DEVELOPMENT OF INTEGRATED ELECTROCOAGULATION AND MEMBRANE PROCESS FOR WATER RECLAMATION FROM BIOTREATED PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT

BY

AMINA TAHREEN

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science in Engineering

> Kulliyyah of Engineering International Islamic University Malaysia

> > SEPTEMBER 2021

ABSTRACT

Electrocoagulation (EC) is a simple, environmentally friendly and cost effective process, when integrated with membrane filtration, becomes very attractive for developing a sustainable water reclamation system. The critical parameters namely initial pH, time and current density largely impact the EC process efficiency. Few works have been done on observing the interaction of these critical parameters and the possible combined effect on the overall pollutant removal efficiency. Also, with membrane pore blocking study, the efficiency of the overall integrated process can be enhanced by determining the dominant fouling mechanism. Therefore, the knowledge of the combined effect of critical parameter interaction followed by membrane fouling study would enhance the overall efficiency of the integrated process to sustainably reclaim water. Using aluminum electrodes with interelectrode distance of 10 mm, with a set range of initial pH, current density, and time of 3-8, 40-160 mA/cm² and 15-60 minutes, respectively, the effect of the three critical variables were investigated on synthetic wastewater, representing biotreated palm oil mill effluent (BPOME). Next, a pore blocking study was undertaken with the EC treated BPOME after crossflow membrane filtration process with transmembrane pressure of 0.5 bar and pore size of 1 kDa. The optimum Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD) removal of 71.5% was determined at pH 6, current density of 160 mA/cm2 (with current 1.75 A) at EC time of 15 minutes. The experiment was validated with real BPOME, resulting in the removal efficiency of 60.7% COD, 99.91% turbidity, 100% total suspended solids (TSS) and 95.7% color. The interaction of parameters observed in this study indicated a synergistic contribution of initial pH and current density in removing maximum wastewater COD in 15 minutes of EC. After following with membrane ultrafiltration process, the COD removal increased to 71.7%, and the dominant fouling mechanism prevailing was cake formation as determined by fitting with Hermia's pore blocking models. EC with activated carbon (AC) addition, run with the optimized parameters, significantly improved the final treated quality with a 100% TSS, 99% of both color and turbidity and 84.6% COD removal. The best permeate quality was achieved with 1 wt. % addition of AC in EC reactor, and the removal of TSS, turbidity and color was nearly 100% and COD was removed 99.7% with final value of 5 ± 1 mg/L, which are within the range of reusable process water standard. Also, addition of AC in EC, sustainably enhanced the final treated effluent quality with fouling mitigation in the subsequent membrane ultrafiltration.

