Watts & Ronnie Lipschutz, "Convergent Interest US Energy and Securing Nigerian Democracy", International Policy Report Retrieved from <u>http://www.ciponline.org/</u><u>NIGERIA FINAL.pdf</u> [accessed 21st September, 2011].

discovered in 1956 and the nation rejoiced as this discovery was seen as a great opportunity to develop and boost the nation's economy.²⁷ Oil discovery was also seen by the people of the region as an opportunity to improve their well being. However, the story appears to have taken a new look as the resultant effect of the growth and development of the nation's economy was and is still a destruction and worsening of the nation's environment.²⁸ The issue of environmental problem and degradation in the Niger Delta and how it has hindered the enjoyment of basic human rights to the Delta's people has been acknowledged at national and international sphere,²⁹ including scholars,³⁰ governmental and non-governmental organisations.³¹

Therefore, the need for human rights approach to environmental protection in the Niger Delta arises for obvious reasons. Firstly, poverty continues to escalate in the region due to the activities of oil companies. This is because the right of the people to the source of income and livelihood has been jeopardised by environmental hazards. Secondly, the health conditions of the people in the region are increasingly being affected. Thirdly, the rights of future generations to a clean and healthy environment are also being threatened. This thesis is therefore sought to be written at a time when the protection and conservation of the environment have become among the foremost concerns of the local and international community. Environmental deterioration,

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ World Bank: "Defining an Environmental Strategy for the Niger Delta" World Bank, 1995, 40-46. For discussion on this, see Aluko M.A.O.," Sustainable Development, Environmental Degradation and the Entrenchment of Poverty in the Niger Delta of Nigeria" (2004) 15(1) *Kamla-Raj J. Hum. Ecol.*, 63-68.

²⁹ World Bank: "Defining an Environmental Strategy for the Niger Delta" World Bank, 1995, 40-46.

³⁰ Akobo Mofia, "Nightmare In Oil and the Nigerian Environment" (1998) cited in Aluko M.A.O., Sustainable Development, Environmental Degradation and the Entrenchment of Poverty in the Niger Delta of Nigeria (2004) 15(1) *Kamla-Raj J. Hum. Ecol.*, 69; Aluyor Victoria, "Mark of the Beast, the Multilateral Agreement on Investment and the Nigerian Women in Oil and the Nigerian Environmental Benin-City, Nigeria" (1998) cited in Aluko M.A.O., "Sustainable Development, Environmental Degradation and the Entrenchment of Poverty in the Niger Delta of Nigeria" (2004) 15(1) *Kamla-Raj J. Hum. Ecol.*, 70.

³¹ See Amnesty International *Nigeria: Petroleum, Pollution and Poverty in the Niger Delta,* Amnesty International Publications, United Kingdom, 2009; UNDP, Niger Delta Human Development Report UNDP, 2006, 2.