ثحبلا ةصلاخ

التخثير الكهربائي هو عملية بسيطة وصديقة للبيئة وفعالة من حيث التكلفة، عندما تتكامل مع الترشيح الغشائي، تصبح جذابة للغاية لتطوير نظام استصلاح المياه المستدام. تؤثر العوامل الحرجة وهي الرقم الهيدروجيني البدائي، والوقت وكثافة التيار إلى حد كبير على كفاءة عملية التخثير الكهربائي. تم إجراء بعض الدراسات على مراقبة تفاعل هذه العوامل الحرجة واحتمالية التأثير المشترك على الكفاءة الكلية لإزالة الملوثات. لذلك، فإن معرفة التأثير المشترك لتفاعل العوامل الحرجة من شأنه أن يعزز تحسين عوامل التخثير الكهربائي لتحقيق أقصى قدر من الكفاءة بموارد محدودة. باستخدام أقطاب كهربائية مصنوعة من الألومنيوم بمسافة بين الأقطاب الكهربائية 10 مل متر على مياه الصرف الصحى الصناعي، والتي تمثل تصريف مطحنة زيت النخيل المعالج حيوياً، مع قيم محددة من الرقم الهيدروجيني البدائي، وكثافة التيار، والوقت من 3-8، 40–160 مللي أمبير/سم مربع و15 إلى 60 دقيقة، على التوالي، وتم التحقق في التأثير على المتغيرات الثلاث الحرجة. كما تم تحديد عامل الإزالة المثلي لطلب الأكسجين الكيميائي بنسبة 71.5٪ عند الرقم الهيدروجيني 6، وكثافة التيار 160 مللي أمبير/سم مربع (مع التيار 1.75 أمبير) في وقت تخثير كهربائي لمدة 15 دقيقة. كما تم التحقق من صحة التجربة باستخدام عينة حقيقية من تصريف مطحنة زيت النخيل المعالج حيوياً، نتج عنه كفاءة إزالة بنسبة 60.7٪ من طلب الأكسجين الكيميائي، وعكارة 99.91٪، و100٪ إجمالي المواد الصلبة العالقة و95.7٪ من الألوان. إن إزالة كمية كبيرة من الملوثات في فترة زمنية مدتما 15 دقيقة مع عوامل محسّنة أثناء عملية التخثير الكهربائي أمر ملحوظ
-بالنسبة إلى حل بديل لمعالجة مياه الصرف الصحى الذي لا يتطلب استخدامًا مكثفًا للمواد الكيميائية. أشار تفاعل العوامل الذي لوحظ في هذه الدراسة إلى مساهمة تأزريه للرقم الهيدروجيني البدائي وكثافة التيار في إزالة الحد الأقصى من طلب الأكسجين الكيميائي لمياه الصرف الصحى في 15 دقيقة من التخثير الكهربائي. بعد ذلك، أجريت دراسة لسد المسام باستخدام عينة معالجة من تصريف مطحنة زيت النخيل المعالج حيوياً بعد عملية ترشيح غشاء الجريان التقاطع مع ضغط الغشاء 0.5 بار و1كيلو دالتون. بعد هذه العملية، زادت كفاءة إزالة طلب الأكسجين الكيميائي إلى 71.7٪، وكانت آلية تلوث الغشاء السائد هي ترسب طبقة من الجسيمات الصلبة كما تم تحديده من خلال التطبيق مع نماذج Hermiaلسد المسام. التخثير الكهربائي المعزز من خلال إضافة الكربون المنشط، الذي يتم تشغيله باستخدام العوامل المحسّنة، يحسن بشكل كبير جودة المعالجة النهائية مع إزالة 100٪ من المواد الصلبة العالقة، كما أنه لوحظ إزالة 99٪ لكل من اللون والعكارة. وقد تم في هذه المرحلة تحقيق الحد الأقصى لإزالة طلب الأكسجين الكيميائي (82٪) بقيمة نمائية قدرها 306 ملجم/لتر. باستخدام العوامل المحسَّنة، عزز التخثير الكهربائي مع إضافة الكربون المنشط من جودة
- - - ستخدام العامل الملقا المقابل العامل العامل العوامل المستخدام الملك المستخدمة في المدار. المستخدام من ت تصريف النفايات السائلة المعالجة إلى حد التخفيف من التلوث في الخطوة التالية وهي ترشيح غشاء الجريان التقاطيع. تم تحقيق أفضل نتيجة بإضافة الكربون النشط بنسبة وزن 1 بالمئة في مفاعل التخثير الكيميائي، وإزالة المواد الصلبة العالقة والعكارة واللون حوالي 100٪ وتمت إزالة طلب الأكسجين الكيميائي بنسبة 99.7٪ بقيمة نحائية قدرها 5±1 ملجم/لتر، والتي تقع في نطاق معيار المياه القابلة لإعادة الاستخدام. كما أن إضافة الكربون المنشط في التخثير الكهربائي قد عزز بشكل مستدام جودة النفايات السائلة المعالجة النهائية مع تخفيف القاذورات في الترشيح باستخدام الغشاء الفائق التالي.

APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that in my opinion, it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science in Engineering

> …………………………… Mohammed Saedi Jami Supervisor

…………………………… Fathilah Ali Co-supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science in Engineering.

> ………………………………… Md Zahangir Alam Internal Examiner

> …………………………… Mohammad Moniruzzaman External Examiner

This thesis was submitted to the Department of Biotechnology Engineering and is accepted as a fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science in Engineering.

> ……………………………. Mohammed Saedi Jami Head, Department of Biotechnology Engineering

This thesis was submitted to the Kulliyyah of Engineering and is accepted as a fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science in Engineering.

> ……………………………………… Sany Izan Ihsan Dean, Kulliyyah of Engineering

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Amina Tahreen

Signature …………………………………… Date ……………………..

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

DEVELOPMENT OF INTEGRATED ELECTROCOAGULATION AND MEMBRANE PROCESS FOR WATER RECLAMATION FROM BIOTREATED PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT

I declare that the copyright holders of this thesis are jointly owned by the student and IIUM.

Copyright © 2021 Amina Tahreen and International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

By signing this form, I acknowledged that I have read and understood the IIUM Intellectual Property Right and Commercialization policy.

Affirmed by Amina Tahreen

……………………………. ……………….. Signature Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

All glory is due to Allah, the Almighty, whose Grace and Mercies have been with me throughout the duration of my program. Although, it has been tasking, His Mercy and Blessings enabled the completion of this thesis.

I am most indebted to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Mohammed Saedi Jami, whose enduring disposition, kindness, promptitude, thoroughness and friendship have facilitated the successful completion of my work. I put on record and appreciate his detailed comments, useful suggestions and inspiring queries which have considerably improved this thesis. His brilliant grasp of the aim and content of this work led to his insightful comments, suggestions and queries which helped me a great deal. Despite his commitments, he took time to listen and attend to me whenever requested. The moral support he extended to me is in no doubt a boost that helped in building and writing the thesis of this research work. I am also highly grateful to my co-supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fathilah Ali, whose support and cooperation contributed to the outcome of this work. Special thanks to my field supervisor from Sime Darby Plantation as well, Nik Muhd Farid Mat Yasin, for his valuable time and practical insights on my project from the industrial perspective. I must acknowledge the thoughtful support of Prof. Dr. Abdullah Mamun with experimental resources. I would like to also acknowledge the kind support of brother Muzzammil Ngatiman for collecting and providing the real biotreated palm oil mill effluent from Negeri Sembilan based palm oil mil, for the experiments in this research.

Besides, my strong appreciation also remains for the lab facilities of Kulliyyah of Engineering, IIUM, namely Kinetic Lab, Chemistry Lab and Bioenvironmental Lab that enabled a comfortable environment and equipment to carry out all the experiments, and the support of the lab facilitators for their maintenance and guidance for equipment operation. Also, I'm grateful for the support of my peer postgraduate student group whose constant motivation and resourcefulness greatly contributed to make my journey even smoother. Furthermore, I express my deep appreciation for the Tuition Fee Waiver (TFW) 2019 scheme by Kulliyyah of Engineering, for believing in me to be a leader for the postgraduate students and allowing me to contribute for the betterment of the engineering faculty. Also, I acknowledge the support of the Ministry of Education (MOE) Malaysia for granting a Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (FRGS), project no. FRGS-19-194-0803, for financially supporting this research.

Lastly, my deepest gratitude goes to my dear parents, siblings, and friends; for their prayers, understanding, motivation and endurance all the way.

Once again, we glorify Allah for His endless mercy on us one of which is enabling us to successfully round off the efforts of writing this thesis. All praise and thanks to the Almighty.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

LIST OF SYMBOLS

- *J* Permeate Flux
- Al Aluminum
- Fe Iron
- kg Kilogram
- L Litre
- mg Milligram
- µm Micrometer
- nm Nanometer
- mS milliSiemens
- Q Flowrate
- rpm Rotation Per Minute
- T Time
- ∆ Transmembrane pressure drop
- *Rm* Membrane Resistance
- μ Absolute viscosity
- g Gram

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

Rising scarcity of fresh water is a global concern. According to the World Economic Forum (WEF), the global water crisis ranks as the number four risk in terms of impact on the society till date. A significant decrease in the available freshwater quality and quantity is raising concerns on consequent impact on not only human health and ecosystem but also the world economy (WEF, 2020). Besides, the United Nations (UN) realizing the importance and urgency of freshwater crisis mitigation, placed "Clean Water and Sanitation" as the number six goal to be achieved by 2030 under the movement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDG). Therefore, Target 6.3 under goal 6 (SDG) is to improve water quality, wastewater treatment and safe reuse. By UN definition, the accomplishment of Target 6.3 (one of the eight targets to achieve SDG goal 6) is visualized by breaking it down to the following four measures (SDG 6 Synthesis Report, 2018):

- 1. Reducing pollution
- 2. Abolishing dumping and minimizing the emission of hazardous materials and chemicals
- 3. Cutting down the quantity of untreated wastewater by half
- 4. Substantially increasing recycling and safe reuse globally.

It is evident that emerging industries and urban societies are major drivers for global economic boost. However, disregarding the environmental consequences strictly on appropriate waste treatment and disposal, will sooner or later, not only tax the world economy, but also can build up to the collapse of the ecosystem sustainability, even impacting climate change in the long run.

For instance, Malaysia being one of the top global palm oil producers, generated 19.86 million tons of crude palm oil (CPO) in 2019 alone, which is a marginal increase by 1.8% (Malaysian Palm Oil Board, 2020). With every ton of CPO produced, huge amount of water is employed for extraction processes on fresh fruit bunches (FFB) and about 50% of the water is disposed as effluents (Ahmad et al., 2003). Besides, the effluents are high in organic matter and nutrients that are nontoxic but carry potential to induce algal growth and eutrophication overtime (Reilly et al., 2019), while the conventional treatment methods fail to meet the environmental discharge standards set by Department of Environment (DOE) of Malaysia (Kamyab et al., 2018). Similarly, most wastewater effluents besides treated palm oil mill effluents (POME) (Bashir et al., 2019; Daud et al., 2013; Kamyab et al., 2018; Othman et al., 2014), from several industries such as cheese whey effluent (Tirado et al., 2018), municipal wastewater (Nawarkar & Salkar, 2019), mineral processing wastewater (Wu et al., 2019) and many other types of wastewater are discharged into rivers after conventional treatments. Typical treatments before discharge into rivers involve physical, biological and/or chemical processes.

The type of treatment varies depending on the different types of wastewater and pollutants. The conventional processes involved in wastewater treatment include advanced oxidation processes (Boczkaj & Fernandes, 2017), biological processes (Huang et al., 2017; Iskandar et al., 2018; Liew et al., 2014), physico-chemical processes (Bhuptawat et al., 2007; Lin & Chen, 1997; Sher et al., 2013), and emerging technologies namely membrane filtration (Teng et al., 2018) and adsorption (Amosa et al., 2016). Advanced oxidation processes require strong oxidants making the

wastewater treatment taxing in terms of safety and cost. Biological processes on the other hand, demand strictly controlled conditions with long retention times, larger footprint, and unwanted by-products generation (Abu Hasan et al., 2020; Deveci et al., 2019). Chemical processes need extensive chemical dosages that not only adds to process cost, but also makes downstream processes complex, with increased risk of secondary contamination (Jiang, 2015). Membrane filtration and adsorption alone cannot efficiently treat wastewater, unless integrated with thorough pre-treatment processes (Khan & Boddu, 2021; Saleem et al., 2019). Or else, the processes become unproductive overtime due to pore blocking with pollutants and loss of flux (flowrate of clean treated effluent per unit surface area). Therefore, wastewater treatment research is greatly allured to electrochemical processes (Hakizimana et al., 2017). In 1889, electricity employed water treatment was first proposed in UK, while electrocoagulation (EC) achieved its first patent in the US in 1909 (Chen, 2004). Even though EC was successfully applied in the US in large scale drinking water treatment in 1946, it failed to gain global popularity for wider applications limited by power supply costs and huge capital investment (Chen, 2004).

However, constant progress in EC research remarkably upheld the significance of EC and its promising impact in wastewater treatment. Amongst all electrochemical processes, EC stands out as the most sustainable alternative to treat wastewater due to its simple setup, small footprint, ability to treat large quantity of water with no extensive chemical treatment (Moussa et al., 2017; Sahu et al., 2014). Moreover, the versatility of the process and its setup enables EC to treat a wide range of wastewater across industries and domestic works with different types of pollutants. Many researchers worldwide had conducted several EC studies till date, to treat various types of wastewater and achieved promising outcomes. Some EC studies were taken further by integrating with other processes, progressing into advanced wastewater systems to produce cleaner effluents. Some of the notable works on EC are carried out by Bashir et al. (2019), Changmai et al. (2019), Deveci et al. (2019), Dimoglo et al. (2019), Khemila et al. (2018), Nasrullah et al. (2020), Nawarkar & Salkar (2019), Sher et al., (2020) and more.

Of all the current processes employed in the POME and wastewater treatments namely aerobic/anaerobic digestion, adsorption, chemical coagulation, etc., EC is an attractive alternative as it does not require heavy chemical extensive processes and is relatively quick and inexpensive and a simple process that has immense potential to sustainably treat large quantities of water at once (Naje et al., 2017). EC is an attractive electrochemical process with simple set up, inexpensive, environmentally friendly procedure requiring less carbon footprint in terms of space and chemical requirement and therefore, carries a promising potential to be scaled up to treat huge amount of POME at the industrial level. However, it is important to understand the critical parameters of EC and the parameter interaction effect on wastewater treatment efficiency. Determining the synergistic or antagonistic influence of possible parameter interaction on pollutant removal, contributes to deliver an enhanced EC performance.

To treat the wastewater to the standard of water reclamation for reusability, EC needs an effective integration with an additional separation process (Afanga et al., 2020). Strictly considering the environmental and economic sustainability, along with the simplicity in set up, in situ operation and maintenance, EC is a desirable fit as a pretreatment for the booming membrane technology, greatly mitigating membrane fouling. Typically, strong oxidants such as peroxides are added to enhance wastewater treatment efficiency with EC (Bashir et al., 2019). Even though, oxidants can breakdown colloidal pollutants in the wastewater, they are hazardous and not environmentally friendly. Hence, combining activated carbon (AC), a relatively green support (compared to

peroxides), has been found to work very well to enhance EC performance with remarkable reduction in the wastewater pollutant quantity (Barhoumi et al., 2019; Sher et al., 2021).

Membrane technology is popular for producing consistent permeate quality to meet more stringent water requirements such as for drinking, urban reuse, industrial reuse etc. (Ezugbe & Rathilal, 2020). To tackle the issue of membrane pore blocking (fouling) over time, that declines membrane performance and reduces membrane integrity, hybrid membrane systems are increasingly being studied for an overall enhancement of treatment efficiency (Khan & Boddu, 2021). The emerging studies of hybrid membrane-based processes with integrated EC depict immense potential for treating wastewater for water reclamation for specific applications such as irrigation, industrial or urban reuse. Therefore, integration of EC with membrane process, for water reclamation from BPOME is a promising direction as EC is able to sustainably remove a huge amount of pollutants as colloidal particles, that can significantly reduce membrane fouling. Hence, the EC-membrane hybrid process is not only a promising treatment process for contributing to mitigating environmental pollution from the final industrial effluents, but also would lead to freshwater scarcity mitigation with the resulting water reusability.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT AND SIGNIFICANCE

This study focuses on EC-membrane process as post treatment for BPOME and investigation of its ability to sustainably reclaim process water for industrial reuse. BPOME is the final discharge effluent of the palm oil industries, that hold the potential to be reused in the industry with a sustainable water reclamation system, mitigating fresh water scarcity and environmental pollution. To study the hybrid process, the optimization of critical operational parameters of EC are mandatory to establish for BPOME treatment. Many researchers have studied the effect of operational parameters on EC efficiency. However, few studies are found that investigate the parameter interaction and the combined parametric effect on pollutant removal % in EC for BPOME. Therefore, observing the effect of critical operating parameters namely current density, initial pH and time, and their combined effect on pollutant removal efficiency and EC optimization in this study, propels the advancement of this sustainable technology in the palm oil industries. Besides, the fouling studies of the following membrane filtration is necessary to explain the pore blocking mechanism in play while purifying the EC treated effluent that started with BPOME, and providing information for industrial scale up and specific fouling mitigation strategies. As another stepping stone for sustainably producing cleaner effluents for discharge and potential water reclamation, this study paves a way to the direction of accomplishing the SDG 6, that strongly aims to reduce and reuse industrial effluents with its Target 6.3 (SDG 6 Synthesis Report, 2018).

The effluent from the proposed EC-membrane process is expected to not only meet the discharge standards, but also to be reusable in the palm oil industry as process water. EC process involves application of current on the wastewater through metal electrodes, destabilising the charge of the pollutants and separating them in the form of flocs. In the process of EC, the electrodes (anodes) reduce in size due to metal dissolution. Therefore, the electrodes need to be replaced from time to time. Besides EC, membrane technology is a booming field for separation processes. However, the COD, turbidity, color and TSS in BPOME are too high to be treated with membrane leading to instant fouling and membrane dysfunctionality. To combat this issue, EC-

membrane for BPOME stands out as the most suitable, sustainable and environmentally friendly alternative.

Studies have shown promising outcomes employing EC-membrane process for treating various types of wastewater namely textile wastewater, oily wastewater and bilge water. However, a gap remains in exploring the integrated process for treating BPOME. The EC critical process parameters vary with different wastewater types. There is a need to understand the critical parameter (current density, pH and time) interaction effects on pollutant removal efficiency. Also, in the studies relating ECmembrane integrated processes, there is a lack of membrane fouling study, which is important to understand the dominant fouling mechanism for EC treated BPOME. The resulting fouling constants determined contribute as raw materials for industrial scale up of the membrane filtration system and also enable strategic development of appropriate antifouling strategies. Also, it is interesting to investigate the potential enhancement of the EC-membrane process by coupling EC with powdered activated carbon (AC). A consequent improved flux and potential fouling mitigation along with improved permeate quality can support a long term membrane integrity, maintaining low footprint, easy maintenance and environmental sustainability, besides enhanced treatment efficiency.

1.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

The overall aim of this research is to propose a sustainable water reclamation process for BPOME reusability in the palm oil industry. Therefore, by exploring the potential of the EC-membrane integrated process, to achieve the aim, this research can be broken down to the following objectives:

- 1. To optimize the operational conditions namely current density, initial pH and time of EC process on synthetic wastewater using RSM and verify with real BPOME
- 2. To establish the best pore blocking model on the crossflow ultrafiltration process for the EC treated BPOME
- 3. To enhance EC-membrane process by coupling EC with the addition of commercially available adsorbent and investigating its effect on final effluent quality and membrane fouling

1.4 SCOPE OF RESEARCH

This research focuses on EC process followed by membrane filtration as hybrid process for water reclamation.

- 1. First, optimization of operational variables was carried out on synthetic wastewater which was prepared in the laboratory to model BPOME with COD, nitrogen and phosphorus ratio adapted from Nopens et al. (2001). This approach of employing synthetic POME preparation for this research led to a more solid characterization, reliability and repeatability of results for optimization of operational variables compared to BPOME as their values vary from time to time due to natural degradation and irregular effluent discharge.
- 2. Then, the optimized parameters were verified with EC-membrane hybrid process on actual BPOME. The BPOME was stored at 4° C to prevent biodegradation.
- 3. This research concentrated on modification of initial pH (3-8), EC time (15-60 min) and current density $(40-160 \text{ mA/cm}^2$ i.e. 0.44-1.75 in terms of applied current) for optimization using Al electrodes, following the experimental runs designed via Design Expert software version 13.0.